

## Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date: 9/9/2024 Ald. Brostoff Staff reviewer: Andrew Stern CCF # 240598

Property 2107 E. Kenilworth Pl. North Point South Historic District

Owner/Applicant Redentor and Gloria Galang

2107 E. Kenilworth Pl. Milwaukee, WI 53202

## **Proposal**

Install a 4' steel fence around the E. Kenilworth and N. Summit yards of the property. The fence would have 53" brick piers with 2.5" concrete caps, a 16" brick base with 3" concrete cap, and 29" steel fence above. Both entries of the semicircular driveway along E. Kenilworth and the driveway along N. Summit would be enclosed with a manual sliding metal gates.

Install a 15" metal railing along the top of the second story porch to match the design of the proposed fence.

Wood fences shown in the back and side yards were previously approved by staff.

## Staff comments

Fences located in street-facing yards has traditionally been a sensitive issue in the North Point North and North Point South Historic Districts. Street facing yards have traditionally been open green lawns free of fences or hedges.

The guidelines for streetscapes in North Point South state:

The streetscapes in North Point South are visually cohesive because of the intact building stock and the retention of period street and landscaping features. There are few non-contributing buildings or visually prominent inappropriate additions to historic structures. The traditional landscape treatment of the building lots and the period streetlights contribute to the maintenance of the district's traditional residential character.

Use traditional landscaping, fencing, signage and street lighting that is compatible with the character and period of the district. Avoid introducing landscape features, fencing, street lighting or signage that are inappropriate to the character of the district.

In a staff report for a fence proposal in North Point South in 2015, Carlen Hatala noted that there have been exceptions in the district, with both fences constructed before the historic district and fences allowed as exceptions by HPC. The inventory is as follows:

Fences constructed prior to the historic district:
Villa Terrace 2220 North Terrace Avenue built in 1924
Sawyer-Vogel House at 2221 North Terrace Avenue built in 1905
Slocum House 2675 N. Terrace Avenue built in 1931

Fences allowed as exceptions by HPC:

Anna and Gustav J.A. Trostel House (antique-style fence approved in 1983)

Hathaway-Brumder House at 2105 East Lafayette Place built 1887 (a salvaged 19th century fence was installed)
Albert F. Gallun House at 2014 East Lafayette Place built 1897 (a wall with short fencing was installed across the front of the house)

Jackson Bloodgood Kemper House at 2006 East Lafayette Place built 1895, (approved by the HPC but never installed)

Fences approved since 2015:

William T. Gill House at 2104 E Lafayette PI (owners have no back yard)

2961 N. Lake Dr. (small portion of wood privacy fence installed to connect to existing 3' metal picket fence) William Wehr House at 2134 N. Terrace Ave. (owners have no back yard and wanted a secured yard for children) 2205 N Lake Drive. Substantial fencing was permitted, but not of the front yard.

The staff report also noted:

The HPC did not consider approval of the above fences to be a blanket approval for all front yard fences that are proposed in the North Point North and North Point South Historic Districts. The factors to consider included:

- Was there an existing fence on the property
- Were there fences on the adjacent properties
- Was this a corner location
- Was there a special need by the owner that required the fencing
- Was the design of the fence appropriate to the house and district
- Could the fence height be 3 feet instead of 4 feet
- Could landscape design (hedge/shrubs) serve as a suitable substitute

In this case, the house sits on a prominent corner lot with 100' of frontage along Kenilworth and 115' of frontage along Summit. The house has a spacious rear yard that is presently enclosed with wood fences. The proposed fence design is appropriate to the character of the neighborhood but without evidence to support the need for a fence to enclose the front and street-side yard, staff reluctantly recommends denial of the fence. If HPC approves the fence, staff recommends the fence and gate be limited to 3' in height, with the piers not to exceed 4' in height, and that it be limited to the side street yard.

The proposed 15" metal railing along the top of the second floor porch is designed to mimic the proposed fence. There is no evidence that a metal rail previously existed on the upper porch. Staff recommends denial of the metal railing.

**Recommendation** Recommend HPC Denial

**Conditions** 

**Previous HPC action** 

**Previous Council action**