



Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date: 11/5/2018
Ald. Milele Coggs District: 6
Staff reviewer: Tim Askin
PTS #114622 CCF #180822

Property	2018 N. 1ST ST.	
Owner/Applicant	BRIAN HOLOUBEK NATALIE STREPPONE-HOLOUBEK 2018 N 1ST ST MILWAUKEE WI 53212	Brian Holoubek 2019 N Palmer Street Milwaukee, WI 53212 Phone: (414) 721-6682
Proposal	Construct a 22'x40' garage at rear of lot. It will be a 4-car garage in a double tandem configuration in line with the house.	
Staff comments	<p>The house at this property is an 1890 Queen Anne built of Cream City brick. It is 2-1/2 stories and measures 20'6" by 56'4". The garage design is carefully executed in a complementary Queen Anne style and fitting to the district. With modifications to materials and slight changes to comply with zoning, the project should be approved.</p> <p>Materials are proposed as Smartside siding clapboards with varying shingle imbrication on the second floor, vinyl windows, and composition roof. Door materials are not specified. SmartSide has been consistently denied by the Commission, this includes three cases just this year in the Brewers Hill District.</p> <p>Siding is proposed as LP Smartside with a 4" reveal. It is an engineered wood product of chips, glues, and resins first introduced in 1990 and reformulated under the current name in 1997 after a class action lawsuit regarding longevity of the earlier product (InnerSeal). The product is maintenance heavy and difficult to install correctly due to the requirement that no portion of the wood material is rated for environmental exposure. All nail holes and cut edges must be caulked and painted to prevent rot and water damage. Installation must be done very carefully. Staff opposes the use of this material.</p> <p>Vinyl windows have never been approved by the Commission.</p> <p>Specific doors should be submitted to staff for approval. Service doors must have a wood veneer. Overhead doors would be preferable with a wood veneer, but other materials may be acceptable. Stamped metal overhead doors would not do justice to the overall design.</p> <p>In an initial discussion with a plan examiner, two zoning issues will affect the proposed design and placement. The sidewalls exceed the 10' limit (measured from grade to end of rafter tail) and the existing eaves project too far into the setback. With or without design changes, a move of the garage at least one foot to the south is necessary. The sidewall issue can be addressed with a combination of extending the rafter tails and shortening the first floor.</p>	
Recommendation	Recommend HPC Approval	

Conditions

1. Siding shall be wood or cement board. All trim shall be wood. All cladding shall be smooth-faced. Shingles will be used rather than shakes.
2. Windows shall be all wood both inside and out. No vinyl, vinyl-clad, aluminum, aluminum-clad or fiberglass windows are permitted.
3. Box vents on the roof must be located on a rear slope of the roof where they will not be visible from the street and the vents must be painted to blend with the color of the roofing shingles. If a continuous ridge vent is installed it must extend the entire length of the ridge and must not stop short of the end.
4. Submit specific doors and light fixtures for staff approval.
5. Submit revised site plan and drawings that make the design zoning code compliant. See MCO 295-505-3-f.

Previous HPC action

SmartSide Denials in Brewers Hill 2018
March 171821 & 171822
October 181807.

Previous Council action