



Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date: 9/12/2022

Ald. District: 3

Staff reviewer: Tim Askin

CCF #220587

Property	2205 N. LAKE DR.	North Point South HD
Owner/ Applicant	ERIC WAGNER 2205 N LAKE DR MILWAUKEE WI 53202	TKWA

Proposal An historic, but non-original, brick-walled porch is proposed for in-kind replacement in substantial part, but with enlargement along the south elevation. Applicants wish to add soffit lighting, downloading under reconstructed stone wall cap, and two Solatubes within the existing flat porch roof. Existing porch columns will be relocated to be paired at the corners to create better circulation and to match the configuration of columns of the Lake Drive porch. A canopy is requested to extend over the newly expanded seating area of the porch.

Staff comments The brickwork of the wall around the porch is showing significant deterioration. There is significant joint failure and delamination of the brick.

This is one of our most-changed, but still historic homes within the North Point South neighborhood. Records of early changes are unfortunately spotty, given that the city rarely retained copies of original or remodel house plans prior to the 1960s. Photographs of the particular home are also surprisingly limited despite its location on a Lake Drive corner. Fire insurance maps are not particularly useful, but do indicate the present south porch from the wall recess westward may be older than 1894. There are logical inconsistencies between the 1894 and 1910 maps. Another porch once existed on the rear/west porch.

The present south porch was substantially reconstructed from the brick upwards in 1988, creating the present appearance. The project as proposed generally restores the porch to what is best estimated at a c. 1950 appearance, as it is unclear when the porch first wrapped around the southeast corner and unclear the exact placement of the columns on the south porch.

The new porch structure will be of brick veneer rather than structural brick. Given the running bond in the existing existing wall, the existing porch is likely also a veneer. Three brick samples have been offered to staff. None have proven acceptable. No sample has yet been an adequate match of color and texture. One sample is an acceptable textural match and may be viable for color with staining.

The size of the porch extension is 12'8" x 22'4" including the proposed bowed front, a size of approximately 275sf. While the bow is unusual on such a rectilinear house, it was agreed that it significantly softens the appearance of the extension as opposed to a square version. Further, it differentiates from the historic construction and seems compatible with the many tight corners of the facade. The Lake Drive elevation will be reconstructed to match its apparent 1910 state. The majority of the project is an acceptable, accurate reconstruction. The specific plan to expand the porch toward Kenilworth is not within the porch section of the guidelines.

The porch addition must therefore be reviewed as an addition and a streetscape alteration. It does appear to "harmonize", however, it is highly visible to the public and on a principal elevation. Landscaping is being considered to help disguise the addition, but is not part of this proposal. The addition guidelines are not fully met, but reasonable efforts have been made by the architectural team. Streetscape guidelines can help address the addition issue. The streetscape guidelines are closer to being met, but information is lacking. The criteria of materials and height for the streetscape are met. Scale and landscaping are less clear. Land The Commission may consider holding the expansion project for more landscape information or request that applicants work with staff on a landscape plan that visually reduces the scale of the addition. The canopy mount is likely to interfere visually with the entablature of the porch roof. Further information is needed.

Recommendation Recommend HPC Approval with conditions

Conditions

1. Work with staff on replacement brick selection
2. Use flat-top solatubes or demonstrate that bubble tops will have no visibility from the sidewalk at any point on Kenilworth.
3. HOLD OR DENY canopy. Insufficient detail is supplied to determine its manner of attachment and how it will visually affect the entablature of the porch roof. Umbrellas may be a better approach and not subject to our regulation.

Previous HPC action

Previous Council action

Guidelines

4. Porches, Trim and Ornamentation

a. Retain porches and steps visible from the public right-of-way that are historically and architecturally appropriate to the building. Avoid altering porches and steps by enclosing open porches or replacing wooden steps with cast concrete steps or by removing original architectural features, such as handrails, balusters, columns or brackets.

5. Additions

Make additions that harmonize with the existing building architecturally and are located so as not visible from the public right-of-way, if at all possible. Avoid making additions that are unsympathetic to the original structure and visually intrude upon the principal elevations.

B Guidelines for Streetscapes

The streetscapes in North Point South are visually cohesive because of the intact building stock and the retention of period street and landscaping features. There are few non-contributing buildings or visually prominent inappropriate additions to historic structures. The traditional landscape treatment of the building lots and the period streetlights contribute to the maintenance of the district's traditional residential character.

1. Maintain the height, scale, mass and materials established by the buildings in the district and the traditional setback and density of the block faces. Avoid introducing elements that are incompatible in terms of siting, materials, height or scale.