



Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date: 9/9/2019
Ald. Nik Kovac District: 3
Staff reviewer: Tim Askin
PTS #114833 CCF #190692

Property 2245 N. LAKE DR.

Owner/Applicant Nicole Kauss and Christopher Kolenda Classic Builders
2245 N Lake Drive
Milwaukee, WI 53202

Proposal The proposed garage will be sited at the rear of the property in the northwest corner of the lot. It is a two-car detached structure with a hip roof. The proposed shingles are dimensional and pewter in color. The gutters will be a dark brown. The front (east) elevation features an overhead door is steel with a mahogany wood finish and windows. The right (south) elevation features a wood double hung window and a fiberglass service door. The trim, water table, and fascia around the structure are proposed as pine. LP stucco panels are proposed for siding and seams will be covered with 6" cedar.

Staff comments Per the guidelines for new construction in the North Point South Historic District, the proposed garage meets standards for siting, scale, and form. The relationship between the location of the proposed garage and the existing home is reflective of other properties in the district – the garage is situated at the rear of the property. It will be partially visible from the street as some of the existing garages in the district are already. The scale of the proposed garage is appropriate relative to the existing home and the scale of other existing garages in the district. The proposed garage features a hip roof and its form is compatible with the roof profile and massing of the existing home.

On the front elevation, the proposed overhead door is steel with a wood finish and windows. The design and material of the door is found appropriate as the garage is deeply setback. The trim, water table, and fascia around the structure will be finished with pine and are appropriately scaled. The proposed cladding, LP Stucco Panels is part of the Smartside product line that has been repeatedly rejected by this body. Nothing from the Smartside line has ever been approved due to concerns about both appearance and durability. This is due to the undesirable seams produced between sections of paneling and the inability for the paneling to replicate the texture and appearance of true stucco. Even though the design includes 6" cedar boards concealing the seams of the paneling, staff finds the use of LP Stucco Panels to be inappropriate based on numerous precedents. Historically, half-timbering is usually flush with the face of the stucco rather than surface-mounted.

LP Smartside stucco panels are proposed. It is an engineered wood product of chips, glues, and resins first introduced in 1990 and reformulated under the current name in 1997 after a class action lawsuit regarding longevity of the earlier product (InnerSeal). The product is maintenance heavy and difficult to install correctly due to the requirement that no portion of the wood material is rated for environmental exposure. All nail holes and cut edges must be caulked and painted to prevent rot and water damage. Installation must be done very carefully. Staff opposes the use of this material.

The Commission has a strong history of requiring wood siding when a garage has significant visibility. While this garage is not directly on the street, it will be highly visible through the yard from the public sidewalk.

The rear (west) and right (north) elevations are unarticulated by fenestration. The front (east) and left (south) elevations feature the overhead door, the service door, and a single double hung wood window. Although the west and south elevations lack fenestration, staff finds this acceptable as they are not visible to the public right-of-way.

Recommendation

Recommend HPC Approval of the design with conditions
Recommend HPC Denial of the material

Conditions

1. If true stucco were utilized instead of LP Stucco Panels, the proposed garage could be approved.
2. 2. Half-timbering may be considered for surface mounting if it is fully secured with no visible gaps between it and the face of the stucco (as in the manufacturer's sample photo)
3. All finish wood must be smooth and free of knots and must be painted or treated with an opaque stain upon completion.

Previous HPC action

Previous Council action