**TEARMAN SPENCER**City Attorney

ODALO J. OHIKU ROBIN A. PEDERSON S. TODD FARRIS JENNIFER L. WILLIAMS Deputy City Attorneys



Milwaukee City Hall Suite 800 • 200 East Wells Street • Milwaukee, Wisconsin 53202-3551 Telephone: 414.286.2601 • TDD: 414.286.2025 • Fax: 414.286.8550

December 19, 2023

To the Honorable Common Council Of the City of Milwaukee Room 205 – City Hall

RE: Communications from Carmen, Jonathan, and Javier Pinales C.I. File No(s): 1068-2023-1289, 1068-2023-1290, 1068-2023-1291

Dear Sir or Madam:

The Pinales Family have submitted claim(s) regarding damages sustained to three motor vehicles within their household, when a city tree branch fell on July 13, 2023, at or near 2624 N. Booth Street. Damages include the following; 2004 Toyota Solara \$7,988.95, 2016 Toyota Camry \$7,744.26, 2009 Chevrolet Avalanche \$3,182.85.

Our investigation revealed that on July 14, 2023, a Forestry crew responded to a call regarding a branch down and found a branch on three vehicles that blocked the street located at 2632 - 2629 N. Booth Street. The tree branch was removed. Forestry reported the subject tree was a 40" green ash tree that was alive and in good health. The branch that failed was alive with no indication of decay at the point of failure.

Further investigation revealed that on July 13, 2023 and July 14, 2023, the Forestry Section received 54 calls for broken branches and other tree related issues. The city of Milwaukee experienced sustained winds of 20 MPH, and gusts up to 29 MPH as recorded at General Mitchell Airport by NOAA.

Prior maintenance records indicated there was a tree inspection in July of 2015, and a branch down in July of 2017. Pruning of trees in this area was completed in January of 2020.

**HEIDI WICK SPOERL** KATHRYN Z. BLOCK THOMAS D. MILLER PETER J. BLOCK PATRICK J. MCCLAIN HANNAH R. JAHN **JULIE P. WILSON MEIGHAN M. ANGER ALEXANDER R. CARSON ALEXANDER T. MUELLER** ALEXANDER D. COSSI **LISA A. GILMORE** KATHERINE A. HEADLEY L. ANTHONY JACKSON STACY J. MILLER MICHAEL C. RADAVICH JORDAN M. SCHETTLE THERESA A. MONTAG **ALEXANDER E. FOUNDOS** TRAVIS J. GRESHAM **KYLE W. BAILEY JOSEPH M. DOBBS WILLIAM K. HOTCHKISS CLINT B. MUCHE JOANNA FRACZEK** Assistant City Attorneys



To the Honorable Common Council December 19, 2023 Page Two

It is our position that the City is not liable for damages and we recommend that the claims be denied.

Very truly yours,

TEARMAN SPENCER

City Attorney

ENNIFER L. WILLIAMS

Deputy City Attorney

TS/JLW/MG/cdr

Enclosure

1068-2023-1289/288933