



Department of Employee Relations

**Tom Barrett**  
Mayor

**Maria Monteagudo**  
Director

**Michael Brady**  
Employee Benefits Director

**Deborah Ford**  
Labor Negotiator

September 17, 2013

To the Honorable  
The Committee on Finance and Personnel  
Common Council  
City of Milwaukee

Dear Committee Members:

Re: Common Council File Number 130432

The following classification and pay levels will be considered for approval by the Board of Fire and Police Commissioners on **September 19, 2013**. We recommend these changes subject to approval by the Board of Fire and Police Commissioners.

In the Fire Department, the pay range structure for the Battalion Chief, Fire and Deputy Chief, Fire are recommended for reclassification.

In the Police Department, six positions of Heating and Ventilating Mechanic II, PR 7DN are recommended for reclassification to Maintenance Technician II, PR 3GN. The underfill title Heating and Ventilating Mechanic I, PR 7CN is recommended for reclassification to Maintenance Technician I, PR 3FN.

The job evaluation reports and letters covering the above positions, including the necessary Salary and Positions Ordinance amendments, are attached.

Sincerely,

Maria Monteagudo  
Employee Relations Director

MM:fcw

Attachment: 2 Job Evaluation Reports  
Fiscal Note

C: Mark Nicolini, Jennifer Meyer, James Carroll, Bryan Rynders, Deborah Ford, Nicole Fleck, Michael Tobin, Assistant Fire Chief Gerard Washington, Chief of Police Edward Flynn, Chief of Staff Joel Plant, Richard Moore, Jeffrey Lueck, Valarie Williams, Pamela Roberts, Ronnette Nelson, Leonard Moye, Roger Davidson and Juliet Battle





Department of Employee Relations

**Tom Barrett**  
Mayor

**Maria Monteagudo**  
Director

**Michael Brady**  
Employee Benefits Director

**Deborah Ford**  
Labor Negotiator

March 18, 2013  
(Revised Sept 12, 2013)\*

To the Honorable  
Fire and Police Commission  
City of Milwaukee  
Milwaukee, Wisconsin

Dear Commissioners:

This report recommends changes to the pay range structure for the classifications of Battalion Chief, Fire and Deputy Chief, Fire in the Milwaukee Fire Department as shown below.

Current	Proposed
Battalion Chief, Fire PR 4MX (\$83,923.58 - \$92,088.88)	Battalion Chief, Fire PR 4MX (\$87,682.14 - \$95,248.66) Implementation Rates of Pay: (\$87,682.14, \$88,997.22, \$91,550.16, \$93,381.08, \$95,248.66)
Deputy Chief, Fire PR 4OX (\$94,309.80 - \$104,622.96)	Deputy Chief, Fire PR 4OX (\$96,195.84 - \$105,138.28)

The realignment of pay ranges and the establishment of higher pay range maximums will assist in addressing some of the pay compression problems that impact the Chief's ability to attract applicants for these critical leadership positions within the Fire Department. This report also recommends adding a recruitment footnote to the classification of Assistant Fire Chief consistent with the one available for Assistant Chiefs in the Police Department.

**Background**

In 2012 Chief Mark Rohlfing requested a classification and compensation study of the Battalion Chief, Fire and Deputy Chief, Fire classifications in the Fire Department. The purpose of the study was to determine if the pay structure for the classifications was adequate in attracting and retaining qualified candidates given the impact of a wage freeze for members of the sworn management ranks since 2009 in relation to wage increases negotiated for members of Local 215 in 2009, 2011, and 2012. The study was also needed to determine if the pay differential between the rank of Captain and Battalion Chief was adequate given the significant increase in responsibility associated with the Battalion Chief rank.

**Organizational and Compensation Structure**

The Milwaukee Fire Department has a total of three positions of Assistant Fire Chief responsible for overseeing all staff and operations of each bureau as summarized in the following table.



<b>Milwaukee Fire Department</b>		
<b>Support Bureau</b>	<b>Operations Bureau</b>	<b>EMS/Training/Education Bureau</b>
<i>Budget and Management                      Technical Services                      Administration                      Construction &amp; Maintenance</i>	<i>Firefighting Division                      Special Operations:                      Marine/HURT/HAZMAT                      Fire Investigation Unit</i>	<i>EMS Division                      Health and Safety                      Training                      Community Relations</i>
<b>Staffing</b>	<b>Staffing</b>	<b>Staffing</b>
<i>1 Assistant Chief                      1 Battalion Chiefs</i>	<i>1 Assistant Chief                      3 Deputy Chiefs                      16 Battalion Chiefs</i>	<i>1 Assistant Chief                      2 Battalion Chiefs</i>

Although assigned to specific responsibilities within each Bureau, Assistant Chiefs are on a rotation schedule every third day and are responsible for responding to second or greater alarm fires and significant emergency scenes. They act as Incident Commanders with full and direct authority over all personnel responding to the emergency.

Deputy Chiefs are part of the Operations Bureau and staff each shift within the Firefighting Division. Their primary duty is to oversee the day-to-day operations, including overtime hiring, of the Firefighting Division. This Division includes all sworn field-assigned personnel in five battalions. Deputy Chiefs serve in a high level leadership capacity with responsibility for identifying operational efficiencies, developing and implementing operational policies for the suppression forces, and developing and adhering to sound fiscal management practices.

Battalion Chiefs command and assume responsibility of all responding Fire Department forces operating at the scene of emergencies until relieved by a superior ranking officer. Their duties include management of battalion staffing, maintenance of discipline, establishment and monitoring of battalion and department policies, coordination of training sessions, and the maintenance of high standards of performance for personnel, equipment, and quarters.

The classification and pay ranges associated with the command staff within the Fire Department are presented below:

Title	Pay Range	Minimum	Maximum
Fire Chief	4SX	\$109,592.92	\$153,426.45
Assistant Fire Chief	4RX	\$96,455.84	\$135,044.78
Deputy Chief, Fire	4OX	\$94,309.80	\$104,622.96
Battalion Chief, Fire	4MX	\$83,923.58	\$92,088.88
Fire Captain (Local 215)	4J- Pay Range 857	\$79,538.68	\$85,901.92 (2012 Rates)

The Fire Chief, Assistant Fire Chief, Deputy Chief, Fire, and Battalion Chief, Fire classifications are sworn management positions within the Milwaukee Fire Department. Since they are not members of the Milwaukee Professional Firefighters Association, Local 215, they are not subject to the same terms and employment conditions as the employees they supervise. Through collective bargaining Local 215 members received wage increases in 2009 (\$359 added to base pay + 3%), in 2011 (\$325 added to base pay), and in 2012 (2.95% in Pay Period 1 and 1.35% in Pay Period 14).

Up until 2009, the City strived to maintain wage parity between Local 215 and the sworn management personnel. Appropriate pay differentials based on nature of work and level of responsibility associated with each rank was important since most protective service organizations strive to develop internal talent and promote from within, instead of bringing high ranking individuals from the outside with limited knowledge and experience in the organization.

Since 2009 sworn management positions in the Fire Department have been subject to wage freezes along with most general city employees. This has created a pay compression problem that limits the pool of qualified candidates to be considered for promotion. Fire Captains have little to no incentive to consider a promotion to Battalion Chief. At the maximum of the pay range, Fire Captains earn an annual salary (excluding overtime) of \$85,197. Approximately 70% of the Fire Captains are currently at the top of their pay range. Under current provisions of the Salary Ordinance, a promotion to Battalion Chief results in a 5% salary increase to \$90,197, or 2% below the pay range maximum of \$92,088.88. Given the significant difference in scope of responsibility between the rank of Fire Captain and Battalion Chief it is necessary to assess whether this differential is enough to motivate Captains to want to advance to positions of leadership within the organization. Data from the last two promotional processes suggest that it is not as only eight Captains applied in 2011 and five in 2012.

In addition to the internal pay comparisons and the review of the pay compression problem, salary market data was gathered from other local jurisdictions within the state. This was important in assessing the Fire Department's ability to recruit external candidates for positions of leadership from other jurisdictions. The survey results are summarized below.

<b>Battalion Chief (2012 Data)</b>	
<b>Jurisdiction</b>	<b>Max Rate of Pay</b>
Oak Creek	\$84,539
Racine	\$85,000
Milwaukee County	\$85,767
Waukesha	\$87,800
Appleton	\$88,150
North Shore	\$89,322
West Allis	\$89,332
<b>Milwaukee</b>	<b>\$90,728</b>
Greenfield	\$90,908
Madison	\$99,008
Average	\$88,870

Given the size of Milwaukee's Fire Department, the population of a large urban area, and the characteristics of the city's infrastructure, Milwaukee's maximum rate should be the highest of the jurisdictions surveyed. Milwaukee's salary is higher than most jurisdictions by an insignificant amount. Therefore we can conclude that attempting to recruit experienced Battalion Chiefs from other jurisdictions would be difficult. It is also important to note that Milwaukee's salary falls short when compared to Greenfield and Madison.

### **Pay Range Restructuring**

In order to address the pay compression problems within the Fire Department and to bring the compensation level to an appropriate level, a new pay range for Battalion Chiefs is recommended.



Current	Proposed
Battalion Chief, Fire PR 4MX (\$83,923.58 - \$92,088.88)	Battalion Chief, Fire PR 4MX (\$87,682.14 - \$95,248.66) Implementation Rates of Pay: (\$87,682.14, \$88,997.22, \$91,550.16, \$93,381.08, \$95,248.66)

For the purpose of implementation, employee's rates of pay will be determined by the Department of Employee Relations.

Battalion Chiefs promoted into the position after the implementation of the new pay range will be placed in the new structure at a rate that is at least 5% higher than the rate prior to the promotion or the minimum of the Battalion Chief pay range, whichever is greater.

The new pay range maximum for Battalion Chiefs provides a more reasonable pay differential between the ranks of Fire Captain and Battalion Chief as demonstrated below.

Title	Pay Range	Minimum	Maximum
<b>New</b> Battalion Chief, Fire	4MX	\$87,682.14	\$95,248.66
Fire Captain ( <i>Local 215</i> )	4J- Pay Range 857	\$79,538.68	\$85,901.92

In order to preserve appropriate pay differentials between the recommended pay range for Battalion Chiefs and the Deputy Chief levels, this report also recommends a new pay range for Deputy Chief, Fire as presented below.

Current	Proposed
Deputy Chief, Fire PR 4OX (\$94,309.80 - \$104,622.96)	Deputy Chief, Fire PR 4OX (\$96,195.84 - \$105,138.28)

The recommended pay range provides a more appropriate differential within the sworn management structure. With the implementation of these recommendations, current Deputy Chiefs will be placed at the minimum of the recommended pay range. Newly appointed Deputy Chiefs will be eligible to receive a 5% increase after promotion consistent with provisions in the Salary Ordinance.

While no change is recommended for the pay range for Assistant Fire Chief, a footnote similar to that available for Assistant Chief of Police is recommended. This footnote allows recruitment to be at any rate within the pay range with the approval of the Employee Relations Director and the Chair of the Finance and Personnel Committee.

The implementation of the recommended pay ranges will create a more equitable structure within the Fire Department. If the recommendation is approved by the Common Council, we are recommending amending Chapter 350 of the Milwaukee Code of Ordinances (via a separate CC file) to eliminate the recall allowance benefit (\$850) per member and eliminate the CPR allowance (\$250) per member that the impacted individuals currently receive.

The necessary changes to the Salary Ordinance are presented below:

Under Pay Range 4MX, delete the current rates and add the following rates:

Hourly	42.15	45.79
<b>Biweekly</b>	3,372.39	3,663.41
Annual	87,682.14	95,248.66

Also amend footnote 1/ and add footnote 3/.

- 1) Recruitment is at \$3,372.39 (\$87,682.14).
- 3) For the purposes of implementation, employee's rates of pay will be determined by the Department of Employee Relations. The rates of pay: \$3,372.39, \$3,422.97, \$3,521.16, \$3,591.58, \$3,663.41.

Under Pay Range 4OX, delete the current rates and add the following rates:

---

Hourly	46.25	50.55
<b>Biweekly</b>	3,699.84	4,043.78
Annual	96,195.84	105,138.28

Also, delete footnote "1" in its entirety.

Under Pay Range 4RX, add footnote designation (1) to the title of "Assistant Fire Chief."

Respectfully Submitted,  
  
Maria Monteagudo  
Employee Relations Director

C: Mark Rohlfing



**JOB EVALUATION REPORT**

Fire and Police Commission Meeting Date: September 19, 2013

**POLICE DEPARTMENT**

<b>Current</b>	<b>Request</b>	<b>Recommendation</b>
Heating and Ventilating Mechanic II PR 7DN (\$41,287 - \$46,106) (Six Positions)	Maintenance Technician II PR 3GN (\$42,114 - \$47,771) (Six Positions)	Maintenance Technician II PR 3GN (\$42,114 - \$47,771) (Six Positions)
Underfill Title of: Heating and Ventilating Mechanic I PR 7CN (\$40,237 - \$44,941)	Underfill Title of: Maintenance Technician I PR 3FN (\$41,287 - \$46,704)	Underfill Title of: Maintenance Technician I PR 3FN (\$41,287 - \$46,704)

City of Milwaukee Resident Rates of Pay

**Action Required**

In the Positions Ordinance, under Police Department, Administration Services Decision Unit, Administration Bureau, Facilities Services Section, delete six positions of "Heating and Ventilating Mechanic II" and add six positions of "Maintenance Technician II".

In the Salary Ordinance, under Pay Range 3FN, add the footnote designation "(5)" to the title "Maintenance Technician I" with the footnote to read as follows: "(5) Positions in the Police Department will receive an additional one dollar (\$1.00) per hour for all time worked in excess of eight (8) hours in one 24 hour day plowing snow or salting."

Under Pay Range 3GN, add the footnote designations "(10)" and "(11)" to the title "Maintenance Technician II" with the footnotes to read as follows: "(10) The premium rate received by employees when assigned to supervisory duties for a full shift in the Police Department shall be one dollar (\$1.00) per hour." and "(11) Positions in the Police Department will receive an additional one dollar (\$1.00) per hour for all time worked in excess of eight (8) hours in one 24 hour day plowing snow or salting." Under Pay Range 7DN, delete footnotes "(4), (5), and (6)."

**Background**

The Fire and Police Commission forwarded a letter from the Milwaukee Police Department (MPD) regarding a request to reclassify six positions of Heating and Ventilating Mechanic II in Pay Range 7DN to Maintenance Technician II in Pay Range 3GN. A job audit was conducted with one of the incumbents, Mark Roeder, and his supervisor, Jeffrey Lueck, Building Maintenance Supervisor II; job descriptions were reviewed; and discussions were held with Richard Moore, Police Facilities Manager; Valarie Williams, Human Resources Administrator; and Ronnette Nelson, Human Resources Analyst - Senior. Discussions were also held with Leonard Moye, Operations and Maintenance Manager; and Roger Davidson, Maintenance Technician III; of the Department of Public Works.

## **Duties and Responsibilities**

The basic function of these positions is to repair, replace, adjust, maintain, and clean all equipment related to facilities for the MPD. Work includes repairs, programming, and operation of heating, ventilating, and air conditioning (HVAC) refrigeration systems, digital controls, and fire-life safety systems for high rise Class A commercial buildings and other facilities. Duties and responsibilities include the following:

- 40% Repair, replace, maintain, operate and clean HVAC refrigeration equipment, including control components, building refrigeration, boilers, fire-life-safety and security systems; and may, at times, install related electric motors, starters, wiring fuses, and protective devices and controls.
- 20% Maintain, repair, or replace electrical and mechanical equipment such as booster pumps, drinking fountains, wash basins, electric and electronic components, electric motors and pneumatic/solid state control circuits, filtration equipment and controls for steam and hot water heating systems; and use a laptop computer and other telecommunications devices to test equipment from home or remote area.
- 10% Maintain, repair, or replace components in plumbing systems such as pumps, valves, and piping.
- 10% Provide general repair and maintenance of mechanical, electrical, pneumatic, hydraulic, electrical, electronic controls, lighting elements, and elevators; and braise and solder components as required to keep all facility systems working well.
- 10% Assist with the development of a preventative maintenance program and work with the program; attend assigned training sessions, labs, and in-house coursework to stay current with the job.
- 5% Perform other related duties.
- 5% Fill in, as necessary, for Building Maintenance Supervisor II.

Requirements for this position include a minimum of five years of experience in maintenance and repair of HVAC/refrigeration equipment, and other mechanical, electrical and electronic building systems with at least two of the years with a large high rise commercial Class A office building; and a Chlorofluorocarbon (CFC) Certification. An Associate's Degree or Technical Certificate in a related area; and a Boiler Operator's license or a higher classification stationary Engineer's license are desirable.

## **Analysis**

Comparisons were made to several other positions in the City including the following classifications.



Title	Pay Range	Rates of Pay
Building Maintenance Mechanic I	7BN	(\$37,970 - \$42,418)
Building Maintenance Mechanic II	7CN	(\$40,237 - \$44,941)
Heating and Ventilating Mechanic I	7CN	(\$40,237 - \$44,941)
Heating and Ventilating Mechanic II	7DN	(\$41,287 - \$46,106)
Heating and Ventilating Mechanic III	7FN	(\$42,971 - \$47,923)
Maintenance Technician I	3FN	(\$41,287 - \$46,704)
Maintenance Technician II	3GN	(\$42,114 - \$47,771)
Maintenance Technician III	3HN	(\$44,019 - \$50,147)

The positions under study are most similar to the position of Maintenance Technician II in Pay Range 3GN. The Maintenance Technician II positions are located in the Infrastructure Division of the Department of Public Works (DPW) and were previously classified as Heating and Ventilating Mechanics II. In 2001 the positions in DPW were reclassified to Maintenance Technician II in Pay Range 258. This was due to the need for more technical knowledge as the City was changing from pneumatic to digital controls; and to distinguish these positions from other Heating and Ventilating Mechanic positions in the City. It was noted that this group of employees in DPW had received extensive training to work with the new digital controls being installed in City Hall.

The positions under study, located in the Police Department, were studied in 2003 as part of a Labor Agreement. It was determined that the positions had some changes in their work but not enough to justify a reclassification and no change was recommended. A review of the positions under study now indicates that there has been more change. They are working more with automated and digital systems and their work is more similar to that of the Maintenance Technician II. The 2013 budget included \$90,000 to update the building automation systems at the district stations and the City has a nine-year plan to completely renovate and improve the Police Administration Building.

It is recommended that these six positions be reclassified to Maintenance Technician II in Pay Range 3GN with the underfill title of Maintenance Technician I in Pay Range 3FN. These positions have several footnotes. It is recommended that two of the footnotes be attached to their new title due to work processes within the Police Department. These two footnotes would allow these positions in the Police Department to continue to receive an additional \$1.00 per hour for when they work in excess of eight hours in one 24 hour day plowing snow or salting; or for when an employee in the Maintenance Technician II classification is assigned to supervisory duties for a full shift.

This report covers only the six positions of Heating and Ventilating Mechanic II in the Police Department. It is anticipated, however, that a classification and pay redesign for the classifications of Maintenance Technician I, II, and III in both the Police Department and DPW will be created and recommended for approval at a future time. Similar to the classification and pay redesign report regarding the mechanic positions in Fleet Services, the recommendation would include movement through pay ranges based on knowledge, skill, expertise, and work efficiency and performance.

The Department of Public Works has implemented software that creates and monitors work orders. The Police Department anticipates implementing this software program in 2014. This program will provide information that will be helpful in evaluating employee efficiency and performance as part of a new classification and pay redesign.

### Recommendation

Based on the analysis above we recommend these six positions of Heating and Ventilating Mechanic II in Pay Range 7DN be reclassified to Maintenance Technician II in Pay Range 3GN with the underfill title of Maintenance Technician I in Pay Range 3FN. We further recommend that new footnotes be created in Pay Range 3FN for the title of Maintenance Technician I and in Pay Range 3GN for the title of Maintenance Technician II to allow these six positions in the Police Department to continue to be eligible for an additional \$1.00 per hour when they work in excess of eight hours in one 24 hour day plowing snow or salting. We also recommend that a second footnote be added to Pay Range 3GN for the title of Maintenance Technician II to allow positions in the Police Department to continue to be eligible for an additional \$1.00 per hour when assigned to supervisory duties for a full shift.

---

Prepared by: *Sarah Trotter*  
Sarah Trotter, Human Resources Representative

Reviewed by: *Andrea Knickerbocker*  
Andrea Knickerbocker, Human Resources Manager

Reviewed by: *M. Monteaquedo* AK  
Maria Monteaquedo, Employee Relations Director