



# Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

**HPC meeting date: 9/11/2017**  
**Ald. Milele Coggs District: 6**  
**Staff reviewer: Tim Askin**  
**PTS #114354 CCF #170677**

**Property** 114 E. VINE ST. Brewers Hill Historic District

**Owner/Applicant** JUSTIN M FAGAN Justin Fagan  
114 E VINE ST  
MILWAUKEE WI 53212 Phone: (414) 581-6814

**Proposal** Applicant has installed a new storm door and main door and added new door trim without a Certificate of Appropriateness. This comes to the Commission because of a complaint made directly to DNS.

**Staff comments** This is well-maintained Queen Anne cottage from roughly 1880. It is almost shotgun in form, but is not likely to be so in plan. Despite the modest size, the Queen Anne aesthetic is quite clear with multiple cladding types and varied shingle details.

Although the scope of the complaint was initially the storm door, inspection photos revealed that the main door behind it had also been changed without a COA. Neither door strictly meets the established guidelines within the city's publications or Brewer's Hill district guidelines. Metal storm doors have never been permitted.

The previous front entry was a slab door with no storm door that has been there since at least the 1980s. It is unknown what the original front door was. The newly installed main door is a six-panel door with lights in the two top panels.

Six-panel doors were not common in Milwaukee until well into the Colonial Revival period of architecture in the 1910s. The door is simply too new of a style for the building. Further, the two upper panels are glass, which would make this door a poor fit on any designated house in the city. Another door, still in wood should be required of the homeowner as well as a new storm door. Two neighbors have sent written objections to this proposal. They want the applicant to be required to put in a wood storm door.

The new trim is acceptable on the condition that is painted rather than varnished.

**Recommendation** Recommend HPC Denial

**Conditions** If the storm door is approved, it must be painted to match colors elsewhere on the house and the new surrounding trim should also be required to be painted. The main door should not be approved.

**Previous HPC action**

**Previous Council action**