



# City of Milwaukee

200 E. Wells Street  
Milwaukee, Wisconsin  
53202

## Meeting Minutes

### HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

*Patricia Keating Kahn, CHAIR*

*Rafael Garcia, VICE-CHAIR*

*Ald. Robert Bauman, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, Matt Jarosz,  
Nicholas Hans Robinson and Sally Peltz*

*Staff Assistant, Linda Elmer, 286-2231, Fax: 286-3456,  
lelmer@milwaukee.gov*

*Senior Planner: Carlen Hatala, 286-5722,  
chatal@milwaukee.gov*

*Senior Planner: Tim Askin, 286-5712,  
tim.askin@milwaukee.gov*

*Legislative Liaison, Jeff Osterman, 286-2262,  
joster@milwaukee.gov*

---

Monday, October 10, 2022

3:00 PM

City Hall, Room 301-B

---

**Amended 10/7/22 -- The first communication file was added.**

**Communication from the City Attorney's Office relating to a recent court decision relating to regulation of state buildings.**

*Meeting convened: 3:11 P.M.*

*Alex Carson, Assistant City Attorney, present on this matter. A least half of the appeal is moot. The goal was to protect the property and decide jurisdiction over state-owned property. This does not result in a zoning change, which the judge found to be an important point. If a zoning overlay were created, that would make the city's position stronger. He feels that if the state wants to demolish a building, it will. He will work with the state, if this body wishes, to put our ordinance more in-line with zoning requirements. The Commission supported doing as ACA Carson (dismiss the appeal and work with the Attorney General's office to see about an ordinance change to create zoning overlays).*

*Mr. Garcia moved, seconded by Ms. Peltz, to do as the Assistant City Attorney recommended. There were no objections.*

**Present:** 4 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Keating Kahn, Garcia, Peltz

**Excused:** 3 - Bauman, Jarosz, Robinson

*Roll call taken at 3:34 P.M.*

1. [220382](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for installing a new roof of different material type at 3357 N. Sherman Boulevard, in the Sherman Boulevard Historic District, for Andre Ash.

**Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

*Ms. Hatala provided an e-mail from Mr. Jarosz, who investigated the roof. He concurs*

*that the roof is not repairable. An asphalt roof is \$55,000 vs. \$85,000 for a clay tile roof.*

*Arthur Asha - can't afford \$55,000. He got a different quote in the \$20,000's.*

*Mr. Jarosz recommended getting more than one quote for someone putting on an asphalt roof. Mr. Asha believes Brava meets all specifications for Wisconsin weather and is a lighter material, which is better for the house. He can best afford asphalt. The Commission would like to see one more quote using approved materials by the HPC.*

*Mr. Hans Robinson suggested a synthetic material and look for a subsidy to bridge the finances.*

*Mr. Ashe said the tax credits won't make that much of a difference.*

*Moved for approval of asphalt with the color and product and with the work done by a reputable contractor approved by staff.*

**A motion was made by Nicholas Hans Robinson, seconded by Rafael Garcia, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Robinson, Keating Kahn, Garcia, and Peltz

**No:** 0

**Excused:** 2 - Bauman, and Jarosz

2. [210613](#)

Resolution relating to the Permanent Historic Designation of the William Spence House Number 2 at 2279 N. Summit Avenue in the 3rd Ald. District

**Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

*This item was taken up with item #3.*

*These items were held in committee pending expanding the entire district. The district won't be expanded at this time, so these items are now being scheduled.*

*Both houses are similar in scale and size, but were treated differently over time, with one having an enclosed porch.*

*The owner wishes to demolish both buildings to build an apartment on the site.*

*Atty. Michelle Ebben - 790 N. Water St. - for E. North, LLC*

*Mark Rudnicki - Sun Prairie - present for E. North, LLC*

*Ms. Hatala noted both buildings have severe mold infestation and the floor plan may not be original.*

*Ms. Peltz would like to get a formal letter noting why the organization did not wish to pursue this now.*

*Jonathan Brostoff - apologized he couldn't be present in person.*

**A motion was made by Rafael Garcia, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be PLACED ON FILE. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 4 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Robinson, Keating Kahn, and Peltz

**No:** 1 - Garcia

**Excused:** 2 - Bauman, and Jarosz

3. [210617](#)

Resolution relating to the Permanent Historic Designation of the William Spence House Number 1 at 2275 N. Summit Avenue in the 3rd Ald.

---

District

**Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

*This item was taken up with item #2.*

*These items were held in committee pending expanding the entire district. The district won't be expanded at this time, so these items are now being scheduled.*

*Both houses are similar in scale and size, but were treated differently over time, with one having an enclosed porch.*

*The owner wishes to demolish both buildings to build an apartment on the site.*

*Atty. Michelle Ebben - 790 N. Water St. - for E. North, LLC*

*Mark Rudnicki - Sun Prairie - present for E. North, LLC*

*Ms. Hatala noted both buildings have severe mold infestation and the floor plan may not be original.*

*Ms. Peltz would like to get a formal letter noting why the organization did not wish to pursue this now.*

*Jonathan Brostoff - apologized he couldn't be present in person.*

**A motion was made by Rafael Garcia, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be PLACED ON FILE. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Keating Kahn, Peltz, Garcia, and Robinson

**No:** 0

**Excused:** 2 - Jarosz, and Bauman

4. [220726](#)

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for an internally illuminated Type B wall sign, at 1233 E. Brady Street, in the Brady Street Historic District, for Plantivore dba Twisted Plants.

**Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

*Ms. Hatala said that two types of signs are being proposed - one hanging sign which will be a cut-out metal sign and staff has no objection to that one. The second sign is an illuminated box sign with a plastic face, which staff does not recommend. Staff would like to see individual letters or something cut out, or even neon.*

*Brandon Hawthorne - he wants the signage similar to his business in Cudahy. Another sign would cost \$4,000 more. He first thought the issue was illumination, but it's the box-sign in general. The sign would be white.*

*Mr. Garcia moved, seconded by Ms Pieper Eisenbrown, to approve the bracket sign. There were no objections.*

*Work with staff for approval of the second sign.*

*Mr. Garcia moved, seconded by Ms. Peltz, to deny the box sign. There were no objections.*

**A motion was made by Rafael Garcia, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Keating Kahn, Peltz, Garcia, and Robinson

**No:** 0

**Excused:** 2 - Jarosz, and Bauman

5. [220734](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of the garage at 4431 N 25th Street, in the Garden Homes Historic District for City of Milwaukee.
- Sponsors:** THE CHAIR
- Ms. Hatala said none of these garages were historic and will handle all 6 as one motion. The garages are not in good shape and the city supports their demolition.*
- A motion was made by Sally Peltz, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:**
- Aye:** 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Robinson, Keating Kahn, Garcia, and Peltz
- No:** 0
- Excused:** 2 - Bauman, and Jarosz
6. [220736](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of the garage at 4437-4441 N 25th Street, in the Garden Homes Historic District for City of Milwaukee.
- Sponsors:** THE CHAIR
- Ms. Hatala said none of these garages were historic and will handle all 6 as one motion. The garages are not in good shape and the city supports their demolition.*
- A motion was made by Sally Peltz, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:**
- Aye:** 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Robinson, Keating Kahn, Garcia, and Peltz
- No:** 0
- Excused:** 2 - Bauman, and Jarosz
7. [220737](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of the garage at 4423 N 25th Street, in the Garden Homes Historic District for City of Milwaukee.
- Sponsors:** THE CHAIR
- Ms. Hatala said none of these garages were historic and will handle all 6 as one motion. The garages are not in good shape and the city supports their demolition.*
- A motion was made by Sally Peltz, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:**
- Aye:** 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Keating Kahn, Peltz, Garcia, and Robinson
- No:** 0
- Excused:** 2 - Jarosz, and Bauman
8. [220738](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of the garage at 4366 N 25th Street, in the Garden Homes Historic District for City of Milwaukee.

**Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

*Ms. Hatala said none of these garages were historic and will handle all 6 as one motion. The garages are not in good shape and the city supports their demolition.*

**A motion was made by Sally Peltz, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Keating Kahn, Peltz, Garcia, and Robinson

**No:** 0

**Excused:** 2 - Jarosz, and Bauman

9. [220739](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of the garage at 4407 N 25th Street, in the Garden Homes Historic District for City of Milwaukee.

**Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

*Ms. Hatala said none of these garages were historic and will handle all 6 as one motion. The garages are not in good shape and the city supports their demolition.*

**A motion was made by Sally Peltz, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Keating Kahn, Peltz, Garcia, and Robinson

**No:** 0

**Excused:** 2 - Jarosz, and Bauman

10. [220743](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of the garage at 4447 N. 26th Street, in the Garden Homes Historic District for City of Milwaukee.

**Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

*Ms. Hatala said none of these garages were historic and will handle all 6 as one motion. The garages are not in good shape and the city supports their demolition.*

**A motion was made by Sally Peltz, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Keating Kahn, Peltz, Garcia, and Robinson

**No:** 0

**Excused:** 2 - Jarosz, and Bauman

11. [220753](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for remodeling the former pharmacy building at 1316 West Forest Home Avenue into a primary care clinic, in the Mitchell Street Historic District, for El Rey Properties LLC.

**Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

*Ms. Carlen Hatala said only windows are being changed on the exterior. What was built in the 1990s was reviewed by the Commission. The bank in the corner will stay. She would like more glazing adding and the additional windows will match the existing windows. Windows are being added along Mitchell St., which is currently blank.*

*Renee Kubish - architect*

*Ms. Peltz commended them for how it looks and that Froedert will be in the area. Approve with conditions outlined in the report.*

**A motion was made by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Robinson, Keating Kahn, Garcia, and Peltz

**No:** 0

**Excused:** 2 - Bauman, and Jarosz

12. [220754](#)

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for window replacement on the lower levels at 1015 N. 9th Street, St. Benedict the Moor Roman Catholic Church, an individually designated historic property, for the Province of St. Joseph of the Capuchin Order.

**Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

*Ms. Hatala said the church has been serving the community for many years and the windows in question are on the east side. There is a pair of windows that are being replaced on the east side and on the west side they want to replace the windows so they can remove the security grates on that side which had faced a play area. New windows would be more energy efficient and provide better internal visibility. The windows will be single-hung rather than the current double-hung and will be operable, which the current windows are not.*

*The Commission rarely approves clad windows, but there have been selective cases where they have been. This is an institutional building, similar to the former Concordia campus. They are proposing wood with aluminum on the outside.*

*Rich Merrifield - architect - looking for more durability and less maintenance. The energy audit recommended replacing the windows. Adding a storm window just adds an extra layer and obscures the windows in the same manner as the existing security grate. These are basement windows. It would be a lengthy process for 17 windows to remove and repair sashes.*

*Mr. Rafael removed his motion to grant.*

*Ms. Pieper Eisenbrown would like the applicant to look into restoring the current windows or replace them with wood. Ms. Peltz agreed as well. Held so the applicant could research these options.*

**A motion was made by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be HELD IN COMMITTEE. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Robinson, Keating Kahn, Garcia, and Peltz

**No:** 0

**Excused:** 2 - Bauman, and Jarosz

13. [220755](#)

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a new house at 2409 N. Terrace Avenue, in the North

Point North Historic District, for Terrace 2409 LLC.

**Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

*Ms. Hatala said this is the third and final parcel that is right next door to a historic building. The city has a set-back formula that gives you a range of where the building is set on the property. Black is the primary color of this house and the tan is reclaimed cream city brick. The house has no basement - it sits on a slab. The front yard will have a gentle berm. It will be a very simple house with dormers and side gables. Recessed entry door and wood windows and two decks. The house will also have zinc cladding. Some of the landscape details need to be nailed down. Reclaimed brick was not popular until the 1940s so it wouldn't fit the historic district. The property is very horizontal and even the dormers do not project up, as is typical. Staff recommends that the design needs more work to make it more compatible with the district, as outlined in the staff report.*

*Juli Kaufmann - 2649 N. Bremen St. - will be the homeowner. She worked through with Tim and are now confused that they are getting a different message from Ms. Hatala Patrick Jones - architect - he was also surprised by the staff report and is seeking clarification. It won't be black zinc but a naturally patining metal product that has depth and variety. The color will be blue-gray. There are many examples of recessed porches as well as no porches. The house right next door has a recessed door. He likes narrow houses. The lawns across the street are generally flat and the windows are 1-2 feet above the lawn, while their windows are five feet up. The two primary materials will be the cream city brick and the cool gray zinc as well as three secondary materials, with black detailing. The roof will be metal. Mr. Askin suggested parging the foundation and covering it with landscaping since brick is no longer run directly into the ground.*

*Mike - Husband of the applicant*

*Aaron Delesley - 2386 N. Terrace Ave. - across the street; his concern is the setback and the zinc roof.*

*Sheila Reynolds - 2411 N. Terrace Ave. - in general, the rest of the block is at 30 feet setback and she would like this house's setback to be more. There also is a question about the lot lines and the house is using every inch of the lot. She also has concerns with the metal siding and they will be losing the trees currently there. Metal roofs also make a lot of noise, which is also a concern for her.*

*Mr. Hans Robinson would like to see a thicker fascia and the metal come down.*

*Held to work with staff and schedule next month.*

**A motion was made by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be HELD IN COMMITTEE. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Robinson, Keating Kahn, Garcia, and Peltz

**No:** 0

**Excused:** 2 - Bauman, and Jarosz

**The following files represent staff approved Certificates of Appropriateness:**

14. [220776](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for repairs to the rear porch 2845 W. State Street, in the Concordia Historic District, for Martha Reid.

**Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

**A motion was made by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Robinson, Keating Kahn, Garcia, and Peltz

**No:** 0

**Excused:** 2 - Bauman, and Jarosz

15. [220830](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of the porch deck and other repairs to the porch, at 856 N. 29th St., in the Concordia Historic District, for Ald. Robert Bauman

**Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

*6:15 P.M.*

**A motion was made by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, seconded by Sally Peltz, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Robinson, Keating Kahn, Garcia, and Peltz

**No:** 0

**Excused:** 2 - Bauman, and Jarosz

16. **Review and approval of the minutes from the September 12th meeting.**

17. [220764](#) Communication from the Federal Railroad Administration relating to the final Memorandum of Agreement Between the Federal Railroad Administration, the Wisconsin Department of Transportation, and the Wisconsin State Historic Preservation Office regarding the Muskego Yards Improvements Project (Wisconsin DOT Project ID 0385-57-03) in which the City is a concurring party.

**Sponsors:** THE CHAIR

18. **Approval of the 2023 meeting schedule.**

19. **Updates and announcements.**