

JOB EVALUATION REPORT

Fire and Police Commission Meeting: September 5, 2019

Milwaukee Police Department

Current	Recommendation
<p>Building Maintenance Mechanic II PR 7CN (\$40,160 - \$45,391) Six Positions FN: Recruitment is at \$40,639 FN: In Police Department, additional \$1 per hour when assigned supervisory responsibilities FN: In Police Department, additional \$1 per hour for all time worked in excess of 8 hours in 24 hour day plowing or salting.</p>	<p>Facilities Maintenance Mechanic PR 7HN (\$41,774 - \$52,049) Six Positions FN: Range of \$42,815 - \$55,347 FN: Recruitment anywhere in the range based on experience and credentials with DER approval FN: In Police Department, additional \$1 per hour when assigned supervisory responsibilities FN: In Police Department, additional \$1 per hour for all time worked in excess of 8 hours in 24 hour day plowing or salting.</p>
<p>Building Maintenance Mechanic I PR 7BN (\$35,376 - \$42,842) Underfill Title FN: Recruitment is at \$38,350</p>	
<p>Maintenance Technician II PR 3GN (\$40,516 - \$48,248) Six Positions FN: Recruitment is at \$42,535 FN: Recruitment at \$44,673 for a related Associate's Degree FN: In Police Department, additional \$1 per hour when assigned supervisory responsibilities FN: In Police Department, additional \$1 per hour for all time worked in excess of 8 hours in 24 hour day plowing or salting.</p>	<p>HVAC Maintenance Technician PR 7NN (\$44,786 - \$63,202) Six Positions FN: Recruitment anywhere in the range based on experience and credentials with DER approval FN: In Police Department, additional \$1 per hour when assigned supervisory responsibilities FN: In Police Department, additional \$1 per hour for all time worked in excess of 8 hours in 24 hour day plowing or salting.</p>
<p>Maintenance Technician I PR 3FN (\$38,508 - \$47,171) Underfill Title FN: Recruitment is at \$41,700</p>	
<p>Police Facilities Manager PR 1GX (\$66,435 - \$93,010) One Position</p>	<p>Facilities Manager PR 1HX (\$70,827 - \$99,154) One Position</p>
<p>Printer PR 7FN (\$39,138 - \$48,402) One Position FN: Recruitment is at \$40,980</p>	<p>Facilities Maintenance Mechanic PR 7HN (\$41,774 - \$52,049) One Position FN: Range of \$42,815 - \$55,347 FN: Recruitment anywhere in the range based on experience and credentials with DER approval FN: In Police Department, additional \$1 per hour when assigned supervisory responsibilities FN: In Police Department, additional \$1 per hour for all time worked in excess of 8 hours in 24 hour day plowing or salting.</p>

Note: Residents receive a rate that is 3% higher.

Background

The Department of Employee Relations has received requests to study HVAC (Heating, Ventilating, and Air Conditioning) and general maintenance positions in various City departments due to difficulties in recruiting and retaining employee. Reports addressing the pay for general City HVAC and general maintenance positions were approved by the City Service Commission, the Common Council and Mayor earlier in 2019. This report provides recommendations for HVAC and general maintenance positions in the Police department. These recommendations are consistent with titles and pay recommendations for general City departments.

Current job descriptions were provided and discussions were held with Arvis Williams, Human Resources Administrator, Pamela Roberts, Human Resources Specialist, and April Nwandu, Human Resources Analyst – Senior, as well as maintenance managers in the department. The recommended new rates of pay for these positions are based in part on an assessment of the cost of labor within southeastern Wisconsin as well as comparisons to comparable positions within city government. To assist the department in recruiting for these positions, this report recommends structured recruitment flexibility with approval from the Department of Employee Relations. The majority of changes in classifications and pay rates in this report are as a result of market pay studies.

The following table provides turnover data and recruitment efforts held between 2015 and the present for the Police Department titles listed below:

Title	Positions	Entries	Exits	Vacant
Building Maintenance Mechanic II	6	2	4	2
Maintenance Technician I & II	6	3	1	1
Police Facilities Manager	1	1	1	0
Police Fleet Manager	1	1	0	0
Police Department Totals	14	7	6	3

This data shows that, for the HVAC or maintenance technician titles in the Milwaukee Police Department, there is currently a 21% vacancy rate. During this same time period, the DER Staffing Division has conducted the following examinations sessions for the following titles:

Title	Sessions	Applicants	Rejects	No Shows	Fails	Eligible	Withdrawn	Hired
Building Maintenance Mechanic II	4	41	9	6	1	19	6	2
Maintenance Technician II	1	7	1	0	0	5	1	2
Total	5	48	10	6	1	24	7	4

This data shows that, as a result of 5 test administration sessions, the City has been able to successfully hire four candidates. In order to meet ongoing work demands, it has been necessary for the Milwaukee Police Department to have current employees work overtime and/or to engage contractors. In the case of the Police Department the outsourcing cost has been \$70 to \$100 per hour depending upon the type of work. Historically the Police Department has not been able to fully staff these positions for about eight years.

Current	Building Maintenance Mechanic II	Pay Range 7CN (\$40,160 - \$45,391) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Recruitment is at \$40,639 In Police Department, additional \$1 per hour when assigned supervisory responsibilities In Police Department, additional \$1 per hour for all time worked in excess of 8 hours in 24 hour day plowing or salting. 	6 Positions
Current	Building Maintenance Mechanic I	Pay Range 7BN (\$35,376 - \$42,842) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Recruitment is at \$38,350 	Underfill Title
Recommended	Facilities Maintenance Mechanic	Pay Range 7HN (\$41,774 - \$52,049) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Range of \$42,815 - \$55,347 Recruitment anywhere in the range based on experience and credentials with DER approval In Police Department, additional \$1 per hour when assigned supervisory responsibilities In Police Department, additional \$1 per hour for all time worked in excess of 8 hours in 24 hour day plowing or salting. 	6 Positions

These are skilled technical maintenance positions that perform special and preventive maintenance and repairs on plumbing, electrical, and HVAC systems. Duties include repairing and replacing air compressors; inspecting and repairing boiler piping and controls; repairing, replacing, and adjusting HVAC controls; balancing heating and cooling systems; testing and replacing fuses and breakers; and repairing and replacing motors, pumps, valves, piping joints, and sump pumps.

Minimum requirements include two years of building maintenance, repair, and mechanical experience working in the capacity of building engineer (or comparable). Experience must include maintaining and repairing HVAC equipment as well as mechanical, electrical, electronic, and other building components.

In determining the recommendations for these positions, comparisons were made to external market rates of pay for positions with similar duties and responsibilities. The rates from ERI shown below reflect the minimum and maximum rates of pay at the 10th, 25th, mean, 75th and 90th percentiles of the labor market:

Maintenance Repairer Industrial

Years' Experience	10 th Percentile	25 th Percentile	Survey Mean	75 th Percentile	90 th Percentile
7	\$49,334	\$52,514	\$57,007	\$60,970	\$65,233
5	\$46,124	\$49,058	\$53,213	\$56,868	\$60,828
3	\$42,328	\$45,051	\$48,831	\$52,104	\$55,696
1	\$37,984	\$40,575	\$44,099	\$46,988	\$50,164

Source: ERI. Published Q2 of 2019. (30-Mile Radius of Milwaukee)

ERI defines a Maintenance Repairer Industrial as a position that repairs, installs, and maintains machinery, equipment, physical structures, and pipe and electrical systems in commercial or industrial establishments, following specifications, blueprints, manuals, and schematic drawings, using hand tools, power tools, hoist, crane, and measuring and testing instruments.

Based on a review of the market data, we recommend that these six positions be changed to Pay Range 7HN (\$41,774 - \$52,049) with a footnote that provides the range of \$42,815 - \$55,347, which is close to the mean average for an individual with one to seven years of experience. We further recommend that the underfill classification be

eliminated and the title be changed to Facilities Maintenance Mechanic. This title will be more consistent with other current titles such as Facility Mechanic, Facilities Maintenance Coordinator, and Facilities Project Coordinator.

To assist with recruitment and retention, this report further recommends recruitment at any point in the range based on experience and credentials with the approval of DER.

Current	Maintenance Technician II	Pay Range 3GN (\$40,516 - \$48,248) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Recruitment is at \$42,535 In Police Department, additional \$1 per hour when assigned supervisory responsibilities In Police Department, additional \$1 per hour for all time worked in excess of 8 hours in 24 hour day plowing or salting. 	6 Positions
Current	Maintenance Technician I	Pay Range 3FN (\$38,508 - \$47,171) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Recruitment is at \$41,700 	Underfill Title
Recommended	HVAC Maintenance Technician	Pay Range 7NN (\$44,786 - \$63,202) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Recruitment anywhere in the range based on experience and credentials with DER approval In Police Department, additional \$1 per hour when assigned supervisory responsibilities In Police Department, additional \$1 per hour for all time worked in excess of 8 hours in 24 hour day plowing or salting. 	6 Positions

These positions repair, adjust, maintain and clean all equipment related to facilities under the control of the Milwaukee Police Department. This includes repairs, programming, and operation of HVAC refrigeration systems, digital controls, fire-life safety systems for high rise Class A commercial buildings, and other facilities.

Minimum requirements include an associate's degree in the HVAC field and three years of experience in the maintenance and repair of HVAC/refrigeration equipment and other mechanical, electrical, and electronic automated building systems or five years of related experience; and a Chlorofluorocarbon (CFC) certification from the State of Wisconsin within six months of appointment and throughout employment. Equivalent combinations of education and experience may be considered.

In determining the recommendations for these positions, comparisons were made to external market rates of pay for positions with similar duties and responsibilities. The rates from ERI shown below reflect the minimum and maximum rates of pay at the 10th, 25th, mean, 75th and 90th percentiles of the labor market:

Heating and Air Conditioning Mechanic (HVAC)

Years' Experience	10 th Percentile	25 th Percentile	Survey Mean	75 th Percentile	90 th Percentile
7	\$54,111	\$58,350	\$64,121	\$69,536	\$75,148
5	\$50,915	\$54,865	\$60,282	\$65,346	\$70,620
3	\$47,418	\$51,035	\$56,041	\$60,708	\$65,598
1	\$43,730	\$47,055	\$51,606	\$55,838	\$60,312

Source: ERI. Published Q2 of 2019. (30-Mile Radius of Milwaukee)

ERI defines a Heating, Ventilating and Air Conditioning (HVAC) Mechanic as a position that installs, services, and repairs heating, ventilating, air conditioning systems, and related environmental-control systems utilizing knowledge of heating and refrigeration theory, pipefitting, and structural layout ; mounts compressor and condenser units on platform or floor, using hand tools, following blueprints or engineering specifications; and

fabricates, assembles and installs ductwork and chassis parts, using portable metalworking tools and welding equipment.

Based on a review of the rates above and the desire to eliminate the underfill title, we recommend these two positions be changed to Pay Range 7NN (\$44,786 - \$63,202). Due to the technical nature of the work, we recommend that the title be changed to HVAC Maintenance Technician. We therefore recommend that these six positions be reclassified from Maintenance Technician II in Pay Range 3GN (\$40,516 - \$48,248) with a recruitment rate of \$42,535 to HVAC Maintenance Technician in Pay Range 7NN (\$44,786 - \$63,202).

To assist with recruitment and retention, this report further recommends recruitment at any point in the range based on experience and credentials with approval of DER.

Current	Police Facilities Manager	Pay Range 1GX (\$66,435 - \$93,010)	1 Position
Recommended	Facilities Manager	Pay Range 1HX (\$70,827 - \$99,154)	1 Position

This position administers and controls all activities pertaining to the maintenance, repair, remodeling, and operations of fourteen police occupied, or used buildings, and that of the department's printing and supplies section. Duties include obtaining estimates for emergency and routine maintenance by contractors and monitoring projects through completion; conducting or scheduling periodic inspections of the physical condition and operating efficiency of mechanical equipment; preparing reports and budget requests; and maintaining records.

Minimum requirements include a bachelor's degree in engineering or closely related field with an emphasis in mechanical disciplines. Equivalent combinations of education and experience may be considered.

In determining the recommendation for this position, comparisons were made to external market rates of pay for positions with similar duties and responsibilities. The rates from ERI shown below reflect the minimum and maximum rates of pay for the classifications of Facilities Director and Building and Facilities Manager at the 10th, 25th, mean, 75th and 90th percentiles of the labor market:

Facilities Director

Years' Experience	10 th Percentile	25 th Percentile	Survey Mean	75 th Percentile	90 th Percentile
7	\$93,860	\$103,721	\$116,234	\$129,068	\$141,449
5	\$88,154	\$97,462	\$109,308	\$121,446	\$133,206
3	\$82,267	\$90,999	\$102,141	\$113,548	\$124,636
1	\$76,288	\$84,429	\$94,847	\$105,492	\$115,879

Source: ERI. Published Q2 of 2019. (30-Mile Radius of Milwaukee)

ERI defines a Facilities Director as a position that plans, organizes, and directs the maintenance, repair, and alteration of a company's buildings and grounds; plans and develops facilities and new construction; assures projects and jobs are completed proficiently and within regulatory guidelines and projected deadlines; and develops long and short-range maintenance plans and programs such as emergency response plans and energy management plans.

Building and Facilities Manager

Years' Experience	10 th Percentile	25 th Percentile	Survey Mean	75 th Percentile	90 th Percentile
7	\$75,948	\$82,404	\$90,901	\$99,229	\$107,580
5	\$71,316	\$77,380	\$85,385	\$93,213	\$101,090
3	\$66,497	\$72,149	\$79,635	\$86,932	\$94,304
1	\$61,601	\$66,828	\$73,779	\$80,528	\$87,373

Source: ERI. Published Q2 of 2019. (30-Mile Radius of Milwaukee)

ERI defines a Building and Facilities Manager as a position that manages, plans, and coordinates, through staff of skilled, semiskilled, and unskilled trade personnel, activities concerned with the operations, repair, maintenance and construction of facilities, equipment, buildings, and grounds to minimize interruption and improve efficiency; plan and oversee such matters as design and development of plant facilities, formulation of operating rules, regulations and procedures; develop procedures for use in event of accidents, fires, or other emergencies; inspect plant facilities or review inspection reports, to determine repairs, replacement, or improvements required; hire, train and supervise building service personnel; and assign workers to duties such as maintenance, repair or renovation and may obtain bids for additional work from outside contractors.

Within City government the scope of responsibility and requirements of this position are comparable to those of the Facilities Managers in DPW-Infrastructure Services and the Milwaukee Public Library in Pay Range 1HX. Based upon this comparability as well as external market data, we recommend the higher pay range of 1HX (\$70,827 - \$99,154).

We therefore recommend one position of Police Facilities Manager in Pay Range 1GX (\$66,435 - \$93,010) be reclassified to Facilities Manager in Pay Range 1HX (\$70,827 - \$99,154).

Current	Printer	Pay Range 7FN (\$39,138 - \$48,402) • Recruitment is at \$40,980	1 Position
Recommended	Facilities Maintenance Mechanic	Pay Range 7HN (\$41,774 - \$52,049) • Range of \$42,815 - \$55,347 • Recruitment anywhere in the range based on experience and credentials with DER approval • In Police Department, additional \$1 per hour when assigned supervisory responsibilities • In Police Department, additional \$1 per hour for all time worked in excess of 8 hours in 24 hour day plowing or salting.	1 Position

The focus of this position is two-fold. In terms of Printer responsibilities, the position is responsible for preparing and printing forms, brochures, color newsletters, annual reports, and other printing requests utilizing offset presses. This involves striping-up negatives and making metal printing plates for single and two color printing jobs, aligning color bars and making printing plates for four color process offset printing, calibrating densitometer, setting color values; performing desktop publishing duties. In addition to operating the equipment, the position also has responsibility for maintaining and repairing all equipment in the Printing and Stores Section.

In terms of building maintenance responsibilities, the position performs repairs on plumbing, electrical, and HVAC systems. Duties may include repairing and replacing air compressors; inspecting and repairing boiler piping and controls; repairing, replacing, and adjusting HVAC controls; balancing heating and cooling systems; testing and replacing fuses and breakers; and repairing and replacing motors, pumps, valves, piping joints, and sump pumps.

Minimum requirements include two years of building maintenance, repair, and mechanical experience working in the capacity of building engineer (or comparable). Experience must include maintaining and repairing HVAC equipment as well as mechanical, electrical, electronic, and other building components.

In determining the recommendation for this position, comparisons were made to external market rates of pay for positions with similar duties and responsibilities. The rates from ERI shown below reflect the minimum and maximum rates of pay for the classifications of Printer Job and Maintenance Service Worker at the 10th, 25th, mean, 75th and 90th percentiles of the labor market:

Printer Job

Years' Experience	10 th Percentile	25 th Percentile	Survey Mean	75 th Percentile	90 th Percentile
7	\$30,918	\$33,249	\$36,638	\$39,456	\$42,398
5	\$29,136	\$31,247	\$34,404	\$37,100	\$39,974
3	\$27,282	\$29,128	\$31,967	\$34,433	\$37,188
1	\$25,487	\$27,033	\$29,491	\$31,646	\$34,151

Source: ERI. Published Q2 of 2019. (30-Mile Radius of Milwaukee)

ERI defines a Printer Job as a position that prints complete job order; positions type according to copy and operates cylinder or automatic platen press.

Maintenance Service Worker

Years' Experience	10 th Percentile	25 th Percentile	Survey Mean	75 th Percentile	90 th Percentile
7	\$45,494	\$48,384	\$52,482	\$56,077	\$59,980
5	\$42,875	\$45,616	\$49,447	\$52,779	\$56,428
3	\$39,849	\$42,48	\$46,085	\$49,124	\$52,473
1	\$36,496	\$39,031	\$42,495	\$45,296	\$48,336

Source: ERI. Published Q2 of 2019. (30-Mile Radius of Milwaukee)

ERI defines a Maintenance Service Worker as a position that keeps an organization's facilities and equipment maintained, performing a variety of duties; performs moderately difficult work in two or more trades, such as electrician, carpenter, machinist, millwright, painter, mason, etc. This position is typically semiskilled in several trades.

The maintenance duties and responsibilities of this position are comparable to the classification of Facilities Maintenance Mechanic and the incumbent of the position has been performing these duties and responsibilities for some time. Based upon the similarity of duties and responsibilities to other maintenance worker positions in the Police Department, the recommendation is to reclassify this position as Facilities Maintenance Mechanic. The position will continue to have responsibility for Police Department printing operations.

Therefore based upon comparability of work to other maintenance workers in the Police department we recommend that this position of Printer in Pay Range 7FN (\$39,138 - \$48,402) be reclassified to Facilities Maintenance Mechanic in Pay Range 7HN (\$41,774 - \$52,049) with a footnote that provides the range of \$42,815 - \$55,347.

Prepared By: April Nwandu
 April Nwandu, Human Resources Analyst-Senior

Prepared By: Andrea Knickerbocker
 Andrea Knickerbocker, Human Resources Manager

Reviewed By: Maria Monteagudo
 Maria Monteagudo, Employee Relations Director