



Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

Living with History

HPC meeting date: 12/14/2015
Ald. Milele Coggs District: 6
Staff reviewer: Dean Doerrfeld
PTS

Property 101 West Vine Street Brewer's Hill Historic District

Owner/Applicant AMANDA & JERRY TEAGARDNER David J. Koscielniak
220 EAST BROWN STREET 12310 West Waterford Avenue
MILWAUKEE, WI 53212 Greenfield, WI 53228
PHONE: (414) 690-2050 Phone: (414) 303-8489

Proposal This project involves the construction of a gable-roofed, detached, two-car garage. Additionally, the reconstruction of the porch at the northeast corner of the dwelling, and a new porch to the northwest are proposed.

Staff Comments The building was constructed ca. 1876 in a modified Italianate style with moderate detailing and ornamentation. This building displays select elements of a typical example of this style: moderately-pitched gable roof, arched window openings with brick window hoods, and gouge-work verge board. The primary building material used in this two-story, masonry structure is Cream City brick. Dwellings in this area vary in architectural style but have similar scale, massing, and proportions to this ell-shaped structure. The house was occupied originally by Frederick Schloemilch.

The Brewer's Hill Historic District was listed in the National Register of Historic Places in 1995, and locally designated in 1985.

The applicant appeared before the Commission on 9 November 2015 with a proposal for an attached garage and mudroom. That requested was denied. The applicant has since revised the plan for a detached, slab-on-grade, gable-roofed garage in the southwest corner of the property. The exact location is unknown as the applicant has arranged for a property survey, after which, the appropriate setbacks can be determined.

The overall footprint of the garage measures 24' by 24' feet, with an approximate ridge height of 15'. The garage will have two, 9'x8' foot wood-faced garage doors facing north. The eave of the garage extends roughly 30" over the doors with support brackets symmetrically placed along the elevation. Ogee gutters are shown on the north and south eave line. The east elevation of the garage depicts a single, half-lite passage door and a concrete stoop. The south and west elevations are blind. Construction materials include cement-fiber shakes and asphalt shingles.

Proposed work on the main structure includes the reconstruction of the existing porch on the northeast corner of the building, and the construction of a new porch on northwest. Both are shown as hipped roof units with minimal ornamentation such as square columns (attached at the wall surfaces), balustrade, and arched spandrels. A half-lite door is again shown on the northwest porch. Roofing material is assumed to be asphalt shingles with ogee gutters along the eaves.

The concept of a detached, two-car garage is appropriate for the site and the Brewer's Hill Historic District. The design and exterior finish identifies this as an ancillary structure and does not diminish the visual dominance of the main dwelling. However, there are numerous details that need clarification:

- Materials and design of passage door, trim, door surrounds, brackets, porch

posts and spandrel, and door into residence

- Delineation of roof pitch
- Exact location and orientation of garage
- Drive materials, configuration, and modifications to curb cut, if any
- Materials and design of verge board, wall cornice, raking cornice, and soffits
- Location of downspouts
- Type and materials of door within northeast porch reconstruction (if replaced)

In discussions with the applicants, they are amenable to finalizing details with staff.

Some items that may require discussion are basic changes to the plan. While it is appropriate to construct blind south and west elevations, additional detailing may improve the east elevation. Paired or triple windows could be symmetrically placed between the door and corner to add detail to the wall plane. These could be placed higher in the wall for security, but would add visual interest and provide additional interior lighting. This might also allow for an alternate passage door style. To improve security a five-panel door could be used rather than the half-lite. A second consideration would be a hood over the passage door. This serves to break up the rectilinear character of the north elevation, and afford some protection to the passage door. Another modification is the addition of a water table or lower wall treatment to distinguish the foundation from the wall mass. A simple water table or a variation in wall material near grade would accomplish this.

Staff finds that the design, wall finish, and siting of the proposed detached garage is appropriate to the historic property and the Brewer's Hill Historic District. Staff and the applicant are in agreement to finalize all details prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Recommendation

Construct detached, two-car garage: Approve with conditions

Conditions

As noted above.

Previous HPC action

Previous Council action