



Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date: 2/5/2018
Ald. Robert Bauman District: 4
Staff reviewer: Tim Askin
PTS #114452 CCF # 171444

Property	1584 N. PROSPECT AV.	McIntosh-Goodrich House
Owner/Applicant	Rachel Fritz for WI CONSERVATORY OF MUSIC 1584 N PROSPECT MILWAUKEE WI 53202	Debra Zins Uihlein/Wilson Architects 322 E. Michigan St. Milwaukee, WI 53202 Phone: (414) 271-8899
Proposal	Replace the bottom 36" of three out of four red sandstone columns on the main entry portico of the mansion.	
Staff comments	<p>The McIntosh-Goodrich Mansion is an excellent example of the Neo-Classical Revival style. It features the finest building materials of the era, particularly the subject "Michigan raindrop brownstone" (now more commonly referred to as Lake Superior red sandstone) and extensive copper trim. The former residence was designed by Chicago architect, Horatio R. Wilson. It has been occupied by the Wisconsin Conservatory of Music since 1934.</p> <p>Three of the four columns on the portico are severely deteriorated from weather and winter salting. One column is intact to retain as is while being a testament to original materials. The salt issue has been remedied by reconstructing the concrete portions of the porch with heating elements and inserting heating elements under the granite steps.</p> <p>Relevant Guidelines <i>B.1.d. Repair or replace deteriorated material with new material that duplicates the old as closely as possible. Avoid using new material that is inappropriate or was unavailable when the building was constructed.</i></p> <p>While Chinese red sandstone would likely have been unavailable at the time of construction, red sandstone was clearly available. Unfortunately, the Lake Superior quarries are closed, with some of them now within state and national parks. Using the same quarry is not an option and salvage is unlikely to supply large enough pieces to re-carve this much stone to match.</p> <p><i>D. There shall be no changes to the existing porches, trim, or ornamentation except as necessary to restore the building to its original condition. Replacement features shall match the original member in scale, design, and appearance.</i></p> <p>Substantial effort is being put towards matching the appearance of the deteriorated areas, by re-carving monolithic new material. Repairs will be only one mortar joint each. This will make clear that repairs have occurred while minimally changing the appearance of the porch.</p>	
Recommendation	Recommend HPC Approval with conditions	
Conditions	<p>Approval is conditioned on matching the provided stone sample's spotty character throughout the project. The Commission has found other samples of this type of stone to be unsatisfactory for other recent projects.</p> <p>As stone supplier and stonecarving facility are not local, staff recommends that photographs of the selected blocks be sent to staff for approval before carving begins. Staff should be allowed to approve mortar color on site.</p>	
Previous HPC action	Staff approved disassembly of the porch to facilitate insertion of heating elements, as concrete was replaced in kind with concrete and all other materials were re-used.	

