

## **Department of Employee Relations**

Cavalier Johnson Mayor

Harper Donahue, IV Director

Renee Joos Director Employee Benefits

Nicole Fleck Labor Negotiator

August 31, 2022

To the Honorable Finance and Personnel Committee Common Council City of Milwaukee

File No:181250 – Substitute ordinance relating to classifications and salaries of City officials and the Mayor (Proposed amendment to the Salary Ordinance, Section 1, relative to the salaries of City officials)

## **Dear Committee Members:**

The purpose of this memo is to provide background and support for removal of the language that prohibits the pay of certain City officials to exceed that of the Mayor.

Though the City of Milwaukee is fortunate to have excellent incumbents, recruitment for Cabinet-level positions has not yielded a large number of candidates in the past five years. Consultations with recruitment firms have indicated that the City's pay is low for executive leadership positions, particularly in comparison with other municipalities of this size. Recent recruitments for vacancies in Cabinet-level positions have yielded generally five or fewer qualified candidates, including:

	Recruitment
Title	Years
Commissioner of Assessments	2021
Commissioner of Health	2018 2020
Commissioner of Neighborhood Services	2019
DPW Commissioner	2018 2020 2022
Employee Relations Director	2020 2022
Fire and Police Commission Executive Director	2014 2019 2020

Allowing the full use of our pay ranges, combined with recruitment flexibility at any rate with the authorization of Employee Relations and the Chair of the Committee on Finance and Personnel, will give the City of Milwaukee the ability to recruit and retain highly qualified candidates for the City's 31 executive leadership positions. The majority of these titles are Cabinet appointees, pursuant to State Statutes 62.51 (1) (a). For context, this communication also includes the rates of pay for elected officials.

In addition, two addendums to this communication provide rates of pay for similar executive leadership positions in other jurisdictions in southeastern Wisconsin and in similar cities nationally.



Department	#	Race/	Title		Title	Title
		Gender			Minimum	Maximum
Health	1	WF	Commissioner-Health	1PX	123,950	173,523
Department of Public Works	1	Vacant	Commissioner-Public Works	1PX	123,950	173,523
Department of Administration	1	BF	Administration Director	1OX	116,290	162,802
DPW-Infrastructure	1	Vacant	City Engineer	1OX	116,290	162,802
Assessor	1	WF	Commissioner of Assessments	1OX	116,290	162,802
Neighborhood Services	1	WF	Commissioner-Building Inspection	1OX	116,290	162,802
City Development	1	BM	Commissioner-City Development	1OX	116,290	162,802
City Attorney	4	BM/BF/2WM	Deputy City Attorney	1OX	116,290	162,802
Health	1	Vacant	Deputy Commissioner of Medical Service	1OX	116,290	162,802
Employee Relations	1	Vacant	Employee Relations Director	1OX	116,290	162,802
DPW-Operations	1	HF	Operations Division Director	1OX	116,290	162,802
DPW-Water Works	1	WM	Water Works Superintendent	1OX	116,290	162,802
Police	1	BM	Chief of Police	4SX	116,290	162,802
Fire	1	WM	Fire Chief	4SX	116,290	162,802
Emergency Communication	1	Vacant	Emergency Communications Director	1NX	120,005.86	152,738
City Attorney	1	Vacant	Special Deputy City Attorney	1NX	120,005.86	152,738
Library	1	BF	Milwaukee Public Library Director	1NX	119,690.48	152,738
DOA-Budget & Management	1	WM	Budget and Management Director	1NX	109,095.48	152,738
DOA-ITMD	1	WM	Chief Information Officer	1NX	109,095.48	152,738
Employe's Retirement System	1	WM	Chief Investment Officer	1NX	109,095.48	152,738
City Development	1	WF	Deputy Commissioner-City Development	1NX	109,095.48	152,738
Fire and Police Commission	1	BM	Fire and Police Commission Executive Director	1NX	109,095.48	152,738
DOA-Intergovernmental Relations	1	BF	Legislative Liaison Director		109,095.48	152,738
Port Milwaukee	1	WM	Municipal Port Director	1NX	109,095.48	152,738
Police	3	AIM/AIF/BM	Assistant Chief of Police	4RX	109,095.48	152,738
Fire	3	2BM/BF	Assistant Fire Chief	4RX	109,095.48	152,738

City of Milwaukee Elected Officials (2012-2016 Term of Office)

Title	Pay	Annual		
	Range	Rate		
Mayor	EOE	147,335.76		
City Attorney	EOE	147,335.50		
Municipal Judge	EOE	133,049.02		
Comptroller	EOE	125,607.04		
City Treasurer	EOE	114,039.64		
Alderman	EOE	73,222.24		
FN: Council President		82,749.16		

The information above shows that these executive leadership positions already have maximum rates higher than the Mayor's salary. By lifting the salary cap, job postings will list the full salary range which will improve the City's ability to recruit highly qualified candidates.

The selection processes for executive leadership positions vary. While DER Staffing Services handles many of these recruitments, some departments choose to conduct the selection processes independently. In any scenario, once a candidate is chosen, the hiring authority may request a special appointment rate which must be reviewed and authorized by both DER and the Chair of the Committee on Finance and Personnel. The special recruitment rate process is authorized in Part II, Section 3: Salary at Time of Appointment:

B. Recruitment of Officials and Administrators (Section 1) and Professionals (Section 2): In the event it becomes necessary to recruit at a rate above the minimum for positions classified as Officials and Administrators or Professionals recruitment may be authorized at a rate up to 60% above the minimum of the applicable pay range with the approval of the Department of Employee Relations and the Chair of the Committee on Finance and Personnel. A listing of appointments made pursuant to this provision shall be maintained by the Department of Employee Relations

and communicated to the Committee on Finance and Personnel as requested. Recruitment for purposes of this provision includes appointments after promotion.

The special recruitment rate process requires the hiring authority to make a request to DER and to include the following information. For context, recruitment rates for Mayoral appointments do include discussions between the Mayor's Office and Employee Relations.

- An up-to-date job description
- The candidate's resume and/or job application
- The justification for the special recruitment rate
- A spreadsheet with the pay of co-workers in comparable level titles, of subordinates, and of supervisors

The DER Compensation Division's review includes analysis of pay equity, pay compression, market data, and organizational impact. Through this analysis, DER's Compensation Division is able to ensure that the effects of the special appointment rate will not violate laws that pertain to equal treatment and impact, such as the Civil Rights Acts of 1964 and 1991, the Equal Pay Acts of 1963, as well as comparable worth considerations. As a result of this analysis, DER may recommend changes to the requested appointment rate. Once DER does approve a special recruitment rate, the recommendation is forwarded to the Chair of the Committee on Finance and Personnel for review and approval. This step includes a review by Legislative Reference Bureau staff.

In addition to the special recruitment rate process detailed above, hiring departments have the option to make a special recruitment rate request directly to the Finance and Personnel Committee. This type of request follows the process of review and approval by the full Finance and Personnel Committee, the Common Council, and the Mayor. The request would need to provide the job description, candidate resume/job application, justification for the requested rate, and analysis of potential equity and/or pay compression with co-workers and supervisors. In these instances, a footnote detailing the employee's name and approved rate would be added under the job title in the salary ordinance. This special recruitment rate process could be used if an issue were to arise with the special rate letter being approved and/or in a timely manner.

In summary, this communication recommends the continued use of the Special Recruitment Rate Approval process and recommends lifting the Mayor's Salary Cap in order to improve the ability to recruit and retain highly qualified candidates for the City's executive leadership positions. Using the existing criteria and evaluation process for Special Recruitment Rates ensures consistency and a fair and equitable process. In order to ensure sound public HR policies, it is imperative that personnel decisions, including those regarding salary, are based upon objective criteria, such as market data and pay equity considerations.

For the reasons cited above, the Department of Employee Relation and the Office of Equity and Inclusion propose the following change to the current language in the salary ordinance:

**Action Required** – Effective September 18, 2022, (Pay Period 22, 2022)

In the Salary Ordinance Part I:

Delete the following language:

"In no case shall the salary of any City official exceed that of the Mayor."

Sincerely,

The Department of Employee Relations Prepared in collaboration with the Office of Equity and Inclusion

## Addendum #1

Rates of pay for similar executive leadership positions in other jurisdictions in southeastern Wisconsin.

		2020 Annual		
Jurisdiction	Title	Salary		
City of Racine	Finance Director	\$151,096		
	Fire Chief	\$147,146		
	Chief of Police	\$144,047		
	City Attorney	\$143,616		
	Commissioner of Public Works	\$131,575		
	Public Health Administrator	\$130,004		
	Director of City Development	\$127,409		
	Assistant Chief of Police	\$121,086		
	City Clerk	\$87,315		
	Director WW Field Services	\$84,306		
	City Assessor	\$80,534		
Waukesha County	Director Health/Human Services	\$183,155		
waukesha county	Director of Public Works	\$162,595		
	Director of Administration	\$151,798		
	Chief of Staff	\$112,314		
City of Waukesha	City Administrator	\$183,556		
	Director of Public Works	\$169,087		
	Fire Chief	\$151,837		
	Deputy Police Chief	\$137,989		
	Assistant Fire Chief	\$136,296		
	Director of Community Development	\$134,302		
	Police Captain	\$128,326		
	Attorney	\$127,687		
	City Engineer	\$126,446		
	Library Director	\$120,780		
	Human Resources Director	\$119,231		
	Deputy Community Development Director	\$110,548		
	City Clerk/Treasurer	\$103,861		
City of Waukesha	Fire Chief-Assistant	\$200,549		
City of waukesna	City Engineer	\$192,111		
	Finance Director			
	Assistant Police Chief	\$182,024 \$177,268		
	Fire Chief-Assistant			
		\$172,494		
	Fire Chief-Assistant Fire Chief	\$171,780 \$170,267		
		\$167,638		
	Attorney City Assistant Police Chief			
		\$162,372		
	Deputy City Attorney	\$158,427		
	Library Director	\$157,055 \$154,050		
	Director Plan Commission Economic Development Human Resource Director			
		\$151,817		
	Economic Development Division Director	\$141,867		
	Community Development Division Director	\$135,031		
	City Clerk	\$134,530		
	City Assessor	\$133,747		
	Treasury Revenue Manager	\$132,789		
	Planning Division Director	\$128,629		

Executive Salaries in Similar Jurisdictions prepared by the Legislative Reference Bureau

Addendum #2

	Baltimore	Boston	Buffalo	Columbus	Indianapolis	Kansas City	Madison	Pittsburgh	St. Louis	St. Paul
Mayor	189,453.00	199,547.00	158,500.00	197,627.00	95,000.00	141,455.00	125,500.00	124,658.00	131,820.00	141,232.00
Council Member	72,966.00	103,784.00	75,000.00	57,738.00	11,400.00	70,718.00	12,692.00	76,544.00	37,310.00	
Common Council Pres.	125,447.00		75,000.00	69,458.00	11,400.00		15,444.00		90,766.00	
Assessments Commr.		155,426.00	123,539.00		65,275.00		133,491.00		130,156.00	
Asst. Chief of Police	189,000.00			219,690.00	134,106.00					
Asst. Fire Chief	199,875.00			176,634.00	147,841.00					
<b>Building Inspection Commr.</b>		135,371.00	123,539.00		102,600.00		139,909.00	118,162.00	140,218.00	
Budget Dir.		150,412.00	133,068.00	136,760.00		173,064.00	121,047.00	124,068.00	136,318.00	132,642.00
City Attorney	188,000.00	171,470.00	141,841.00	184,600.00	125,349.00	193,380.00	175,844.00	121,759.00	174,174.00	180,398.00
City Attorney, Deputy			133,000.00		93,346.00	173,064.00	151,709.00		133,718.00	
City Development Commr.		161,442.00		233,954.00	1,000,000.00	173,064.00	175,844.00	118,162.00		170,518.00
City Engineer		140,945.00			110,000.00		162,600.00			156,811.00
City Treasurer		182,500.00		154,733.00	70,833.00	134,028.00		100,437.00	105,586.00	
Comptroller	227,537.00		119,500.00		125,349.00	134,028.00	175,844.00	82,386.00	112,190.00	
DOA Director		182,500.00								
DPW-Operations Dir.	206,620.00							90,204.00		
Emgcy Comm. Dir.				96,678.00		105,996.00				
Employee Relations Dir.	208,024.00	133,560.00	123,539.00	206,586.00	89,407.00	173,064.00	168,126.00	118,162.00	138,744.00	125,444.00
Fire Chief	220,631.00	250,687.00	157,220.00	200,678.00	160,557.00	173,064.00	175,844.00	133,280.00	151,000.00	175,469.00
Fire & Police Comm. Exec. Dir.							139,909.00	101,320.00	88,660.00	
Health Commr.	216,444.00	160,439.00		233,397.00	73,077.00	269,220.00			153,556.00	
ITMD Chief Info Officer	250,000.00	175,481.00	137,775.00	154,773.00		148,356.00	160,990.00		134,290.00	156,811.00
Library Director	180,193.00	151,136.00					153,800.00			156,811.00
Municipal Judge						159,578.00			82,134.00	
Police Chief	276,375.00	250,687.00	141,841.00	255,258.00	136,691.00		175,844.00	144,512.00	157,000.00	180,398.00
Public Works Commr.	245,000.00	130,357.00	133,068.00	264,742.00	125,349.00	173,064.00		118,162.00		170,518.00
Water Works Superintendent			83,030.00	206,586.00		229,764.00	160,990.00		95,212.00	170,518.00