



Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date: 10/9/2017
Ald. Jose Perez District: 12
Staff reviewer: Tim Askin
PTS #114389 CCF #170837

Property 1635 S. 8TH ST.

Owner/Applicant HISTORIC MITCHELL STREET
PRESERVATION CORP
1635 S 8TH ST
MILWAUKEE WI 53204

John Van Rooy
John Van Rooy Architecture
2843 N Prospect Ave
Milwaukee, WI 53211
Phone: (414) 801-0173

Proposal

ROOF

Existing: The existing roof is glazed clay tile on a sloped, hipped roof draining to a "built in gutter" concealed within the fascia and soffit.

Proposed: There are several areas of leaks. The existing roof is to remain with the leaks being explored, fixed, and replaced with original tiles in the original pattern.

GUTTERS

Existing: (likely galvanized) steel with soldered joints as a "built in gutter" integrated into the building soffit

Proposed: patch as required for water tightness.

DOWNSPOUTS

Existing: rectangular crimped galvanized steel and aluminum. These capture water from the gutters by penetrating through the soffit.

Proposed: replace sections as required for water tightness to match current condition

FASCIA

Existing: Painted pine boards with exposed knots.

Proposed: Replace with stucco to match that of the high, north roof. Will be based on the design and details of those found on the high north roof.

SOFFIT

Existing: The existing soffit consists of a 2+ foot overhang clad in painted plywood with intermittent cut in metal louvered vents.

Proposed: Stucco to match high north roof including details that resemble those currently found there. No vents will be installed in new soffit.

STUCCO

Existing: The main body of the house is made up of stucco that is for the most part in good shape. There are areas of visible patching and cracking that has happened over time.

Proposed: Minimal repair as required for a secure envelope and a clean appearance. Paint.

WINDOWS

Existing: The existing home currently has a mix of windows. The majority of windows are the original wood windows, typically in very poor condition- all with rotten, wood sills exposed to the elements, all with vinyl storms windows screwed to the original wood frame. A few windows have been replaced with vinyl windows with in between the glass grids.

Proposal (cont.)	<p>WINDOWS (cont.)</p> <p>Proposed: As the owner's funds are available windows will be replaced with aluminum clad wood windows by Marvin including a brick mould profile similar to the original house. These windows will be areoles and have exterior, interior and between the glass grids matching the pattern and proportion of the original windows. The SDLs will be traditional in shape and have the appearance of a putty line and profile shape to the actual mutton. Marvin or another high-end residential window line will be used.</p> <p>The original French door "windows" with the interesting curved and stylized mutton bar that have been infilled with stucco and/or replaced with vinyl windows will have the infill areas removed and a custom aluminum clad wood window similar in appearance to the original put in its place. See image of the interior French door for precedent these windows will be based on.</p>
Staff comments	<p>Applicant proposes a comprehensive overhaul of the building addressing years of deferred maintenance.</p> <p>While historic photos are limited in number and of poor quality, they confirm the absence of several prominent features, such as the elimination of several sets of original French doors that were in the place of most windows on the east and south elevations.</p> <p>Staff would recommend exploratory demolition of the soffit before approval to stucco the area is approved. Photos from the site visit suggest that original modillions and an original soffit were inappropriately boxed in to hide areas that would otherwise need more expensive repair. A house on Lake Drive built for Albert Kunzelmann six years after this house by the same architects hints at what the original soffit structure may have been. To the eyes of staff, the interior of the soffit did appear similar to that of the Lake Drive house. Stucco is a reasonable treatment for this area, but staff would like to document what is within the plywood soffit before the area is stuccoed in case there is any original fabric.</p> <p>Staff visited the site with the architect and found the remaining wood windows to be generally salvageable. Epoxy is likely necessary on all of the remaining original windows the windows and many windows may need replacement bottom rails. Otherwise, stripping, repainting, and re-puttying should be sufficient to repair most of the existing windows. Some muntins may also need to be reproduced. Overpainting onto glass is common.</p> <p>Applicant is indeed correct that most windowsills are rotten beyond repair. The sills are nearly flush with the walls currently and lack any drip edge. Limited photographic evidence suggests that this may have been an unfortunate original construction detail Although they may have been sawn off or rotted off during some prior window or stucco project. Applicant has hinted at using a substitute material for the sills such as limestone or Azac. Staff would be willing to accept stone as a reasonable remedy to the defective original construction detail. The later Lake Drive Kunzelmann House does have stone sills.</p> <p>Staff appreciates the applicant's efforts towards rehabilitation of the property; however, the Commission has never approved replacement fenestration in any material but natural wood unless the originals were not natural wood.</p>
Recommendation	Recommend HPC Approval with conditions and denying clad window replacements
Conditions	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Deny window replacements and require wood 2. Allow staff to photo-document original soffit within boxed soffit before stucco-ing. 3. Consider alternative material for windowsills, subject to staff review. 4. Approve all other work
Previous HPC action	Non-wood windows have been denied twice this year: February in the East Side Commercial Historic District and September in the Garden Homes Historic District.
Previous Council action	