



Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date: 2/10/2020
Ald. Nik Kovac District: 3
Staff reviewer: Tim Askin
PTS #114904 CCF # 191521

Property 1218 - 20 E. BRADY ST.

Owner/Applicant PAT SUMINSKI
1220 E BRADY ST
MILWAUKEE WI 53202
Roofed Right America, LLC
429 W. Boden St.
Milwaukee, WI 53207
Phone: (414) 769-0100

Proposal

1. Replace roofing at rear of property with new Landmark shingles
2. A. Replace front roof facing Brady with same material
2. B. Replace front roof facing Brady with Matterhorn metal tile in "Tuscan Villa" profile.
3. Remove west chimney

Staff comments The building dates to 1913, but has had many alterations over the years. Per photos, the appearance along Brady Street has been remarkably consistent since roughly the 1950s.

Roofing all over the building is in clear need of replacement. The owner's preferred option is to use a reddish brown dimensional shingle for the entirety of the roof, including the street-facing slope that is currently metal tile.

The proposed shingle is generally acceptable and an appropriate choice for where asphalt shingles currently exist on the building. The front of the building is another matter, it has had a metal tile roof since at least the 1950s (Milwaukee's Brady Street Neighborhood, p. 54). Earlier photos have not been located. Even assuming the metal tile was added in the 50s, it is now a feature that has "acquired significance in its own right." The difference between 1960 and 1913 is less than the difference between 2020 and 1960. Therefore, the building has demonstrably had a metal roof on the front for most of its existence.

The chimney is minimally detailed and does not appear to be a character-defining feature.

Staff recommends approving the Matterhorn metal for the front of the roof and the Landmark for the rear of the roof. Staff also recommends allowing removal of the chimney.

Recommendation Recommend HPC Approval with conditions.

Conditions

No dormers, chimneys, moldings parapets, or other permanent features will be altered or removed. No box vents, if used, will be visible from the street. If they are installed, they must be on a rear slope not visible from the street and they must be painted to blend with the color of the roofing material. A continuous ridge vent can be installed in place of box vents, but the vent must extend across the entire ridge and not stop short. Built-in rain gutters will be retained and sealed where needed. Valleys must be metal W-shape with no interweaving of shingles. Valleys and flashing must be painted or factory-finished to match the roofing color, unless copper. When installing new flashing at a masonry feature, the flashing must be stepped or cut into the mortar joints. The bricks may not be cut to install flashing at an angle.

Previous HPC action**Previous Council
action**