GRANT F. LANGLEY

City Attorney

LINDA ULISS BURKE VINCENT D. MOSCHELLA DANIELLE M. BERGNER MIRIAM R. HORWITZ Deputy City Attorneys



Milwaukee City Hall Suite 800 • 200 East Wells Street • Milwaukee, Wisconsin 53202-3551 Telephone: 414.286.2601 • TDD: 414.286.2025 • Fax: 414.286.8550

February 13, 2015

To the Honorable Common Council of the City of Milwaukee Room 205 – City Hall

RE: Carter v. Merrill

Case No. 10-cy-00396

Dear Council Members:

Enclosed is a proposed resolution and fiscal note authorizing payment of a settlement amount regarding the above-referenced matter. We request that the enclosed documents be referred to the appropriate committee for review.

Mr. Carter brought suit regarding events which occurred on October 8, 2009. On that night, Mr. Carter was observed entering the home garage of Police Officer Joseph Merrill. While attempting to prevent Mr. Carter from leaving the scene before on-duty officers arrived, Officer Merrill found himself being dragged by Mr. Carter's car as Mr. Carter was attempting to flee. Officer Merrill fired his gun at Mr. Carter, causing injury to his hand. Mr. Carter claimed that Officer Merrill's use of deadly force was unreasonable, and sought compensatory damages, pain and suffering damages, and punitive damages. Officer Merrill maintained that he only used deadly force because of the threat he perceived of death or great bodily harm to himself by Mr. Carter's actions. The case was tried before a jury in federal court in January, 2014. The jury hung. The parties subsequently entered into mediation. In the context of mediation statements, counsel for Mr. Carter claimed over \$90,000 in out-of-pocket litigation expenses, and approximately \$350,000 in attorney's fees. Mr. Carter also sustained approximately \$77,000 in medical bills. As a result of mediation, plaintiff's counsel indicated that plaintiff would settle this case for the total amount of \$190,000.

Because of the unpredictability of trial, the fact that the case already went to trial, which resulted in a hung jury, and the City's risk for exposure to not only compensatory damages, but also to punitive damages and attorney's fees in the context of a second trial, we recommend

THOMAS O. GARTNER STUART S. MUKAMAL THOMAS J. BEAMISH **MAURITA F. HOUREN** JOHN J. HEINEN SUSAN E. LAPPEN JAN A, SMOKOWICZ PATRÍCIA A. FRICKER **HEIDI WICK SPOERL** KURT A. REHLING **GREGG C. HAGOPIAN ELLEN H. TANGEN** JAY A. UNORA **DONALD L. SCHRIEFER** MARYNELL REGAN G. O'SULLIVAN-CROWLEY KATHRYN Z. BLOCK ADAM B. STEPHENS **KEVIN P. SULLIVAN** THOMAS D. MILLER JARELY M. RUIZ **ROBIN A. PEDERSON** MARGARET C. DAUN JEREMY R. MCKENZIE MARY L. SCHANNING PETER J. BLOCK NICHOLAS P. DESIATO JOANNA GIBELEV JENNY YUAN T.C. MAKAYA KAIL J. DECKER ALLISON N. FLANAGAN LA KEISHA W. BUTLER **Assistant City Attorneys**

To the Honorable Common Council of the City of Milwaukee Page 2 February 13, 2015

that this matter be settled for that amount. Consistent with our recommendation, we have enclosed an appropriate resolution for your consideration.

Very truly yours,

GRANTELLINGLEY

City Attorney

SUSAN E. LAPPEN Assistant City Attorney

Enclosures

1032-2010-2387:212316