



## Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

**HPC meeting date: 5/6/2019**  
**Ald. Milele Coggs District: 6**  
**Staff reviewer: Tim Askin**  
**PTS #114716 CCF #190026**

**Property** 214 E. VINE ST. Brewers Hill HD

**Owner/Applicant** NATHALIE GATTO  
214 E VINE ST  
MILWAUKEE WI 532123932  
Nathalie Gatto  
830 E. Fairy Chasm Rd.  
Bayside, WI 53212  
Phone: (414) 507-9215

**Proposal** A shed was put up on the North side of the house located in the NE corner of the lot. Dimensions: 16ft x 8ft. LP Smartside vertically-scored panel siding

**Staff comments** This shed was erected sometime last year and is before us due to a complaint from the neighborhood. It has always been this Commission's policy that new buildings of any kind are reviewed by this body for compatibility. Gazebos, patios, and garages are regularly reviewed.

Siding is the panelized version of LP Smartside, a product that has been rejected by this Commission numerous times in the last few years.

As a panelized product, it is essentially a modern version of T1-11, made out of pulverized wood rather than the traditional plywood.

Staff recommends denial on multiple grounds. Other versions of this product have been rejected multiple times. Further, this Commission has never approved a panelized siding product.

**A. Guidelines for New Construction**

It is important that additional new construction be designed so as to harmonize with the character of the district.

**Review of Guidelines**

*1. Siting*

*New construction must reflect the traditional siting of buildings in Brewer's Hill. This includes setback, spacing between buildings, the orientation of openings to the street and neighboring structures, and the relationship between the main building and accessory buildings. New buildings should not obstruct the vistas from the street to the house.*

*2. Scale*

*Overall building height and bulk; the expression of major building divisions including foundation, body and roof; and, individual building components such as porches, overhangs and fenestration must be compatible with the surrounding structures. Shed is awkwardly proportioned.*

*3. Form*

*The massing of new construction must be compatible with the surrounding buildings. The profiles of roofs and building elements that project and recede from the main block must express the same continuity established by the historic structures. Roof pitch is shallow and is different from nearby buildings. Eaves and rakes are also shallow.*

*4. Materials*

*The building materials that are visible from the public right-of-way should be consistent with the colors, textures, proportions, and combinations of cladding materials traditionally used in Brewer's Hill. The physical composition of the materials may be different from that of the historic materials, but the same appearance should be maintained.*

To staff's knowledge, there is no vertical siding in the district. Doors do not appear to be wood nor are they believable as a wood appearance. A roof vent is not proportioned to the details of the structure and is unpainted.

Living with History

Doors are of a style specifically prohibited in the text. Non-wood windows are also specifically prohibited. Windows are not wood and have unnecessary muntins of a pattern not common to the time period of the district.

**Recommendation**

Recommend HPC Denial

**Conditions**

**Previous HPC action**

A sampling of cases where use of Smartside was denied in Brewers Hill for garages in 2018, file numbers:  
180822, 180807, 171822, 171821

**Previous Council action**