



City of Milwaukee

200 E. Wells Street
Milwaukee, Wisconsin
53202

Meeting Minutes HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

RANDY BRYANT, CHAIR
Allyson Nemec, Vice-Chair
Patricia Balon, Ald. Robert Bauman, Matt Jarosz, Ann Pieper
Eisenbrown and Blair Williams
Staff Assistant, Chris Lee, 286-2232, Fax: 286-3456,
clee@milwaukee.gov
HPC Planners: Carlen Hatala, 286-5722,
chatal@milwaukee.gov; Paul Jakubovich, 286-5712,
pjakub@milwaukee.gov

Monday, November 7, 2011

3:00 PM

Room 301-B, City Hall

Meeting convened at 3:00 p.m.

Present: 5 - Nemec, Pieper Eisenbrown, Jarosz, Bryant, Williams

Excused: 2 - Balon, Bauman

Individuals also present:

Carlen Hatala, Historic Preservation Commission Planner

Paul Jakubovich, Historic Preservation Commission Planner

1. Review and approval of previous minutes of October 10, 2011.

Ms. Nemec moved approval of the previous minutes of October 10, 2011. Seconded by Mr. Williams. There were no objections.

2. [110819](#)

Resolution relating to the permanent historic designation of the Lustron House located at 3645 S. 20th Place for the North Shore Bank.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Ms. Hatala gave background information on the proposed permanent historic designation of the Lustron House. The commission gave interim designation to the property in September. Due to a 90 day requirement, the commission must consider whether or not to recommend permanent historic designation to the property. The house was first nominated for interim designation by Ald. Witkowski's aide after she was told that the property was being dismantled without permits. The partner of the property owner advertised in July and August of this year to sell parts of the home. 16 wall panels and 33 pieces of the roof have been sold.

Ms. Hatala gave descriptions and a history of Lustron houses. For details of Ms. Hatala's descriptions and history of Lustron houses, please refer to the "Permanent Study Report" attached to this file.

Ms. Hatala added that at its September meeting, staff recommended that the Lustron house be given interim historic designation as a City of Milwaukee Historic Structure

as a result of its fulfillment of criteria e-1, e-5, and e-7, of the Historic Preservation Ordinance, Section 320-21 of the Milwaukee Code of Ordinances.

On behalf of the HPC staff, Ms. Hatala did not recommend permanent historic designation of the Lustron House. She said that future restoration or rehabilitation to this partially demolished property was unlikely given its unique construction and materials and its current state of disrepair.

Mr. Williams had the following concerns: the neighborhood is not a historic designated neighborhood; a demolition permit can be obtained even if a permanent historic designation was made given the current status of the house; and cost may be prohibitive to obtain the necessary materials to restore the home.

Mr. Jarosz questioned if the property owner will be fined. Ms. Hatala said that the Department of Neighborhood Services has discussed a fine due to the property owner not obtaining the necessary permits to perform demolition.

Mr. Jarosz said that the Lustron houses in the city do not have historic designation.

Mr. Williams moved to open the hearing to the public. Seconded by Mr. Jarosz. There were no objections.

No neighborhood testimony. The property owners and the local alderman were not present.

Mr. Jarosz moved to close the hearing to the public. Seconded by Ms. Nemeec. There were no objections.

Ms. Nemeec moved approval for the permanent historic designation of the Lustron House located at 3645 S. 20th Place based upon based upon satisfaction of criteria e-1 and e-5, of the Historic Preservation Ordinance, Section 320-21 of the Milwaukee Code of Ordinances. Seconded by Ms. Pieper Eisenbrown. Mr. Bryant, Jarosz, and Williams objected. (Failed 2-3)

Mr. Williams moved denial of the permanent historic designation of the Lustron House located at 3645 S. 20th Place based upon all of the conditions identified by HPC staff and the commissioners. There were no objections. (Prevailed 3-2)

A motion was made by Blair Williams that this Resolution be SUBSTITUTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 3 - Jarosz, Bryant, and Williams

No: 2 - Nemeec, and Pieper Eisenbrown

Excused: 2 - Balon, and Bauman

110819

Substitute resolution denying permanent historic designation of the Lustron House located at 3645 S. 20th Place for the North Shore Bank, in the 13th Aldermanic District.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Blair Williams that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 3 - Jarosz, Bryant, and Williams

No: 2 - Nemec, and Pieper Eisenbrown

Excused: 2 - Balon, and Bauman

3. [110945](#)

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness to install a fence at 2038 N. Bartlett Avenue for the Catholic East Elementary School - Holy Rosary Catholic Church.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Mr. Jakubovich gave a PowerPoint presentation and an overview on the proposed fence installation. The fence will surround a new 110 foot by 60 foot play lot to the east of Catholic East Elementary School along East Windsor Place. The fence will be a metal mesh style fence, six feet in height, with arbor vitae planted about six inches apart around the perimeter. Much of the fence will be obscured by the evergreens. Playground equipment will be installed inside the play lot. The overall plan does a very good job of enclosing the play lot and is compatible with the historic school building next to it, as required by the preservation guidelines.

On behalf of HPC staff, Mr. Jakubovich recommended approval for a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Ms. Nemec moved approval for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install a fence at 2038 N. Bartlett Avenue for the Catholic East Elementary School - Holy Rosary Catholic Church given the requirements of outdoor play and fencing that would go around it in the specific requirements of the project. Seconded by Ms. Pieper Eisenbrown. There were no objections.

A motion was made by Allyson Nemec that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Nemec, Pieper Eisenbrown, Jarosz, Bryant, and Williams

No: 0

Excused: 2 - Balon, and Bauman

4. [110930](#)

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for new windows at 1230 E. Brady Street for Julilly Kohler, agent for JWK Management, LLC.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Mr. Jakubovich gave a PowerPoint presentation and information on the proposed new window installations. The commission looked at an earlier proposal for storefront remodeling on this building in 2008. At that time the commission had concerns that have generally been addressed in this new proposal. A considerable amount of work on the upper half of the storefront has been done, which includes new paint and removal of a large sign. The street level storefront remained intact. The plans are to remove the crossed hatched areas on the sides of the doors and replace them with large storefront windows and bulk heads beneath them. There will be new awnings and entry doors installed. The storefront windows will be returned to their original height featuring large sheets of clear glass topped with a divided transom. The remainder of the brick will be stained to match the top story. The restoration of the original height of the storefront windows is a welcome change.

On behalf of HPC staff, Mr. Jakubovich recommended approval for a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Individuals appearing to testify in support:

*Russ LaFrombois, architect, 229 E. Wisconsin Ave., Suite 701, Milwaukee, WI 53202
Julilly Kohler, property owner, 1158 E. Kane Pl., Milwaukee, WI 53202*

Mr. LaFrombois said that one fixed plate glass window will replace three windows, the storefront is an aluminum system, and the brick will be stained to red.

Ald. Nemec moved approval for a Certificate of Appropriateness for new windows at 1230 E. Brady Street for Julilly Kohler, agent for JWK Management, LLC, as submitted in the drawings. Seconded by Mr. Jarosz. There were no objections.

A motion was made by Allyson Nemec that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Nemec, Pieper Eisenbrown, Jarosz, Bryant, and Williams

No: 0

Excused: 2 - Balon, and Bauman

5. [110373](#)

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for construction of two additions at 2134 N. Terrace Avenue for Michael and Cathy White.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Mr. Jakubovich gave a PowerPoint presentation and an overview on the proposed addition. A one story brick addition is being proposed for the southeast corner and rear of this Mediterranean Villa style home. It will serve to add additional interior living space. This design is a substitute for an earlier plan submitted to HPC in July of this year that featured additions on all four sides of the house. The style of the new addition blends well with the original Mediterranean character of the building. A predominant feature in the addition includes a Mediterranean style chimney, which is a feature of this kind of home. Windows and doors are in proportion to the existing ones found on the building. In terms of details, the gutters would be copper and the shed roof over the doors on the south elevation would be finished with terra cotta tiles to match the original, main roof of the house. Windows should be made of wood on the exterior to replicate the original windows on the house. The new proposal is a considerable reduction. The new plans do not meet zoning codes for the south and east setbacks; however, these issues are not for the commission to consider. There are letters in support and in opposition. Since July, the homeowners have removed the paint and restored the original color of the exterior brick.

On behalf of HPC staff, Mr. Jakubovich recommended approval for a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Individuals appearing to testify in support:

Greg Uhen, Eppstein Uhen Architects

Michael White, property owner

Atty. Bruce Block, Reinhart Boerner Van Deuren Attorneys at Law

Mr. Uhen distributed drawing packets and a support letter to the commission.

Mr. Bryant said that the new fence depicted in Mr. Uhen's drawings should not be considered at this time.

Mr. Bryant asked if HPC staff approves the building material. Mr. Jakubovich replied

that the building material will be mortar with cream brick and the windows replacements be made of wood. Mr. Uhen said that the windows can be replaced.

Individual appearing to testify in opposition:

Donna Neal, Historic Water Tower Neighborhood (HWTN), 2624 E. Bellevue Pl., Milwaukee, WI 53211

Ms. Neal, on behalf of HWTN, testified in opposition to the following: the removal of the garage, historic guidelines being violated, the addition being visible and not sympathetic to elevation, and the setbacks altering the landscape. She added that the addition would threaten the historic designation status and set a precedent for similar projects in the area.

Ald. Nik Kovac, aldermanic district three, appeared at the table with no position on the matter. He left it to the commission to make a decision but wanted for the commission to consider the setback issues and HWTN's position.

Ms. Pieper Eisenbrown asked if HPC staff had any guidelines to keep track of such a project in a district, the consideration of a district as a whole, and the precedent that such a project like this one would create.

Mr. Jakubovich replied that that staff does not have any guidelines. He added that the home is challenged with being a corner home and being visible to two streets. However, the addition has been considerably reduced and will be done at the rear of the home, which is preferable. The addition can set a precedent that can open the door for more significant alterations in the district.

Mr. Bryant said for the commission to consider and evaluate only the facts and merits pertaining to the historical appropriateness of the addition. If approved, this project would not necessarily set a precedent as each project stands on its own merit. The commission considers each project case by case. The North Point Historic District will not be delisted. There are other bodies to consider the setbacks and variance issues.

Mr. Bryant added that the immediate neighbors to the house are in support.

Mr. Williams said that the massing, design, and materials of the addition are appropriate to the structure. He added that variance is a separate issue to be considered by the Board of Zoning Appeals.

Mr. Williams moved approval for the following: a Certificate of Appropriateness for construction of an addition at the rear southeast corner of the house located at 2134 N. Terrace Ave. for Michael and Cathy White; HPC staff to have the authority to approve the subsequent fence addition, provided that it is in compliance with the plans that staff has received; and the replacement of current windows with wood windows that comply with staff's recommendations in the event that the home owners choose to replace the windows. Approval for a Certificate of Appropriateness is based upon the following supporting evidence: the addition further supports and refines the architecture of the existing building; materials are consistent with the historical materials used in the original construction; the owner and architectural team have demonstrated a commitment to protect the historical integrity and to improve the value and character of the building; the one story addition is sensitive and appropriate to the massing; and the project is sensitive to the adjoining neighbor. Seconded by Mr. Jarosz. There were no objections.

Mr. White said that he would like to replace the windows.

A motion was made by Blair Williams that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Nemec, Pieper Eisenbrown, Jarosz, Bryant, and Williams

No: 0

Excused: 2 - Balon, and Bauman

6. [110897](#)

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior renovations at 1139 East Knapp Street for the Lynde and Harry Bradley Foundation.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Mr. Jakubovich gave a PowerPoint presentation and an overview on the proposed exterior renovations on the Bloodgood house. It is one half of a double house called the Bloodgood-Hawley house, and this building arrangement is rare in the city. The house was designed with French Chateau architecture, which was a popular design from the late 1890s to 1905 for very fine homes. Plans for restoration include new cotta tiled roofing, replacement of deteriorated sheet metal work, restored wood windows, removal of errant rain gutters, and work on dormers to match the original. The major proposal is for an addition to the rear and backyard of the building in place of the existing two story frame addition, which would be removed. The addition is set back from the property line and sidewalk, and it will be separated from the main house by a ribbon glass curtain wall. The dormer on the rear building and the three story flat roof tower would be incorporated into the addition. Restoration would be done on the exterior of the rest of the house with no alterations.

On behalf of HPC staff, Mr. Jakubovich recommended approval for a Certificate of Appropriateness with the following conditions: HPC have the authority to review and approve brick sample panels and roof tiles before installation of these materials.

*Individuals appearing to testify in support:
Steve Wellenstein, AIA Uihlein/Wilson Architects
Debra Zins, AIA Uihlein/Wilson Architects*

Mr. Jarosz questioned about the purpose of the glass curtain wall on the west elevation. Mr. Wellenstein and Ms. Zins both replied that the purpose is to expose the stairs and make it fire complaint.

Mr. Williams moved approval for staff recommendation of a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior renovations at 1139 East Knapp Street for the Lynde and Harry Bradley Foundation. Seconded by Ms. Pieper Eisenbrown. There were no objections.

Ms. Eisenbrown left the commission meeting at 5 p.m.

A motion was made by Blair Williams that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Nemec, Pieper Eisenbrown, Jarosz, Bryant, and Williams

No: 0

Excused: 2 - Balon, and Bauman

7. **Review of the nominations and selection of recipients for the Cream of the Cream City Preservation Awards.**

Ms. Hatala presented a 2010 ballot, which was distributed to commissioners:

*The ballot contained the following nominations:
Neighborhood Improvement Development Corp. (NIDC)
2445 S. Kinnickinnic Ave., Dr. William A. Batchelor House
2432 W. Kilbourn Ave. - Kalvelage House.
2909 E. Newberry Boulevard - Carl A. Miller House
618 W. Pierce St.
2134 N. Sherman Boulevard - Dr. Franklin Hambach House
1105-1107 N. Old World Third St.*

Ms. Nemeč left the commission meeting at 5:12 p.m. Meeting adjourned at 5:12 p.m. due to a lack of quorum.

8. **Announcements and Updates.**

Meeting adjourned prior to this agenda item.

9. **The following files represent staff approved certificates of appropriateness:**

Mr. Jarosz moved approval of the staff approved Certificates of Appropriateness. Seconded by Mr. Williams. There were no objections.

- a. [110847](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness to install a new iron fence at 920 N. 34th Street for Mark and Vicki Natwick.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Nemeč, Jarosz, Bryant, and Williams

No: 0

Excused: 3 - Balon, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Bauman

- b. [110854](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for tuckpointing at 2030 E. Lafayette Place for Gilbert Petzke.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Nemeč, Jarosz, Bryant, and Williams

No: 0

Excused: 3 - Balon, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Bauman

- c. [110889](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness to install a new boiler and

venting at 3041 N. Sherman Blvd. for Martha Monroe.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Nemec, Jarosz, Bryant, and Williams

No: 0

Excused: 3 - Balon, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Bauman

- d. [110902](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for installation of a new sign at 616 W. Historic Mitchell Street for Walid Mousa.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Nemec, Jarosz, Bryant, and Williams

No: 0

Excused: 3 - Balon, Pieper Eisenbrown, and Bauman

Meeting adjourned at 5:12 p.m.
Chris Lee, Staff Assistant

This meeting can be viewed in its entirety through the City's Legislative Research Center at <http://milwaukee.legistar.com/calendar>.