

Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date: 6/2/2025 Staff reviewer: Andrew Stern CCF #250059 Ald. Brower

Property 1419-1419A E. Brady St.

Brady Street Historic District

Owner/Applicant FALA7 Investments, LLC c/o Ihsan Atta PO Box 638 Milwaukee, WI 53201

Proposal

The applicant is seeking after-the-fact approval for window replacement, a new metal fence, and replacement of two sets of side entry steps with new concrete steps, concrete landing stoop, and a new deck.

Staff comments

The Peter Her/Strick's Hardware Building is a front gabled residential structure constructed in 1892 with commercial addition added to the front of the building in 1903. In March 2024, the property owner received a violation for new patio, stairs, and concrete work without a permit. The property owner received an additional violation for peeling paint and vinyl window replacement in March 2025. The work noted in the violations appears to have occurred sometime between 2020 and 2022.

The preservation guidelines for Brady Street state to "retain original material, whenever possible" and that "if replacement of window sash or doors is necessary, the replacement should duplicate the appearance and design of the original window sash or door." The applicant has provided no evidence the historic wood sash one-over-one windows were deteriorated beyond repair. All windows on the second story have been replaced with vinyl windows. A vinyl horizontal sliding window was installed on the rear of the building. Vinyl windows have never been approved by HPC and are not appropriate for the historic district. Staff recommends all vinyl windows be replaced with solid wood sash one-over-one windows.

The new concrete steps and landing replaced basic wooden steps and a small grassy lawn. The landing/lawn is located between the subject property and a concrete block wall of the neighboring property and was small and minimally useful.

The deck addition replaces a small wooden entry stoop. The steps and stoop were modest in design and there is minimal photographic evidence about the entry looked like historically. The deck is visible from the right-of-way but is tucked between the subject building and neighboring property. The deck is constructed of a composite wood material. The guidelines for materials in new construction state:

The building materials that are visible from the public right-of-way should be consistent with the colors, textures, proportions, and combinations of cladding materials traditionally used in the Brady Street Historic District. The physical composition of the materials may be different from that of the historic materials, but the same appearance should be maintained.

The physical composition of the deck is different than wood that had traditionally been used but the color, textures, and proportions are consistent with the historic district. Staff recommends approval. The applicant will need to apply for a retroactive permit for the deck.

A new metal picket fence replaces a smaller metal fence above the raised landing. Staff finds the replacement metal picket fence design acceptable and recommends approval. The applicant also will need to apply for a retroactive permit for the fence.

Recommendation

Recommend HPC Approval of the deck, concrete work, and fence. Recommend denial of the vinyl windows, with replacement with solid wood sash one-over-one windows.

Conditions

Previous HPC action

Previous Council action