



Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date: 2/13/2017
Ald. Milele Coggs District: 6
Staff reviewer: Tim Askin
PTS #114209

Property 1919 N. 2ND ST. Brewers Hill Historic District

Owner/Applicant MIDWEST COMMERCIAL FUNDING LLC
1521 WAUKESHA RD
CALEDONIA WI 53108
Kozitecture
12320 W Waterford Av
Greenfield, WI

Proposal Applicant proposes to construct a new two-car garage at the alley behind the existing house.

Staff comments The construction date of the existing masonry house at this address has not been researched at this point. At one time, there were two sheds and a substantial barn on the premises as well. We do know it predates 1890. Its current appearance as a bungalow is due to the full-length porch that was added by the time of the 1910 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map. The rear frame additions were added after 1920 and are currently being reconstructed due to structural conditions discovered during a previously approved whole house renovation. The rear of the lot has been used as surface parking with no garage since at least the 1960s.

The proposal is a new construction two-car garage at the rear of the lot, facing the alley. The proposal is a very simple rectangular design with a front gable (8/12 pitch) over the overhead garage doors and a service door on the side. It will measure 24' x 20', narrow side facing the alley with a setback of 4' from the alley. The garage has many of our required features such as corner boards and a water table that have been required of new construction garages. Garage door will be embossed steel, creating a paneled effect. A similar door type was approved by this commission in Brewers Hill in December. Service door is fiberglass with a four-panel design. Side walls are just over 9' in height, which is lower than the 10' standard commonly adopted by the commission, 10' should be encouraged, but staff is not requiring it. Additionally, some sort of fenestration should be encouraged.

LP SMARTSIDE IS NOT GP SIDING, INVOLVED IN CLASS ACTION LAWSUIT. LP SMARTSIDE IS A NEW FORMULATION. I HAVE BEEN USING IT FOR OVER 15 YEARS WITHOUT AN ISSUE. I DISAGREE WITH YOUR ASCERTION.

3/13/2018 Koz

Siding is proposed as LP Smartside with a 4" reveal. It is an engineered wood product of chips, glues, and resins first introduced in 1990 and reformulated under the current name in 1997 after a class action lawsuit regarding longevity of the product. ~~The~~ product is maintenance heavy and difficult to install correctly due to the requirement that no portion of the wood material is rated for environmental exposure. All nail holes and cut edges must be caulked and painted to prevent rot. Staff strongly opposes the use of this material.

The proposals for the garages at 1919 and 1923 are identical, excepting door choice and side setbacks.

Recommendation

Recommend HPC Approval with conditions

Conditions

Siding should be changed to a cementitious board or natural rot-resistant wood, both in a smooth finish. Site photos and final product specifications must also be submitted for staff approval before issuance of the COA. Gutters should also be required to match those existing on the house whether K-type, half-round, or other.