



Department of Employee Relations

Tom Barrett
Mayor

Maria Monteagudo
Director

Michael Brady
Employee Benefits Director

Deborah Ford
Labor Negotiator

October 21, 2016

To the Honorable
The Committee on Finance and Personnel
Common Council
City of Milwaukee

Dear Committee Members:

Re: Common Council File Number 160706

The following classification and pay recommendations were approved by the City Service Commission on **October 11, 2016**.

In the Department of City Development and the Common Council – City Clerk’s Office, pay recommendations for the various levels of Planner positions were recommended.

The job evaluation reports covering the above positions, including the necessary Salary and Positions Ordinance amendments, is attached.

Sincerely,



Maria Monteagudo
Employee Relations Director

MM:fcw

Attachments: Job Evaluation Report
Fiscal Note

C: Mark Nicolini, Dennis Yaccarino, John Ledvina, Nicole Fleck, Jackie Carter, Monique Lofton, James Owczarski, Richard Marcoux, Martha Brown, David Schroeder, Lori Schmidt, Vanessa Koster, Kristin Connley, Edward Richardson, Janet Grau, Robert Harris, Monica Wauck, Nolan Zaroff, and Kyle Gast



JOB EVALUATION REPORT

City Service Commission Meeting: October 11, 2016

**CITY DEVELOPMENT
COMMON COUNCIL-CITY CLERK**

Current	Request	Recommendation
City Development		
Principal Planner PR 2HX (\$54,865 - \$76,806) Two Positions	Study	Principal Planner PR 2JX (\$62,338 - \$87,270) FN: Recruitment is at \$70,334 Two Positions
Senior Planner-Architectural Design PR 2FN (\$55,963 - \$67,616) One Position	Study	Senior Planner-Architectural Design PR 2HN (\$54,865 - \$76,806) FN: Recruitment is at \$60,000 One Position
Senior Planner PR 2FN (\$55,963 - \$67,616) Three Positions	Study	Senior Planner PR 2HN (\$54,865 - \$76,806) FN: Recruitment is at \$60,000 Three Positions
Associate Planner PR 2DN (\$47,779 - \$59,498) One Position	Study	Associate Planner PR 2EN (\$45,306 - \$63,426) FN: Recruitment is at \$51,358 and may be up to \$58,373 with the approval of DER One Position
Common Council - City Clerk		
Senior Planner PR 2FN (\$55,963 - \$67,616) Two Positions	Study	Senior Planner PR 2HN (\$54,865 - \$76,806) FN: Recruitment is at \$60,000 Two Positions

Actions Required

In the Salary Ordinance,
 Under Pay Range 2DN, delete the title "Associate Planner";
 Under Pay Range 2EN, add the title "Associate Planner (1)";
 Under Pay Range 2FN, delete the titles "Senior Planner" and "Senior Planner – Architectural Design" and delete footnote "3" in its entirety";
 Under Pay Range 2HN, add the title "Senior Planner (15)" with footnote "15" to read: "(15) Recruitment is at \$2,307.70 (\$60,000.20).";
 Under Pay Range 2HX, delete the title "Principal Planner"; and
 Under pay Range 2JX, add the title "Principal Planner (3)" with footnote "3" to read: "(3) Recruitment is at \$2,705.16 (\$70,334.16)."

Background

In February of this year, we received a request from the Commissioner of City Development, Rocky Marcoux, to conduct a pay study of Associate Planner, Senior Planner, and Principal Planner, stating his concerns that the Department of City Development (DCD) would not be able to attract and retain the talent required to carry out needed urban planning work due to the inadequacy of the City's pay ranges. This is a pressing concern because several

Planners are eligible for retirement. Citing data from the American Planning Association, he indicated that DCD Planners are paid several thousand dollars less than the median for similarly situated municipal planners. In addition to a detailed cover letter, the Department also provided the following documents with its request:

- Job descriptions for positions
- 2016 APA/AICP Planners Salary Survey
- Two job announcements for Planners from the City of Madison
- A job announcement for a Planner from the City of Chicago
- A list of Planners with current salary, years of experience, degrees conferred, and credentials earned

In addition, there are two Senior Planner positions assigned to the Historic Preservation Commission in the Common Council – City Clerk's Office included in this study.

Duties and Responsibilities

Principal Planner – DCD – Two Positions

One Principal Planner in DCD manages and coordinates the review of issues submitted primarily to the City Plan Commission, serving as a liaison between the Common Council, City Plan Commission, and members of the public. The other Principal Planner manages and coordinates the review of issues primarily related to the Board of Zoning Appeals, also serving as a liaison in these matters between the Common Council, Board of Appeals, and members of the public.

Senior Planner – Architectural Design – DCD - One Position

The Senior Planner- Architectural Design provides design and technical services, specializing in architectural design review. One noteworthy area of responsibility is preparing comprehensive plans, neighborhood action plans and similar studies that include all aspects of plan preparation.

Senior Planner - DCD – Three Positions

Two Senior Planners in DCD are responsible for the preparation and update of citywide, area, and neighborhood plans, redevelopment plans and studies related to the development and redevelopment projects. The third Senior Planner in this department specializes in using GIS technology to capture, store, manipulate, analyze, manage, and present spatial and geographical data.

Senior Planner – Common Council-City Clerk – Two Positions

Two Senior Planners in the Common Council-City Clerk's Office perform a variety of planning duties and responsibilities regarding historic preservation issues and staff the Historic Preservation Commission. One of these positions is currently vacant.

The minimum requirement to enter the profession of urban and regional planner is a master's degree in urban and regional planning. The City of Milwaukee's most recent job announcement for a Senior Planner states that a bachelor's degree in urban planning and two years of professional work experience in the field is required, which is the equivalent of a master's degree.

Due to the fact that this study only concerns the pay level of these jobs, the type of discussion usually found in job evaluation reports regarding changes in duties and responsibilities, level of responsibility exercised, and degree of knowledge/skill required is not present in this report. This report instead uses pay information from several different sources to determine whether pay levels for this group are sufficient to attract and retain qualified talent.

Salary Data

The first source of data was provided by the Department of City Development from the American Institute of Planners (APA) and American Institute of Certified Planners (AICP) published in January of 2016. This survey was conducted

by Readex Research of Stillwater, Minnesota. The company sent 28,856 surveys to APA members via email and received 11,393 completed surveys. Because this survey involves employees self-reporting their own salary data, we did not rely exclusively upon this data, but did take it into consideration. The most relevant portion of the survey is presented below.

**Salaries for Urban and Regional Planners
APA/AICP Salary Survey
Published January, 2016**

	No. of Respondents	Percentile		
		25 th	50 th	75 th
Wisconsin	183	\$59,200	\$71,300	\$85,000
Midwest-East North Central Census Region	1,111	\$56,000	\$71,300	\$92,300
Milwaukee Metro Area	40	\$60,100	\$70,900	\$85,100

The data mostly reflects public sector employers. Higher salaries correlate positively to larger employers, higher levels of education (BS, MS, PhD), and greater work experience. The East North Central Census Region includes Wisconsin, Michigan, Illinois, Indiana, and Ohio.

The U.S. Department of Labor's Bureau of Labor Statistics provides a second source of data, as presented in the table below.

**Salaries for Urban and Regional Planners
Milwaukee, Waukesha, West Allis Metropolitan Area
US Department of Labor, Bureau of Labor Statistics
May, 2015**

	10 th Percentile	25 th Percentile	50 th Percentile	75 th Percentile	90 th Percentile
Milwaukee, Waukesha, West Allis	\$44,710	\$52,710	\$73,510	\$107,520	\$122,280

N=110

Percentage of error=5.8%

The third source of data is from the Economic Research Institute (ERI), an organization that provides compensation services and maintains a large proprietary database of salaries. The Department of Employee Relations subscribes to this service. The following table shows salaries reported at benchmark percentiles and the average (mean) rate of pay for entry-level planners, intermediate level planners, and most experienced planners within a 50-mile radius of Milwaukee.

**Salaries for Urban and Regional Planners by Levels of Experience
50 Mile Radius from Milwaukee
ERI - September 22, 2016**

	10 th Percentile	25 th Percentile	Mean	75 th Percentile	90 th Percentile
Most Experienced Planner	\$66,131	\$71,067	\$77,563	\$83,881	\$90,215
Intermediate-Level Planner	\$56,093	\$60,124	\$65,497	\$70,686	\$75,948
Entry Level Planner	\$47,816	\$51,082	\$55,504	\$59,741	\$64,097

Annualized Salary Trend: 2.7%

These levels roughly correspond to Associate Planner, Senior Planner and Principal Planner for the City of Milwaukee. As may be noted, these reported salaries are lower than those reported by the APA/AICP and Bureau of Labor Statistics.

In comparing the City of Milwaukee's pay ranges with the three salary surveys, it is our determination that the City's rates of pay are not competitive with the local market and therefore recommend an adjustment in pay levels for the job classifications of Planners in City government.

In determining appropriate pay ranges for these jobs the following considerations were used:

- the labor market for urban and regional planners is roughly defined as Southeastern Wisconsin
- salaries for this group should neither lead the labor market nor fall substantially behind the labor market
- recommendations should enhance City government's recruitment and retention of talent
- recommendations must be fiscally conservative

The application of these principles led to the following recommendations for new pay ranges for this group.

Title	Current			Recommendation		
	Pay Range	Minimum Recruitment Rate	Maximum	Pay Range	Minimum Recruitment Rate	Maximum
Principal Planner	2HX	\$54,865	\$76,806	2JX	\$70,334	\$87,270
Senior Planner-Architectural Design	2FN	\$55,963	\$67,616	2HN	\$60,000	\$76,806
Senior Planner	2FN	\$55,963	\$67,616	2HN	\$60,000	\$76,806
Associate Planner	2DN	\$47,779	\$59,498	2EN	\$51,358	\$63,426


The recommended appointment rate of \$51,358 is the same as the appointment rate for Civil Engineer I. We further recommend, the same as for Civil Engineer I, that recruitment may be up to \$58,373 with the approval of the Department of Employee Relations. This will provide DCD with the same flexibility in appointing an Associate Planner as afforded in the appointment of entry-level Civil Engineers, which are located primarily in the Department of Public Works.

It should be noted that the Salary Ordinance provides flexibility in recruitment for these jobs. An employee in any of these Planner job classifications may be hired or promoted to a position that is up to 60% of the range with the approval of the Employee Relations Director and Chair of the Finance and Personnel Committee.

If these recommendations are approved, affected employees, per the Salary Ordinance, will receive a 7% or 10% pay increase depending on the classification, or be moved to the minimum of the new pay range, whichever is greater.

Prepared By: 
Laura Sutherland, Human Resources Representative

Reviewed By: 
Andrea Knickerbocker, Human Resources Manager

Reviewed By: 
Maria Monteagudo, Employee Relations Director



City of Milwaukee Fiscal Impact Statement

A	
Date	10/21/16
File Number	160706
Subject	Classification and pay recommendations approved by the City Service Commission on October 11, 2016.

B	
Submitted By (Name/Title/Dept./Ext.)	Sarah Trotter, Human Resources Representative Dept. of Employee Relations/X2398.

C	
This File	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Increases or decreases previously authorized expenditures. <input type="checkbox"/> Suspends expenditure authority. <input type="checkbox"/> Increases or decreases city services. <input type="checkbox"/> Authorizes a department to administer a program affecting the city's fiscal liability. <input type="checkbox"/> Increases or decreases revenue. <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Requests an amendment to the salary or positions ordinance. <input type="checkbox"/> Authorizes borrowing and related debt service. <input type="checkbox"/> Authorizes contingent borrowing (authority only). <input type="checkbox"/> Authorizes the expenditure of funds not authorized in adopted City Budget.

D	
This Note	<input type="checkbox"/> Was requested by committee chair.

E	
Charge To	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Department Account <input type="checkbox"/> Capital Projects Fund <input type="checkbox"/> Debt Service <input type="checkbox"/> Other (Specify) _____ <input type="checkbox"/> Contingent Fund <input type="checkbox"/> Special Purpose Accounts <input type="checkbox"/> Grant & Aid Accounts

F

Assumptions used in arriving at fiscal estimate.

G

Purpose	Specify Type/Use	Expenditure	Revenue
Salaries/Wages		See attached spreadsheet.	
Supplies/Materials			
Equipment			
Services			
Other			
TOTALS			

H

For expenditures and revenues which will occur on an annual basis over several years check the appropriate box below and then list each item and dollar amount separately.

1-3 Years 3-5 Years

1-3 Years 3-5 Years

1-3 Years 3-5 Years

I

List any costs not included in Sections E and F above.

J

Additional information.

Department of Employee Relations
Fiscal Note Spreadsheet

Finance and Personnel Committee Meeting of October 26, 2016
City Service Commission Meeting of October 11, 2016

NEW COST FOR 2016

No. Pos.	Dept	From	PR	To	PR	Present Annual	New Annual	New Cost	Rollup	Total Rollup+ Sal
1	City Development	Principal Planner	2HX	Principal Planner	2JX	\$79,802	\$85,388	\$645	\$110	\$754
1	City Development	Principal Planner	2HX	Principal Planner	2JX	\$63,687	\$70,334	\$767	\$130	\$897
1	City Development	Senior Planner - Architectural Design	2FN	Senior Planner-Architectural Design	2HN	\$68,805	\$73,621	\$556	\$94	\$650
1	City Development	Senior Planner	2FN	Senior Planner	2HN	\$62,181	\$66,534	\$502	\$85	\$588
1	City Development	Senior Planner	2FN	Senior Planner	2HN	\$58,702	\$62,811	\$474	\$81	\$555
1	City Development	Senior Planner	2FN	Senior Planner	2HN	\$55,963	\$60,000	\$466	\$79	\$545
1	City Development	Associate Planner	2DN	Associate Planner	2EN	\$49,819	\$53,307	\$402	\$68	\$471
1	Common Council-City Clerk	Senior Planner	2FN	Senior Planner	2HN	\$68,805	\$73,621	\$556	\$94	\$650
1	Common Council-City Clerk	Senior Planner	2FN	Senior Planner	2HN	\$54,590	\$58,411	\$454	\$77	\$532
9								\$4,822	\$820	\$5,642

Assume effective date is Pay Period 25, 2016 (November 20, 2016)

COSTS FOR FULL YEAR

No. Pos.	Dept	From	PR	To	PR	Present Annual	New Annual	New Cost	Rollup	Total Rollup+ Sal
1	City Development	Principal Planner	2HX	Principal Planner	2JX	\$79,802	\$85,388	\$5,586	\$950	\$6,536
1	City Development	Principal Planner	2HX	Principal Planner	2JX	\$63,687	\$70,334	\$6,647	\$1,130	\$7,777
1	City Development	Senior Planner - Architectural Design	2FN	Senior Planner-Architectural Design	2HN	\$68,805	\$73,621	\$4,816	\$819	\$5,635
1	City Development	Senior Planner	2FN	Senior Planner	2HN	\$62,181	\$66,534	\$4,353	\$740	\$5,093
1	City Development	Senior Planner	2FN	Senior Planner	2HN	\$58,702	\$62,811	\$4,109	\$699	\$4,808
1	City Development	Senior Planner	2FN	Senior Planner	2HN	\$55,963	\$60,000	\$4,037	\$686	\$4,723
1	City Development	Associate Planner	2DN	Associate Planner	2EN	\$49,819	\$53,307	\$3,488	\$593	\$4,081
1	Common Council-City Clerk	Senior Planner	2FN	Senior Planner	2HN	\$68,805	\$73,621	\$4,816	\$819	\$5,635
1	Common Council-City Clerk	Senior Planner	2FN	Senior Planner	2HN	\$54,590	\$58,411	\$3,938	\$670	\$4,608
9								\$41,790	\$7,104	\$48,895

Totals may not be to the exact dollar due to rounding.