



Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date: 12/11/2017

Ald. Nik Kovac District: 3

Staff reviewer: Tim Askin

PTS #114424 CCF #171152

Property 1311 E. BRADY ST.

Owner/Applicant PATRICIA A CATALDO
INCOME TRUST
2108 N NEWHALL ST
MILWAUKEE WI 53202

Daniel G Beyer
Dan Beyer Architects
225 E St Paul suite 303
Milwaukee, WI 53202
Phone: (414) 239-8267

Proposal Extend existing rooftop deck forward to 18" behind facade of primary building. Structure to be built on square columns with detailed trimwork leading up to blank wall of second story. Construction will be all wood with a beadboard ceiling to the lower, open area. Upper level will be unroofed. Sheet metal flashing and coping are proposed where needed. Total area of the new second level floor area will be approximately 140 sq. ft.

The original, and now alternate, proposal includes two single pane fixed windows with square trim on the second level.

Windows, if required by the Commission, are preferred to be inoperable due to safety and insurance concerns relating to the property's use as a bar.

Staff comments

The Jo-Cat's Pub building is a front-gable house dating to the 1870s that was long ago converted to commercial use on the Brady Street commercial strip.

Staff is supportive of the lower level of the construction the design, detailing, and materials are in keeping with the character of the district. The columns will also provide better cover for the dumpster stored in this area.

Staff cannot support the blank wall on the upper level or the single pane windows with dimensional lumber square trim. Windows on Brady Street have been traditionally present on all occupied floors, double-hung, and vertically oriented. Further, as an addition, it needs to harmonize strongly with the primary building and surrounding building and such features are more necessary for compatibility than with new construction. (Guidelines A.3.b. Windows, A.5. Additions, A.6. Alterations to non-historic additions; B.1 Streetscapes; [C].2-4 new construction).

Brady Street Guidelines

B. Guidelines for Streetscapes

The visual character of the streetscapes in the district is maintained by the general consistency of the blockfaces in terms of height, scale, siting, and density. This has resulted in a compact, cohesive building stock with relatively few intrusions that detract from the district's historic character.

1. Maintain the height, scale, mass, and materials established by the buildings in the district and the traditional setback and density of the block faces. Avoid introducing elements that are incompatible in terms of siting, materials, height, or scale.

Staff comments

A. 3. Windows and Doors

b. Respect the stylistic period or periods a building represents....Avoid using modern style window units such as horizontal sliding sash in place of double-hung sash or the substitution of units with glazing configurations not appropriate to the style of the building.

A.5. Additions

Make additions that harmonize with the existing building architecturally and are located so as not visible from the public right-of-way, if at all possible. Avoid making additions that are unsympathetic to the original structure and visually intrude upon the principal elevations.

A.6. Non-Historic Additions/Non-Historic Structures

Alterations to non-historic buildings or portions of buildings shall be made in such a way as to be as sympathetic as possible to the historic building or neighboring buildings. If possible, alterations to these structures should seek to lessen the adverse impact of the non-historic addition or building on the historic components of the structure or district.

[C]. Guidelines for New Construction

C.2. Scale

Overall building height and bulk; the expression of major building divisions including foundation, body and roof; and, individual building components such as porches, overhangs and fenestration must be compatible with the surrounding structures.

C.3. Form

The massing of new construction must be compatible with the surrounding buildings. The profiles of roofs and building elements that project and recede from the main block must express the same continuity established by the historic structures.

4. Materials

The building materials that are visible from the public right-of-way should be consistent with the colors, textures, proportions, and combinations of cladding materials traditionally used in the Brady Street Historic District. The physical composition of the materials may be different from that of the historic materials, but the same appearance should be maintained.

Staff recommends holding the proposal for further revision or directing the applicant to include one to three false windows in the upper level with a center sash bar and historically appropriate trim. The windows should not be operable.

Recommendation

Hold for revisions or refer to staff for approval per conditions below

Conditions

1. One to three simulated double-hung windows on the second story with sash divider bar and historically appropriate trim.
2. Windows should be narrower than the original proposal.
3. A horizontal window would not be appropriate nor would a Chicago-style three-part window.

Previous HPC action

Previous Council action