



Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date: 9/1/2020
Ald. Milele Coggs District: 6
Staff reviewer: Tim Askin
PTS #115001 CCF #200530

| | | |
|------------------------|--|---|
| Property | 1911 N. 2ND ST. | Brewers Hill HD |
| Owner/Applicant | CAROL STORM SURVIVOR'S TR 9423 W HAWTHORN RD MEQUON WI 53097 | Amy Carman Design 9810 Echelon Ln Wauwatosa, WI 53226 |

Proposal

Construct new combined Garage and an accessible studio apartment at the rear of the property where there is now a parking pad. The proposal is for a 44.5' wide by 30' deep U-shaped building at the rear of the lot. The building is one-story with two 8:12 gable defining the separate uses with a courtyard in the U. The roof pitches match those on the house.

Staff comments

The design effort is good and overall seems to suit the site, although it is rather large.

Brewers Hill Guidelines

1. Siting. The new building is built to the maximum possible width on the site. While this has happened before in Brewers Hill, it is not common. Applicants request a 4' setback for the building, essentially treating it as a garage. The minimum setback for a residential structure is 15'. Staff did indicate to the architect that they would support a setback less than 15', but likely more than 4'. The minimum of 4' is only practical when there is garage with the same minimum setback of 4' directly opposite and the few garages on this block have a setback more than 4'. Back houses, are, however, built to the alley line with no setback. Additionally, there is a fence opposite at less than 4' setback which will severely impact the turning radius. In order to match the character of the block and for the practical matter of the turning radius, staff recommends requiring a minimum 6' setback.
2. Scale. Height and bulk, major building divisions, etc. Base middle and top are generally identifiable usually.
3. Form, parts that project and recede. The shape is probably unique in the district, but the design generally fits. A more substantial porch as required by the design overlay should be seriously considered.
4. Materials are to be "Consistent with the colors, textures, proportions, and combinations of cladding materials traditionally used in Brewer's Hill." New residential construction in Brewers Hill has consistently be required to be real wood siding with all wood windows. This has been applied to garages where they are street visible. The application generally indicates that this will be true, but more specifics are needed. Standing seam metal for the porch roof is a concern and rarely allowed. It may be acceptable to the Commission as a minor feature and a nod to current design trends.

Several dimensional variances are required for this proposal under the Harambee/Brewers Hill conservation overlay. I enumerate them to match the guidelines.

1. Height, between 30-40 feet and 1.5-2.5 stories. Not met, but perhaps not realistic for this use case.
2. Roof pitch between 8:12 and 12:12. Met.
3. Raised basement of 2.5-3' above grade. The building appears is designed as slab on grade. This criterion is not met but doing so would defeat the purpose of having an accessible unit.
4. Porches. The area under the porch roof is approximately 4' x 6' rather than the minimum required 6'x6' and it has no posts, railing, or skirting. A concrete patio does extend 6' forward of the front French doors.
5. Front facing windows to be a minimum of 5.5' tall and gable ends must have windows. The front-facing portions that are likely to be street-visible have 8' full-light French doors. The three windows that

face the street direction are not that height but face the kitchen counters or garage interior. Side windows facing south into the U are the required height. Staff feels the intent of this criterion is met.

Staff have been informed that there is a property line dispute on the south side of the property. This new building is designed for the minimum setback for that side of the property, so design modifications may be required as a result.

Overall staff believe there is a good concept here, but there are significant zoning issues that are likely to impact the final design.

Recommendation Approve with conditions or Hold

- Conditions**
1. Change rear setback to 6'.
 2. Add posts to porch and build out some degree of enclosing railing for it.
 3. All siding to be clear-grain wood with a maximum 6" overlap.
 4. Provide all material and fence details to staff for review and approval.

**Previous HPC
action**

**Previous Council
action**