



Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date: 7/6/2020

Ald. Marina Dimitrijevic District: 14

Staff reviewer: Tim Askin

PTS #114976 CCF #200260

Property	2590 S. SUPERIOR ST.	
Owner/Applicant	BAY VIEW HISTORICAL SOCIETY 2590 S SUPERIOR ST MILWAUKEE WI 53207	NOFFKE ROOFING COMPANY 10341 N GRANVILLE RD MEQUON, WI 53097 Phone: 2622425320
Proposal	Replace roof with Pabco Cascade, Signature Cut, Diamond Shaped A-R, a fiberglass composite shingle, four colors are available. As an alternate Rheinzink diamond-shaped zinc panels are proposed; only a bare metal finish is available. Replace gutters with new zinc half-round gutters.	
Staff comments	<p>The Bayview Historical Society has taken the position that the present diamond asbestos shingles have become a character-defining feature of the property. After some research, this appears to be a reasonable position. Fire insurance maps indicate that a noncombustible roof was installed sometime between 1910 and 1937. Given the known longevity of cement-asbestos roofs, this may be the present roof.</p> <p>As noted earlier, four colors are available in the Pabco Diamond shingle: Antique Black, Cambrian Slate, Oakwood, and Pewter Gray. Guidelines for the property specifically prohibit black. Cambrian slate is too imitative of slate for it to be appropriate for a house that originally had cedar shingles. This leaves the two options of Oakwood and Pewter Gray.</p> <p>The metal roof proposal, while a fine material, would have been outside the financial means of the Brinton family and improbable on any home in 19th century Bayview.</p>	
Recommendation	Recommend HPC Approval of fiberglass shingles in the Oakwood or Pewter colors. Recommend denial of metal roof.	
Conditions	<ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Remove skylight from rear as it is in poor condition.2. Deny metal roof3. Select between Oakwood and Pewter colors.4. Standard roof project conditions <p>No dormers, chimneys, moldings parapets, or other permanent features will be altered or removed. No box vents, if used, will be visible from the street. If they are installed, they must be on a rear slope not visible from the street and they must be painted to blend with the color of the roofing material. A continuous ridge vent can be installed in place of box vents, but the vent must extend across the entire ridge and not stop short. Built-in rain gutters will be retained and sealed where needed. Valleys must be metal W-shape with no interweaving of shingles. Valleys and flashing must be painted or factory-finished to match the roofing color, unless copper. When installing new flashing at a masonry feature, the flashing must be stepped or cut into the mortar joints. The bricks may not be cut to install flashing at an angle.</p> <p>We strongly recommend that that the Wisconsin Historical Society's best practices for re-roofing be used to extend the life of your new roof. (Synthetic underlayment is an acceptable alternative to 30lb felt.)</p> <p>https://www.wisconsinhistory.org/Records/Article/CS4260</p>	