



Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date: 5/6/2019
Ald. Milele Coggs District: 6
Staff reviewer: Tim Askin
PTS #114709 CCF # 181839

Property 217 W. RESERVOIR AV. Brewers Hill HD

Owner/Applicant SUZANNE GREINERT Jamison Klinkner
JAMISON KLINKNER 217 W Reservoir Ave
217 W RESERVOIR AV Milwaukee, WI 53212
MILWAUKEE WI 53212 Phone: (608) 215-9050

Proposal Add shed dormer to east elevation of home. Add windows to east elevation of prior addition to home. Install new slider doors on south of prior addition.

Staff comments The primary component of this project is a shed dormer addition. This is complicated and difficult to approve. The house already has a substantial 25' x 12' addition dating to 1972 with a low pitched roof. The design of this previous addition could not be approved under the standards established at the historic district's creation in 1985.

The proposed addition is visible and has a low roof pitch. It appears to violate a number of the guidelines in the historic preservation ordinance as well as the Harambee/Brewers Hill zoning overlay.

Historic Preservation Ordinance

g-1. Whether the proposed work would destroy or adversely affect any exterior architectural feature of the improvement upon which the work is to be done or adversely affect the external appearance of other improvements on the site or within the district

g-3. Whether, in the case of any property located in a historic district, the proposed alteration, reconstruction, rehabilitation or new construction conforms to the objectives of the historic preservation plan for the district as duly adopted by the common council. [In this case this refers us to the zoning overlay.]

DEVELOPMENT AND DESIGN STANDARDS FOR THE BREWERS HILL AND HARAMBEE NEIGHBORHOOD CONSERVATION OVERLAY DISTRICT

2. Roof pitch -On new construction, the roof pitch must be between 8:12 and 12:12. On expansions, the pitch of the new roof must be consistent with the existing roof pitches.

This pitch does not match and would therefore require additional variances.

Brewers Hill Guidelines

Guidelines for New Construction

It is important that additional new construction be designed so as to harmonize with the character of the district.

3. Form The massing of new construction must be compatible with the surrounding buildings. The profiles of roofs and building elements that project and recede from the main block must express the same continuity established by the historic structures.

Cumulative effect of multiple additions is an important component of this decision, per National Park Service guidance. "Features and spaces that have been so substantially changed outside the period of significance or are so severely deteriorated as no longer to convey historic character can be more readily altered than those aspects of a property that retain a high degree of integrity."

After evaluating all the applicable criteria, staff regrets that it cannot recommend approval of this addition.

With some clarification on materials and slightly revised spacing between the window units, the new east windows on the 1972 would be acceptable. Recommend that this change be referred to staff for the necessary changes.

Recommendation

Recommend HPC Denial

Conditions

If approved, use all-wood untreated, clear grain exterior materials, including, but not limited to siding, windows, and soffits. Roof to match existing roof materials.

Doors must be hinged.

Previous HPC action

Previous Council action