



Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date: 10/1/2018
Ald. Milele Coggs District: 6
Staff reviewer: Tim Askin
PTS #114623 CCF #180796

Property 204 W. BROWN ST. Brewers Hill HD

Owner/Applicant ROBERT E HOWARD Laura Van Heijningen
204 W BROWN ST 3127 N Newhall St
MILWAUKEE WI 53212 Milwaukee, WI 53211
Phone: (262) 914-4718

Proposal **Windows**
Window work is partially a request for retroactive approval. Alterations have already been performed on three elevations.
1. Replace single front and rear gable peak windows with double windows (windows have been installed, but not yet trimmed)
2. Add new window openings on east elevation and eliminate some on east elevation.
3. Replace all other windows

Additions
4. Demolish rear exterior stairway and balcony
5. Build new rear (north) mudroom addition, the full width of the building with deck on top. Size is 20x12. Add french doors to access deck from second floor.
6. Add cross gable on east elevation
7. Replace siding as needed with new clear cedar, matching existing 4.25" reveal.

Staff comments **Windows**
1. *Gable peak windows*
Front: A single window was replaced with a double window. Staff feels the new look is disproportionate and the front should be restored to its original size and single window appearance and the trim replicated.
Rear: A single window was replaced with a double window. The simpler design of this secondary elevation makes adding a window here worth consideration; however, the current new windows should not be approved. They cut into the rake board and therefore cannot be appropriately trimmed. Staff recommends requiring a pair of narrower windows with replica original trim, or restore original configuration

2. *East elevation:* Two windows have been added. One has been shortened. One has been lengthened. Staff is neutral on this change as long as original trim is replicated for all the window openings.

3. All windows are or will be JeldWen W 2500 Wood Double Hung 1/1. These are acceptable if a wood storm or screen is installed instead of the default metal-framed screen. The proposed windows are an acceptable type and match the 1-over-1's that were present at the time of acquisition (c. 2007) and for quite some time prior. Staff prefers the optional 3.5" bottom rail in the JeldWen product, but as several windows are already installed, the current proposal could be considered for everything but the front gable peak windows, which should be restored to the original configuration.

Additions

The demolition and addition components of the project have not begun.

4. *Rear Stairs*. Rear deck and stairs are non-original and do not contribute to the character. Their removal should be approved.

5. *Mudroom addition, 20x12*. The rear addition is generally appropriately designed with all necessary details. Ground floor doors are appropriate and windows match the other replacements on the house. French doors will be added to the second floor for access. Staff feels the French doors may be too large, but does not have a strong opinion. The Commission may wish to require a setback along the east elevation (12") to help identify the addition as an addition. There is also a proposal to add a gable ornament to match the front. Staff feels that this elevation is better left plain, but is not strongly opposed.

6. East Cross Gable

Cross gable is proposed at full height of roof and approximately 24' wide. The design is appropriate and proportional, but feels too large. If it is approved, the details should be simplified to differentiate it as an addition. Consider a different shingle pattern from the front gable or use lap siding. Eliminate gable ornament. It should also be centered over the windows below rather than centered on the elevation.

Recommendation

Recommend HPC Approval

Conditions

- A. Require restoration of original configuration of front gable peak window to original size and original trim.
- B. Require restoration of original configuration of rear gable peak window to original size and original trim OR install narrower windows that do not affect the rake boards such as those shown in the drawing.
- C. Restore all rake boards
- D. Consider eliminating proposed new gable peak ornaments.
- E. Consider reducing the size of or eliminating the east cross gable. Details should be simplified and it should be shifted south to be centered over the second floor windows.

Previous HPC action

Previous Council action