

MILWAUKEE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT



Date	10/6/2025	Ald.	Brower
CCF	250841	Reviewer	Tim Askin
Address	2135 N Lake Drive	Owner	Paula John
District	North Point South	Applicant	Al Francois

PROPOSAL

Applicant proposes to rebuild/redesign an existing attached garage to improve appearance and functionality.

Alterations to the exiting garage to increase garage door width and height from 8' x 6' to 9' x 7'. Eliminate stucco exterior wall finish and Install brick veneer masonry to match existing home brick and masonry detail. Install wrought iron railings to match existing railings between masonry piers and corner columns. New railings shall have 4" maximum opacity per code, garage doors shall be CHI carriage overlay, type 30, in white color with single square top seeded glass lites and wrought iron hardware. New rear door stairs/landing shall be concrete to replicate exposed limestone foundation walls, stair/landing shall have wrought iron railing and handrail.

STAFF COMMENTS

The August Hugo Vogel house was built in 1911 in the Georgian Revival style by architect William Schuchardt. The garage was added in 1960 while the property was in use as a rooming house. While the existing garage is not objectionable compared to other midcentury garages in the district, it is not up to present standard of functionality and its appearance could be improved.

As the attached garage pre-dates the historic district and is not entirely out of character for the house, it makes sense to allow it to be modified rather than replaced. It is unclear why there are two curb cuts as no prior garage was observed in aerial photos or found in permits.

Analysis of guidelines

Additions and Streetscapes. Most of these criteria are met. The design is visually harmonious and does not overwhelm or obstruct the primary building. The addition is 65 years old and while unlikely to be significant in its own right, the alterations do not cause any detriment to the streetscape.

Siting. Siting is reasonable. There is no consequential change from existing conditions.

Scale. The new design takes strong cues from the house in detailing. Changes in railings and overhead doors humanize the scale as shapes are less directly tied to the size of an automobile.

Form. Massing is improved slightly. The new design has clearer visual demarcation lines in its form.

Materials. New brick will be selected to match the house as closely as feasible. All proposed materials are better than existing materials.

RECOMMENDATION

Approve as proposed.

GUIDELINES

ADDITIONS

Make additions that harmonize with the existing building architecturally and are located so as not visible from the public right-of-way, if at all possible. Avoid making additions that are unsympathetic to the original structure and visually intrude upon the principal elevations.

STREETSCAPES

The streetscapes in North Point South are visually cohesive because of the intact building stock and the retention of period street and landscaping features. There are few non-contributing buildings or visually prominent inappropriate additions to historic structures. The traditional landscape treatment of the building lots and the period streetlights contribute to the maintenance of the district's traditional residential character.

1. Maintain the height, scale, mass and materials established by the buildings in the district and the traditional setback and density of the block faces. Avoid introducing elements that are incompatible in terms of siting, materials, height or scale.

NEW CONSTRUCTION

[Few] buildings have been constructed since 1940... It is important that additional new construction be designed so as to harmonize with the character of the district.

1. Siting. New construction must reflect the traditional siting of buildings in North Point South. This includes setback, spacing between buildings, the orientation of openings to the street and neighboring structures, and the relationship between the main building and accessory buildings.
2. Scale. Overall building height and bulk; the expression of major building divisions including foundation, body and roof; and, individual building components such as porches, overhangs and fenestration must be compatible with the surrounding structures.
3. Form. The massing of new construction must be compatible with the surrounding buildings. The profiles of roofs and building elements that project and recede from the main block must express the same continuity established by the historic structures.
4. Materials. The building materials that are visible from the public right-of-way should be consistent with the colors, textures, proportions, and combinations of cladding materials traditionally used in North Point South. The physical composition of the materials may be different from that of the historic materials, but the same appearance should be maintained.