GRANT F. LANGLEY

City Attorney

RUDOLPH M. KONRAD LINDA ULISS BURKE VINCENT D. MOSCHELLA Deputy City Attorneys



June 16, 2009

To the Honorable Common Council Of the City of Milwaukee Room 205 – City Hall

Re: Resolution relating to the claim of Silvestre Villarreal

C.I. File No. 09-L-47

Dear Council Members:

We return the enclosed document which has been filed with the City Clerk and ask that it be introduced and referred to the Committee on Judiciary & Legislation with the following recommendation.

Claimant, Silvestre Villarreal, 1510 South 37th Street, Milwaukee, WI 53215 alleges that on May 16, 2009 he sustained damages when a City tree branch broke off and landed on his vehicle which was parked at 2562 South 9th Place. He claims damages in the amount of \$11,816.52.

Our investigation reveals that the Forestry Division reviewed their records from the previous four years and found no notice of potential hazardous conditions or service requests for this location. They also note that, in keeping with the programmed pruning schedule, the tree was last pruned in March 2005 and it appeared sound and healthy. The tree was inspected the time of the loss and the branch removed. The division also began procedures which eventually lead to the removal of the tree. The inspection also found that no outward signs of decay were evident. Prior to this incident, the tree was alive. Finally, at the time of the loss the City was experiencing conditions which caused high

THOMAS O. GARTNER BRUCE D. SCHRIMPF SUSAN D. BICKERT STUART S. MUKAMAL THOMAS J. BEAMISH **MAURITA F. HOUREN** JOHN J. HEINEN DAVID J. STANOSZ SUSAN E. LAPPEN JAN A. SMOKOWICZ **PATRICIA A. FRICKER HEIDI WICK SPOERL KURT A. BEHLING** GREGG C. HAGOPIAN **ELLEN H. TANGEN** MELANIE R. SWANK JAY A. UNORA **DONALD L. SCHRIEFER EDWARD M. EHRLICH LEONARD A. TOKUS** MIRIAM R. HORWITZ **MARYNELL REGAN** G. O'SULLIVAN-CROWLEY KATHRYN Z. BLOCK MEGAN T. CRUMP **ELOISA DE LEÓN ADAM B. STEPHENS KEVIN P. SULLIVAN BETH CONRADSON CLEARY** THOMAS D. MILLER **HEIDI E. GALVÁN** JARELY M. RUIZ **ROBIN A. PEDERSON DANIELLE M. BERGNER** Assistant City Attorneys

To the Honorable Common Council June 16, 2009 Page 2

wind gusts. This loss was not related to negligence by the City of Milwaukee. As such, the City would not be liable. Therefore, we recommend that this claim be denied.

Very truly yours,

GRANT F. LANGLEY City Attorney

JAN A. SMOKOWICZ Assistant City Attorney

JAS:beg Enclosure 1068-2009-1435:147029