



Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report April 2022

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date: 04-04-2022
Ald. Milele Coggs District: 6
Staff reviewer: Carlen Hatala and Tim Askin
PTS #115226
CCF # 211661

Property 116 W. VINE ST. Brewers Hill Historic District

Owner/Applicant Michael Warecki Espire Homes Inc.
418 North 3rd Street Unit 180 530 Hartbrook Dr.
MILWAUKEE WI 53203 Hartland, WI 53029

Proposal The applicant proposes to construct a new house at 116 West Vine Street in the Brewers Hill Historic District. This is the fifth submission, showing only minor changes made to the house design since December 2021.

It has been determined at prior HPC Meetings (06-14-2021 and 11-4-2019 and 12-15-2021) that the basic HPC guidelines of the Brewers Hill Historic District and the Brewers Hill/Harambee overlay guidelines have been met. The HPC review of details has been the subject of later meetings.

NOTE: The precedents for aluminum-clad windows on residential properties and composite and fiber sidings may merit re-evaluation strictly for use in new construction. This would be an extended policy discussion for applications going forward.

In this final submission the applicant wants individual approvals or denials for the following items:

1. Porch revisions
2. Skylights on the west roof slope above the bedroom
3. Use of smooth Smartside siding
4. Use of manufactured stone for the two bays. Stone for the foundation cladding was previously approved.
5. Aluminum clad wood Pella windows
6. Vertical siding on the front gable
7. Garage doors

Staff comments

1. Porch post revisions were shown to the HPC at the March meeting and were appropriate
2. Skylights are placed close to the front of the house and are visible from the public right of way. Applicant wants this location for the bedroom below. Various skylights can be seen throughout Brewers Hill. Some were approved because they were set back or behind a dormer/gable. Some were installed without any review or approval.
3. Smartside has not been approved for existing or new construction by the HPC.
4. Manufactured stone will not be excessively rusticated and the grout will be applied to the front edge of the stone to reduce shadow lines
5. Aluminum clad windows selected from list of manufacturers sent by Tim Askin
6. Applicant wants to keep vertical siding in the front gable
7. Garage door appropriate

Recommendation

Approve items 1, 4, 7

Deny item 2 based on guidelines that state skylights [and other rooftop features] can be added if they do not visually intrude upon elevations visible from the right-of-way.

Deny item 3 based on history of HPC denying this product. Also all previous new houses approved by the HPC have used wood siding. Smartside does not have the appearance of wood siding.

Deny item 5 based on years of denials by HPC for this product on residential projects.

Up to HPC to approve or deny item 6, the vertical siding on the front gable.

Conditions

-

Staff Conclusion

Previous HPC action

Meetings June 14, 2021 and November 4, 2021 and December 15, 2021 and March 7, 2022

Previous Council action