



Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date: 12/04/2023

District: 3, Ald. Brostoff

Staff reviewer: Andrew Stern

CC File # 230900

Property 2409 N. Terrace Ave. North Point North Historic District

Owner/Applicant Anna Goldman
3849 S. Packard Ave. 1A.
St. Francis, WI 53235

Proposal

The applicant wishes to build a new 2 1/2-story brick veneer residence with a one-story rear attached garage with a covered patio above. Cladding is primarily "Arctic White" brick veneer laid in a running bond/Flemish bond hybrid pattern with black metal panel finish system at select window bays. The roof is standing seam 24-gauge steel with metal coping at a raised gable end. The house sits low to the ground atop a minimal foundation exposure, but appears to have a comparable rise from grade to the neighboring new houses. The top of the gable is 37' front grade.

The house is set back 28' 3" from the property line behind a gently sloping front lawn. A concrete driveway is located along the south property line and leads to a three car garage. A 6' tall brick wall with 50% open 2' is proposed along the back parking slab to screen the garage area from the neighbor's property.

The house itself is a sided-gabled structure with approximately 4,400 sq. ft. of finished space on the upper two levels and an additional 1,500+ sq. ft. of finished space in the basement. The primary block is 43 feet wide by 50 feet deep, with an additional 4 feet deep hyphen connection to a 26 feet wide by 37 feet deep attached garage. The front entrance is slightly recessed and on a 15 feet by 3 feet stoop. Two side entries are located in the ell between the house and the garage, accessed from a raised side patio. Behind this main block is a 36 foot long one story, flat roofed L-plan wing that connects with the attached garage. The garage also has a personnel door located on the back façade.

FRONT (EAST) FAÇADE

The front façade is symmetrically arranged. The focal point is the black metal panel finishing system oriel window on the right that contains a bank of four multi-paned steel windows. The oriel protrudes one foot from the primary block and is capped with a protruding steel fascia. The center bay contains paired steel windows on both first and second levels. The left bay contains a recessed entryway lined in limestone with paired doors and a flat-roofed, steel awning above. Windows on the first floor will be fixed, while the center and right windows on the second level will be casement windows. A limestone trim band runs across the façade approximately three feet from the ground level. Window sills are limestone and a limestone fascia runs across the

top of the façade. Metal scuppers are located at the ends of the façade. The standing seam, 7/12 pitched steel roof will be prominently visible from the front façade.

NORTH ELEVATION

The north elevation is side gabled with an asymmetrical arrangements of windows on the first and second level. The first level has casement windows in the left and center openings and a fixed window on the right. The upper level contains three off-center single-pane fixed window and a paired casement window on the right opening. The gable has a paired window opening. The limestone band continues along the lower portion of the façade, with a narrower limestone band below the gable. All windows have limestone sills. A four three-foot deep by four-foot wide basement egress well is located on the northeast of the elevation and an 11' wide basement window is located to the west of basement level. A metal panel finish system hyphen with fixed windows continues past the primary block of this façade, connecting the main block of the house to the garage. The garage has two fixed paired square windows flanking a protruding chimney. Above the garage is an open air patio covered by a 7/12 pitch steel standing seam roof that mirrors the main house roof. Five skylights are located on the roof. Support posts and beams finished with cedar trim will be visible below the roof. Four metal downspouts will be located off the garage roof.

SOUTH ELEVATION

The south elevation continues with the three bay motif on the front elevation. The right bay contains a metal panel finishing system with paired windows illuminating the stairway from the basement to the second level. The center and left bays on the first level contain paired casement windows. The center and left bays on the second level contained within a metal panel finishing system projecting oriel. These windows are a fixed window in the center bay and paired casement window in the left bay. Paired double-hung windows with limestone sill are located in the gable. The side entry door is located in the hyphen portion of this façade, accessed from a small porch stoop. A metal awning and wire rod support are located above the door. A paired window is located in the second level of the hyphen. The garage portion of this façade has a double and single steel garage doors with transom windows. A metal awning and wire rod support are located above the garage doors. The covered patio portion is located above the garage. Five skylights are located in the metal standing seam roof. A limestone band runs along the lower portion of the façade and above the second story. A limestone band is also located within the gable. Two metal downspouts flank the garage roof.

WEST (REAR) ELEVATION

The west of rear elevation contains a four-bay section off of the back patio, with three fixed windows and one door to access the patio. The upper level contains three casement windows with limestone sill. The garage portion of this façade has one man door with metal awning with metal rod supports. A limestone band is located along the lower portion of the façade. The open patio ends contain pre-engineered wood scissor trusses exposed below the roofline. The truss, posts, and beams on the patio are proposed to be finished with cedar trim.

LANDSCAPE FEATURES

Base plantings are proposed along the front and north elevations. These plantings consist of boxwood bushes, with four Black Hills Spruces also planted along the north façade. An Autumn Blaze Maple will be located in the front yard between the entry walk and the north property line. A raised planter bed is proposed along the north side of the driveway. "Green wall" type plantings are proposed adjacent on a 6' tall brick wall proposed to the south of the parking area behind the house. A French drain system with 4" drain tile is proposed along the perimeter of the house and will drain southeast to the front yard. A power transformer, air conditioning unit, and

generator are all located in the back yard behind the garage. A 6' tall red cedar privacy fence with 50% open top 2' is proposed to run from the northeast corner of the house and continue 2" off the northern property line along the length of the property line. The portion of the fence located in the back yard will be a solid 6' fence.

Changes from the November HPC Meeting

Minor changes to the house and property siting are proposed to incorporate comments from staff and the HPC following the November meeting.

The front setback has increased slightly and the house set back an additional 1' 4" from the north property line. A privacy fence has been added along the north property line. The French drain tile drainage system has been added to address site drainage issues. The air conditioning unit has been moved to the rear of the property and the brick retaining wall has been altered to meet zoning code requirements.

The window arrangement on the north elevation has been altered to reflect a modified interior layout. The garden window has been removed, with a three-window casement window replacing the garden window. The basement egress window arrangement has been modified, with one egress window remaining in the northeast corner and a non-egress window well further back along that façade.

Other minor house modifications include an increase to the width of the limestone water table, paired double-hung windows added to the gables, cedar trim replacing SmartSide trim on the garage, removal of the skylights on the rear roof, and a slight increase in the metal panel finish system on the south elevation stairway bay.

Staff comments

The location of this property serves as a transition between the newer houses located to the south and the historic properties to the north and across the street. The house is compatible in scale, massing, and height to the historic properties to the north but eschews traditional ornamentation in favor of a more modern aesthetic. The house has very minimal detailing and applied ornament is not present. The metal panel system further emphasizes the modern touch. Brick is an external cladding material found throughout North Point North, though the proposal calls for a more modern white brick look.

New Construction Guidelines look at four elements to inform decision making when an infill building is being proposed.

SITING

The proposed building is sited in a traditional manner with space for a front lawn, rear yard, and room for a side driveway with parking in the attached rear garage. The house is the primary visual component with the accessory parking uses screened behind the house. Front setbacks must be within 20% of the average of the two nearest residential buildings on the same block face. The house to the north is 30' from the right of way, the house to the south is 28' from the right of way. This would allow a front setback for the subject property of 29' +/- 5" 8". The current plans proposed the house to be set back 28.25' from the right of way. The plan shows a 4' 4" setback from the property to the north.

SCALE

The scale of the house (width and height) is compatible with other houses in the district. The roof ridge is 37 feet from grade to top of the gable. The dimensions of the main house are 43 feet wide by 50 feet deep. The top of the chimney on the

garage patio is 31 feet with the garage roof approximately two feet lower than the chimney. The garage will be minimally visible from the right of way.

FORM

The house has a rectangular form with rear dependencies, which is a form found within the historic district. The side-gabled roof is also present on a number of houses within the district. The large, plain standing seam roof is out of place with side-gabled houses within the district. Side-gabled houses almost exclusively have dormers or other architectural detailing within the roof. There is precedent of slightly recessed entries within the historic district that are accessed via minimal porches, though this is not the norm and most often recessed entries contain more substantial porches internally incorporated into the house.

MATERIALS

Brick is a historic material found throughout the district, though the non-historic color of the brick differs from the more traditional colors found in the district. Standing seam metal roofs were used in rural settings and industrial settings historically, so there is precedent for that material. The metal panel finishing system, while not a historic material, is found on one of the new houses located south of the subject property.

Recommendation

The applicant and architect have addressed the primary concerns discussed at the November HPC meeting.

Approve with conditions.

Conditions

Work with staff on details as is commonly done on new construction projects including materials (roofing sample, brick sample, window manufacturer's specifications, metal panel finish system, garage door design if different from drawings) and any design modifications required by the commission.

Previous HPC action

Previous Council action