



Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date: 9/11/2017
Ald. Nik Kovac District: 3
Staff reviewer: Tim Askin
PTS #114346 CCF #170686

Property	1630 E. ROYALL PL./ 1801 N. PROSPECT AV.	Charles Allis House/Museum
Owner/Applicant	MILWAUKEE COUNTY REGISTER OF DEEDS 1630 E ROYAL PL MILWAUKEE WI 53202	James Otto James G. Otto Architect, LLC 1374 St Augustine Rd Hubertus, WI 53033 Phone: (262) 628-4572

Proposal

1. Form Dutchman from new matching sandstone throughout south entry area
2. Remove all loose material and retool surface to match adjacent normal weathered stone.
3. South Elevation: Main entry stair total repair and restoration

Staff comments

1. Preservation guidelines for the Charles Allis Museum require that any replacement features on the porch, trim and ornamentation shall match the original member in scale, design, color, and material. The architect has indicated the original stone is from a protected site and no longer produced. The architect states the best match is Bunt Purple from China that will not have the water spots as the original (specific to Bass Island Brownstone Quarry). Staff accepts this substitute only if research into local and/or regional alternates has been done and no such match has been found within the United States or Canada. It is likely that the stone is a viable replacement in some locations, but there are several portions of the stairs where the color match is less than ideal.
2. Mortar shall match original color, texture, joint width, and joint finish/profile
3. The architect indicates documentation of the existing stair and balustrade will take place. Proposal as written and discussed for documentation, numbering and disassembling and final reassembly of porch is acceptable.
4. US Heritage Group in Chicago, IL conducted mortar testing. The mix is an "original composition of a natural or early Portland cement mortar mixed with lime." John Speweik was the consultant. Following the mortar mix specified by the mortar consultant will meet the guidelines
5. Sandstone patches will be from Conproco Corporation, Matrix, Edison Coatings, or Cathedral Stone as stated in the proposal. Additional information and specifications were provided in the form of product data sheets. Staff views each proposed product as acceptable.
6. The architect mentioned the upper balcony would have to either be repaired or replicated and replaced. A separate COA Application must be filed, as this portion of the project was not given enough detail in the scope of work provided. Preservation guidelines call for repair of original if possible.

Recommendation

Recommend HPC Approval with conditions

Conditions

1. Regional alternates to the Apostle Island sandstone should be further researched. Must prove to staff that no match or relative is available regionally before using Bunt Purple from China.
2. HPC Staff must be contacted when mortar work begins in order to field verify proper preservation techniques are being used.
3. A separate COA Application must be made for the south façade balcony. Contact HPC Staff when decision on the balcony to repair or replace is made.
4. Standard masonry conditions
 - New mortar must match the original mortar in terms of color, texture, joint width, and joint finish/profile. Mortar that is too hard is subject to premature failure and could damage the masonry. Using the mortar mix determined by the already performed testing will be satisfactory. No joint of a width less than 3/8" may be cleaned of damaged/decomposed mortar with power disc grinders. No over-cutting of the joints is permitted. Remove decomposed mortar back into the wall 2.5 times the height of the joint before tuckpointing.
 - New stone must match as closely as possible the color texture, size and finish of the original stone (see condition one).
 - A sample panel of brick and mortar must be reviewed and approved by HPC staff prior to general installation of the material.

Previous HPC action**Previous Council action**