CITY OF MILWAUKEE

GRANT F. LANGLEY City Attorney

RUDOLPH M. KONRAD PATRICK B. McDONNELL LINDA ULISS BURKE Deputy City Attorneys



OFFICE OF CITY ATTORNEY

800 CITY HALL 200 EAST WELLS STREET MILWAUKEE, WISCONSIN 53202-3551 TELEPHONE (414) 286-2601 TDD 286-2025 FAX (414) 286-8550

May 12, 2005

To the Honorable Common Council of the City of Milwaukee Room 205 – City Hall

Re:

CCFN 041757 – A substitute ordinance relating to parental responsibility for misconduct of minors

Dear Council Members:

We have had the opportunity to review the parental responsibility ordinances recently passed by other jurisdictions in our area, as well as court cases from New Jersey and New Hampshire that have held similar ordinances unconstitutional. It is our opinion that the above proposed ordinance would not withstand a constitutional challenge, thus would not be enforceable.

While court decisions from other jurisdictions are not binding precedent in Wisconsin, they serve as a good guide when constitutional concerns are being raised. In the New Jersey case, *Doe v. City of Trenton*, 143 N.J. Super. 128, 362 A.2d 1200 (1976), an ordinance similar to our proposed ordinance was held unconstitutional. The attempt to make a parent responsible for the actions of a child was found to violate due process, in that no degree of parental misconduct had to be shown to charge the parent with a violation.

The communities of North Fond Du Lac, Cudahy, Saint Francis, and Oak Creek have passed parental responsibility ordinances within the last couple of years. As far as we can determine to date, no prosecutions have taken place under these ordinances in any of these communities. If we were to look to Wisconsin civil law for guidance, we would find that parents are held liable for civil damages caused by their children only in four general situations:

- 1. Where the parent negligently entrusts the child with an instrumentality which nay become a source of danger to others;
- 2. where the child is acting as the parents agent;
- 3. where the parent knows of the child's wrongdoing and consents to it. Or directs or sanctions it; and

THOMAS O. GARTNER BRUCE D. SCHRIMPF ROXANE L. CRAWFORD SUSAN D. BICKERT HAZEL MOSLEY STUART S. MUKAMAL THOMAS J. BEAMISH MAURITA F. HOUREN JOHN J. HEINEN MICHAEL G. TOBIN DAVID J. STANOSZ SUSAN E. LAPPEN JAN A. SMOKOWICZ PATRICIA A. FRICKER HEIDI WICK SPOERL HEIDI WICK SPOERL KURT A. BEHLING GREGG C. HAGOPIAN ELLEN H. TANGEN MELANIE R. SWANK JAY A. UNORA DONALD L. SCHRIEFER EDWARD M. EHRLICH LEONARD A. TOKUS VINCENT J. BOBOT MIRIAM R. HORWITZ MARYNELL REGAN G. O'SULLIVAN-CROWLEY DAWN M. BOLAND KATHRYN M. ZALEWSKI **MEGAN T. CRUMP** ELOISA DE LEÓN **ADAM STEPHENS**

Assistant City Attorneys

Honorable Common Council May 12, 2005 Page 2

4. where the parent fails to exercise control over the child, although the parent knows, or should know, that injury to another is a probable consequence.

Bankert v. Threshermen's Mut. Ins. Co., 110 Wis.2d 469, 477, 327 N.W. 150 (1983).

We have taken the liberty to revise the ordinance adopting the above guidelines to fashion an ordinance that we feel would be legal and enforceable. Of the local ordinances passed recently, St. Francis' appears to follow these guidelines and we use their ordinance as a basis for our revision. In our revision, you will note that we have changed "minor" to "juvenile". Wisconsin law considers 17 year olds to be "adults" for criminal and municipal ordinance prosecutions, thus it is appropriate to limit the age for the child's violations to those under 17. Enclosed please find a copy of your review. We would be happy to meet with you to discuss the revisions.

Thank you for your consideration.

Very truly yours,

GRANT FANNGLEY

City Attorney

KURT A. BEHLING Assistant City Attorney

KB:lmb:92557

cc: Alderman Puente James Owczarski Ron Leonhardt