



Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date: 9/9/2024
Staff reviewer: Andrew Stern

Ald. Bauman
CCF # 240604

| | | |
|------------------------|--|--|
| Property | 1119 E. Knapp St. | First Ward Triangle Historic District |
| Owner/Applicant | Slayed Development One Daniel Slade 1660 N. Prospect Ave. Milwaukee, WI 53202 | Steven Brandenburg 1628 N. Astor St. Milwaukee, WI 53202 |

Proposal

The applicant is proposing replacing the original double doors with new wood double doors.

Staff comments

The Charles Forsythe House was designed by architect Howland Russel and constructed in around 1885. The house is an impeccable example of Queen Anne residential architecture. The house has an asymmetrical massing, clapboard siding with sawn and incised ornament and shingling on the front, decorative stickwork and large one-over-one windows with a distinctive square and triangle stained glass design in the upper sash, and paired entry doors with stained glass windows.

As indicated in the staff report for the after-the-fact window replacement, the owner has undertaken a large scale construction project at the Forsythe House without approval of COAs or permits. Following issuance of violation orders, the owner's contractor reached out to HPC staff prior to the proposed removal and replacement of the paired entry doors. The doors appear original to the house and feature a three-panel design with square stained glass windows that replicate the design found on the upper sash of the original windows. The property owner is proposing to replace these doors with new Fir paired doors. The proposal includes two proposed designs: a three-panel design that replicates the panel design of the original windows but with clear glass, and a three-panel design that replicates the panel design of the original windows but triangular and diamond simulated divided light glass.

The preservation guidelines for the First Ward Triangle Historic District recommend:

"Retain existing window and door openings that are visible from the public right-of-way. Retain the original configuration of panes, sash, lintels, keystones, sills, architraves, pediments, hoods, doors, shutters and hardware. Avoid making additional openings or changes in the principal elevations by enlarging or reducing window or door openings to fit new stock window sash or new stock door sizes. Avoid changing the size or configuration of windowpanes or sash. Avoid discarding original doors and door hardware when they can be repaired or reused.

"Respect the stylistic period or periods a building represents. If replacement of window sash or doors is necessary, the replacement should duplicate the appearance and design of the original window sash or door. Avoid using inappropriate sash and door replacements."

No documentation has been provided showing that the original doors are in disrepair or incapable of being repaired. The unique design and stained glass on the doors is an integral component of the Queen Anne design of the house. The contractor working on the house indicated to staff that it would likely be less expensive to build a new jamb and repair the existing doors. Quotes for the new doors ranged between \$6,642 and \$9,986. Peepholes or video doorbells are allowable and would address any security concerns.

Staff recommends repair of the existing historic doors.

Recommendation Recommend HPC Denial

Conditions

Previous HPC action

Previous Council action