



Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

Living with History

HPC meeting date: 8/10/2015
Ald. Nik Kovac District: 3
Staff reviewer: Carlen Hatala
PTS #104826

Property 2105 E. LAFAYETTE PL. North Point South Historic District

Owner/Applicant DAVID QUADRACCI Deep River Partners, LTD
2105 E LAFAYETTE PL 338 North Milwaukee St.
MILWAUKEE WI 53202 Milwaukee, WI 53202
Phone: (414) 276-8550

Proposal This property along with the vacant parcel next door addressed at 2115 East Lafayette Place is currently under one ownership. The vacant lot will be developed with a new house. A shared drive will be built between the two properties. To preserve the view from the houses and to keep vistas more open to the neighborhood, both properties will feature below grade parking. New landscaping is included as well.

The garage for 2105 East Lafayette Place will be located behind the existing house and built into the hillside. The roof of the garage will form a deck. Two overhead garage doors will be installed, made of wood and having the appearance of swing open carriage barn doors.

Portions of the garage's exterior will be visible, clad with vertical composite siding framed into panels. The panels are designed to carry through the design of the garage doors.

The upper deck will have newly built steps, handrails and guardrails. The guardrails and handrails will consist of simple picket balusters and square posts. All of this construction as well as the decking is proposed to be of composite material.

Retaining walls flanking the new driveway and steps flanking the east end of the garage are proposed to be made of cast stone.

Staff comments

The house at 2105 East Lafayette Place was constructed in 1887 and designed by local architect Howland Russel for members of the Hathaway family.

There is no garage on the property at present and cars are parked on a concrete pad next to the house. This proposal will allow the cars to be out of sight and out of the weather.

The rear of the house facing Lake Michigan shows evidence of a number of alterations. Howland Russel designed a rear porch in 1891. The 1894 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map shows a one story porch spanning the entire lake side of the house. Architect William Schuchardt enclosed the porch and built an addition. A prominent sleeping porch is located at the second story.

The Milwaukee HPC has been consistent in approving non-traditional or engineered products only for new construction that is not visible from the public right of way and that is detached from the historic structure. In this instance, the below grade garage may be only slightly visible from the right of way. The garage does open into the lower level of the house. Engineered wood products and even cement board products have been shown to have premature failure due to the inability of contractors to install the products according to the manufacturer's specifications. Many of them have not been around long enough to evaluate accurately.

Decay resistant wood species have a long documented track record of good performance.

The cast stone product that will line the driveway and retaining walls is depicted arranged in fieldstone pattern. The HPC has recently denied the use of man made block for landscaping. The product for this project will have to be evaluated. Again, traditional stone has been approved by the HPC.

Recommendation

Approve with the following conditions

Conditions

Use of decay resistant wood is recommended over engineered wood products.

More detail drawings of the garage cladding and upper deck railing as well as the final garage door selection is to be provided before the project is started.

The salvaged historic wrought iron fence, installed by the Holtons, should be preserved.

Previous HPC action**Previous Council action**