



Department of Employee Relations

Tom Barrett
Mayor

Maria Monteagudo
Director

Michael Brady
Employee Benefits Director

Deborah Ford
Labor Negotiator

March 24, 2014

To the Honorable
The Committee on Finance and Personnel
Common Council
City of Milwaukee

Dear Committee Members: Re: Common Council File Number 131592

The following classification and pay recommendations will be submitted to the City Service Commission on **March 25, 2014**. We recommend these changes subject to approval by the City Service Commission.

In the Department of Public Works – Water Works, a reorganization of the supervisory responsibilities within the Distribution and Meter Services section.

The job evaluation report covering the above positions, including the necessary Salary and Positions Ordinance amendments, is attached.

Sincerely,

Maria Monteagudo
Employee Relations Director

MM:fcw
Attachments: Job Evaluation Report
Fiscal Note

C: Mark Nicolini, James Carroll, Dennis Yaccarino, Deborah Ford, Nicole Fleck, Carrie Lewis, Laura Daniels, Richard Davila, Thomas Gwiazdowski, Michael Lloyd, David Klug, Steven Zizzo, Timothy Singbeil, Martin Wall, Thomas Runnells, Carl Burmeister, Brad Bratel, and Andray Decordova



JOB EVALUATION REPORT

City Service Commission Meeting Date: March 25, 2014

DPW – WATER WORKS

Current	Request	Recommendation
<p>Water Distribution Field Supervisor PR 1BX (\$47,816 - \$66,946) 7 Regular Positions</p> <p>Footnote 2/ allows \$75/Pay Period for emergency restoration of water service.</p>	<p>Water Field Supervisor PR 1BX (\$47,816 - \$66,946) 10 Regular Positions 2 Auxiliary Positions (0.33 FTE) 2 Auxiliary Positions</p> <p>Footnote 2/ allows \$75/Pay Period for emergency restoration of water service.</p>	<p>Water Field Supervisor PR 1BX (\$47,816 - \$66,946) 10 Regular Positions 2 Auxiliary Positions (0.33 FTE) 2 Auxiliary Positions</p> <p>Footnote 2/ allows \$75/Pay Period for emergency restoration of water service.</p>
<p>Water Distribution Supervisor I PR 1AX (\$44,857 - \$62,799) 2 Auxiliary Positions (0.33 FTE)</p> <p>Footnote 2/ allows \$75/Pay Period for emergency restoration of water service.</p>	<p>Review of recruitment rate</p>	<p>New Footnote 4/ provides recruitment at \$2,157.00 (\$56,081.88)</p>
<p>Water Meter Field Supervisor PR 1BX (\$47,816 - \$66,946) 3 Regular Positions 2 Auxiliary Positions</p>		

Action Needed – Effective Pay Period 1, 2014 (December 22, 2013)

In the Salary Ordinance, under Pay Range 1BX, delete the titles of “Water Distribution Field Supervisor 2/” and “Water Meter Field Supervisor”; and add the title of “Water Field Supervisor 2/, 4/” and footnote “4/ Recruitment is at \$2,157.00 (\$56,081.88)”.

In the Positions Ordinance, under the Department of Public Works-Water Works, Meter Services, delete three positions of “Water Meter Field Supervisor (X)” and add three positions of “Water Field Supervisor (X)”; under Auxiliary Positions, delete two positions of “Water Meter Field Supervisor (X)” and add two positions of “Water Field Supervisor (X)”; under Distribution Organization, Field Operations, delete seven positions of “Water Distribution Field Supervisor (X)” and add seven positions of “Water Field Supervisor (X)”; and under Auxiliary, delete two positions of “Water Distribution Supervisor (0.33FTE)” and add two positions of “Water Field Supervisor (0.33 FTE).”

Background and Analysis

The Milwaukee Water Works has requested the creation of a new title of Water Field Supervisor in Pay Range 1BX (\$47,816 - \$66,946) in conjunction with a reorganization that merges supervisory responsibilities within the Distribution and Meter Services sections. This new title is expected to replace the Water Meter Field Supervisor and the Water Distribution Field

Supervisor classifications in Pay Range 1BX. This would affect ten regular positions and four auxiliary positions, two of which are at .33 FTE (Full Time Equivalents).

According to the job description submitted by the department, Water Field Supervisors will provide direct supervision of Water Distribution and Meter Services personnel to ensure safe, efficient and productive repair and maintenance of the water distribution system, meter exchanges, testing, reading and programming. They will be responsible for enforcing work rules and policies as well as standard operating procedures and for providing oversight and direction for on-call duty coverage and operations needed to handle after-hours emergency repairs and after-hours interactions with customers, the public and officials.

All Water Field Supervisors will be cross trained to work in both areas, Distribution and Meter Services, to enable the Water Works to move supervision where needed during peak and seasonal work load demands and project needs. All will be required to supervise Water Distribution Chief Repair Workers, Water Distribution Repair Workers II, Water Distribution Repair Workers I, Water Meter Technicians, Water Meter Specialists, and Water Meter Reading Specialists. The incumbents will also be required to obtain and maintain a Wisconsin Department of Natural Resources Distribution Operators Certification and to work various shifts in both Distribution and Meter Services to cover emergencies such as water main breaks, flooding buildings, frozen services, multiple fire alarms for hydrant and water supply needs, etc.

Given these responsibilities, the Water Department has requested that the footnote that provides \$75 on a biweekly basis for employees regularly involved in emergency restoration of water service be authorized for the new Water Field Supervisor classification. Although the footnote is recommended to be effective Pay Period 1, 2014 (December 22, 2013), the benefit would be prospective, Pay Period 10, 2014 (April 27, 2014), for employees who were in the classification of Water Meter Field Supervisor and were not previously assigned to emergency restoration of water service.

Milwaukee Water Works has also requested a review of the recruitment or appointment rate for this Water Field Supervisor position in relation to the rates of pay of direct reports. The Water Department has indicated that they have had difficulty attracting internal candidates for these entry level supervisory positions due to pay compression problems. Water Distribution Field Supervisor and Water Meter Field Supervisor positions are filled through internal promotional processes within the Water Department. Generally the applicant pool for these positions includes incumbents from the Water Distribution Repair Worker II, Water Distribution Chief Repair Worker, and Water Meter Specialist classifications. It is important to note that once promoted into supervisory positions, employees are not eligible to earn overtime for hours worked in excess of 40 in one work week. To illustrate the pay compression, the table below summarizes the relevant pay ranges.

Classification/ Pay Range	Direct Reports/ Pay Ranges
Water Meter Field Supervisor Water Distribution Field Supervisor 1BX (\$47,816 - \$66,946)	Water Distribution Chief Repair Worker 8MN (\$47,879 - \$54,928) Water Distribution Repair Worker II 8IN (\$41,287 - 46,611) Water Meter Specialist 7EN (\$41,770 - \$46,611)

As depicted above, the most prevalent compression problem exists between the pay range of the Water Distribution Chief Repair Worker with a maximum of \$54,928 and the minimum of the supervisory level at \$47,816. A review of the current pay distribution of all Water Distribution Chief Repair Workers and the supervisors reveals the following:

- The average salary of the Water Distribution Chief Repair Worker is \$51,516, approximately \$3,700 higher than the minimum rate of pay for the entry level supervisory positions;
- The pay differential becomes more problematic when you take into account overtime payments due to Water Distribution Chief Repair Workers for hours worked in excess of 40 in one week;
- All current Water Distribution Chief Repair Workers earn an annual salary that is higher than the minimum of the Water Distribution Field Supervisor and the Water Meter Field Supervisor;
- Four Water Distribution Chief Repair Workers are at the maximum of their pay range, \$54,928, which is approximately \$7,112 higher than the minimum of the supervisory position;
- All Water Distribution Chief Repair Workers earn a base salary that is higher than the salary of one Water Meter Field Supervisor appointed to the position in January of 2011 but with over 18 years of service (annual salary of \$47,816);
- All Water Distribution Chief Repair Workers earn a base salary that is equal to or greater than the salary of one Water Meter Field Supervisor appointed to the position in January of 2011 but with over 26 years of service (annual salary of \$48,411).

Other areas of the Department of Public Works have experienced similar types of pay compression between entry level supervisory positions and their direct reports. The Salary Ordinance contains special recruitment/appointment provisions that alleviate similar pay compression problems and provide an incentive for rank and file employees to apply for internal promotions as described below:


- Sanitation Supervisors and Equipment Operations Supervisors in Pay Range 1AX (\$44,857 - \$62,799) are appointed at the rate of \$56,184. This rate is equal to the maximum rate paid to the Operations Driver/ Worker classification on the basis of a 46 hour work week.
- In Fleet Services, Fleet Repair Supervisors in Pay Range 1BX (\$47,816 - \$66,946) are appointed at the rate of \$54,235. This rate is equivalent to the maximum of the highest paid position that reports to this classification (the Fluid Power Systems Technician) and approximately 2.1% higher than the maximum rate of pay of the Vehicle Service Technician II classification.

Based on the special recruitment/appointment rate provisions in place for other first line supervisors in the Department of Public Works to address pay compression challenges, it is recommended that a minimum recruitment rate of \$56,082 be added to the new title of Water Field Supervisor. This recruitment rate represents a salary that is at least 2.1% higher than the maximum rate of pay of the Water Distribution Chief Repair Worker. The Department of Employee Relations will work with the Milwaukee Water Works to address any internal pay equity problems that arise as a result of new promotions after implementation of this provision.

There are two current incumbents of the Water Meter Field Supervisor classification who are currently paid less than the recommended minimum recruitment rate. It is recommended that effective Pay Period 1 of 2014 the annual salaries of those individuals be adjusted to \$56,082.

Conclusion and Recommendation

It is recommended the positions of Water Meter Field Supervisors, Water Distribution Field Supervisor, and two auxiliary positions of Water Distribution Supervisor I be consolidated into a single title of Water Field Supervisor in Pay Range 1BX. It is anticipated that this consolidation will allow the Water Department to better staff water emergencies in both the Distribution and Meter Services sections to respond to call-out emergencies. A minimum recruitment footnote is also recommended to alleviate the pay compression problem between the Water Field Supervisor classification and the Water Distribution Chief Repair Worker classification. This footnote is also intended to provide an incentive for rank and file employees to consider applying for promotional opportunities when they meet the minimum requirements. Finally, this report recommends authorizing the footnote that provides \$75 per pay period to employees regularly involved in emergency restoration of water service for all Water Field Supervisor positions.

Prepared by: 

Maria Monteagudo, Employee Relations Director

MM/fcw