



City of Milwaukee

200 E. Wells Street
Milwaukee, Wisconsin
53202

Meeting Minutes

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Ald. Robert Bauman, CHAIR

Marion Clendenen-Acosta, Vice Chair

*Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, Matt Jarosz, and Patricia Keating
Kahn*

*Staff Assistant, Linda Elmer, 286-2231, Fax: 286-3456,
lelmer@milwaukee.gov*

*Senior Planner: Carlen Hatala, 286-5722,
chatal@milwaukee.gov*

*Senior Planner: Tim Askin, 286-5712,
tim.askin@milwaukee.gov*

*Legislative Liaison, Dana Zelazny, 286-8679,
dana.zelazny@milwaukee.gov*

Monday, March 5, 2018

3:00 PM

City Hall, Room 301-B

Meeting convened: 3:02 P.M.

Present: 4 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn

Excused: 3 - Jarosz, VACANCY, VACANCY

1. [171663](#)

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for a comprehensive rehabilitation including replacing roofing, rebuilding porches, rebuilding railings, and other work, at 2145 N. Sherman Boulevard in the Sherman Boulevard Historic District for Appleton Rental Homes.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Mr. Tim Askin said this duplex dates to 1912 and is a large masonry building and it and the garage are highly visible from Lisbon Ave. The HPC intern created drawings for the porch and existing brick will be used for the columns. The front balcony will also be re-built and the new roof will have limited shadow. Staff recommends approval.

A motion was made by Patricia Keating Kahn, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Bauman, Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, and Keating Kahn

No: 0

Excused: 5 - VACANCY, VACANCY, VACANCY, VACANCY, and Jarosz

Roll call taken at 3:08 P.M.

Present: 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Jarosz, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Keating Kahn

Excused: 2 - VACANCY, VACANCY

2. [171154](#)

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for demolition of the 1899 parish house addition and construction of a new tower addition consisting of event space and apartments at 833 W. Wisconsin Avenue, St. James Episcopal Church, an individually designated historic property, for J. Jeffers & Co.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

This was heard at the last meeting and was tied 2-2. Mr. Tim Askin went through the history of the building.

The proposal is to demolish an entire wing of a national and locally registered building, which is surrounded by other historic buildings. Mr. Askin provided the demolition criteria (contained in the file) and how they relate to this building. Staff takes no position on the demolition, but if approved does have conditions it would like to have met requiring record requirements, archeological findings and proof of funding prior to the demolition.

The applicant said if the demolition criteria are applied solely to the parish house it does meet criteria for demolition. The architecturally distinctive wall will be preserved and retain the historic character of the courtyard. The interiors of the parish house are pretty standard 1960s design. The property was purchased in November and they are maintaining it, although it could not function as a working space without a huge capital outlay. The main church will be the primary ballroom. There will be some students in the apartments, but not necessarily all students. The stained glass windows will be retained and re-used if they are in the parish house; the church stained glass windows will remain. Ms. Keating Kahn likes the staff conditions as detailed in the report.

Ms. Keating Kahn moved to approve the COA for demolition of the parish hall with the condition of re-use of the old wood trusses, stained glass windows will be accounted for and re-used and the north elevation will be retained, all 4 conditions set by HPC staff to be met and approval of the new design, seconded by Ms. Pieper Eisenbrown. Prevailed. 5-0

The architect said the new tower wall will be made of concrete to look like stone on the lower floors; the upper floors will have cement panels. The rear building will go up to 82 feet. The tower will have event space and residential space. The proposed building has no cornice. Mr. Askin would like to see more character in the service doors and he would recommend design more compatible with the gothic lines of the church. Staff does not support the finish of the masonry as proposed by the applicant. Staff has conditions if the new construction is approved, detailed in the report and PowerPoint. Staff would like to have no vents on the Wisconsin Ave. elevation. Mr. Jarosz would like to approve in theory but see more details in some things, such as good quality materials or details that are visible from the public areas. Mr. Jarosz would also like to see a study on how the top of the building can be changed in some manner. The architect can look at the stone used and ways of creating a top without doing a cornice. Ms. Clendenen-Acosta agreed with Mr. Jarosz that the building should exist more as a backdrop for the church.

Mr. Jarosz moved for approval of the design with consideration for examination of the top floor in terms of the window patterning and the materials and re-think the base and entrances of the east elevation and careful coordination of the punched openings for the laundry vents and texture changes of materials as recommended by staff and work

with staff on these matters, seconded by Ms. Keating Kahn. There were no objections.

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Patricia Keating Kahn, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Bauman, Pieper Eisenbrown, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Keating Kahn

No: 0

Excused: 4 - VACANCY, VACANCY, VACANCY, and VACANCY

3. [171622](#)

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a sunken driveway, construction of a garage under the rear porch, related landscape alterations, and demolition of minor additions on the west elevation at 2105 E. Lafayette Place in the North Point South Historic District for David Quadracci.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Ms. Carlen Hatala said the commission has seen this twice before, both applications were denied. Mr. Tim Askin said a new curb cut will be done which will lead to a sunken driveway leading to a garage built under the rear wall. The majority of the rear will be paved and five trees will be removed. New additions will be removed although the original bay will be retained. The existing guidelines barely contemplate this, so they are not violated. The garage will be under the bay. Staff recommends approval with conditions outlined in the report.

Mr. Jarosz moved for approval, with staff conditions, seconded by Ms. Clendenen-Acosta. Prevailed. 5-0

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Marion Clendenen-Acosta, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Jarosz, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, and Keating Kahn

No: 0

Excused: 2 - VACANCY, and VACANCY

4. [171653](#)

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for retroactive approval of vinyl replacement windows at 723 E. Brady Street in the Brady Street Historic District for AIM Investments.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Mr. Tim Askin said the original windows were present in 1986, but not in 1990 when the area was designated historic. It is also unknown when the front porch was unenclosed. The vinyl windows were present in 2011. Work has been done since 2015 without getting COAs, even though the owner is the president of the Brady Street BID. Staff recommends denial of the application and recommends 2 over 2 wood windows by installed within the next 90 days.

The owner said they were replacing vinyl windows and didn't think they needed approval to do so - the windows are the exact windows that were on the house prior to the fire in 2015. He purchased the property in 2013 and the porch was open at that time. There is wood casing on the outside of the windows. The vinyl siding was not damaged in the

fire, but the window glass was damaged by the firefighters so they replaced all the frames with the existing vinyl frames.

Mr. Jarosz moved to deny, seconded by Ms. Pieper Eisenbrown. Prevailed. 5-0.

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, that this Resolution be PLACED ON FILE. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Pieper Eisenbrown, Jarosz, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, and Keating Kahn

No: 0

Excused: 2 - VACANCY, and VACANCY

5. [171654](#)

Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for a comprehensive rehabilitation including relocating entrances; creating a new driveway; relocation and replacement of windows; and enclosing a rear porch at 2727 - 2729 E. Bradford Avenue and 2451 - 2457 N. Terrace Avenue in the North Point North Historic District for Kevin Rave.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

Mr. Tim Askin said the house was built in 1906 and the coach house in 1911. The building is now a 4-unit building built over several phases and it is a legal 4-family use as of 1977, per the tax commissioner. Mr. Kevin Rave said it was listed as a 4-unit property in 1941. The applicant is proposing stucco repair, shingle replacement, replace all gutters and downspouts and flashing, change the coach house to match the house and replace sidewalks and grading, add new concrete driveway and relocate a porch entrance and remove all non-original Spanish gothic light fixtures with orange shades, and add a synthetic wrought iron fence for part of the yard. Secondary siding will also be removed and replaced with stucco. There is one proposed skylight, which staff does not support. The current skylight is legal as it was installed prior to creation of the historic district. Staff recommends either a small dormer or a skylight on an opposite roof. The applicant will also reveal the original basement windows and will move the side porch to allow a second driveway and materials will be re-used as much as is feasible. The immediate neighbor is opposed to this second driveway, which will be immediately adjacent to their home. Staff is comfortable with all the proposed work on the rear and it isn't visible from the street. The coach house will have a major remodel and staff does not recommend the proposed recladding or false front. The staff report supports most work, but does have some concerns as listed.

The Raves purchased the property in June and moved into the main unit. The previous owners had illegal rental units and hadn't done a lot of needed repairs. There has been a tenant living above the coach house since the early 80s which is an illegal occupancy, but the owner is working to get a variance for that tenant. They will be seeking high-end tenants, rather than university students, as had been done in the past. He was trying to make the coach house more attractive and match it to the house. Tenants cannot park on the property, but with the high-end aspects of it they do want to offer off-street parking. The porch will need to be re-built no matter what. The property has drainage issues which affects its basement, as well as the neighbor. There will be a 3.5 foot buffer of green space on his property and his neighbor's house is 3 feet from the property line. The new driveway will be one lane and a parking pad. The new driveway is for tenants.

Sarah Slaughter - 2443 N. Terrace Ave. - immediate neighbor to the south, she's opposed to many of the proposed changes, particularly the new driveway. The porch is part of the original structure. She feels the driveway is too close to their property line.

Barbara Elsner - 2424 N. Terrace Ave. - she also does not want the porch removed or the driveway being added so close to the neighbor's house.

The applicant is willing to work with the Slaughters to do landscaping. Mr. Jarosz would like to see more definitive landscaping plans drawn by a professional.

Ms. Pieper Eisenbrown excused from the rest of the meeting at 5:32 P.M.

Mr. Jarosz moved for moving of the porch, but not for driveway construction, no approval of the skylight and the coach house will remain as it is except for the door and window changes. Seconded by Ms. Clendenen-Acosta. There were no objections.

A motion was made by Matt Jarosz, seconded by Marion Clendenen-Acosta, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Jarosz, Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, and Keating Kahn

No: 0

Excused: 3 - Pieper Eisenbrown, VACANCY, and VACANCY

The following files represent staff approved Certificates of Appropriateness:

6. [171616](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of a projecting sign at 231 S. 2nd Street in the South Second Street Historic District for Toast Restaurant and 231 2nd Street LLC.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Marion Clendenen-Acosta, seconded by Patricia Keating Kahn, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Keating Kahn

No: 0

Excused: 5 - VACANCY, VACANCY, VACANCY, VACANCY, and Pieper Eisenbrown

7. [171688](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for installing a high-efficiency side-vent furnace at 2463 N. Grant Boulevard in the Grant Boulevard Historic District for E & G Investments.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Marion Clendenen-Acosta, seconded by Patricia Keating Kahn, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Keating Kahn

No: 0

Excused: 5 - VACANCY, VACANCY, VACANCY, VACANCY, and Pieper Eisenbrown

8. [171711](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for constructing a

new HVAC system at 2650 N. Downer Avenue in the Downer Avenue Historic District for Stone Creek Coffee.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Marion Clendenen-Acosta, seconded by Patricia Keating Kahn, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Keating Kahn

No: 0

Excused: 5 - VACANCY, VACANCY, VACANCY, VACANCY, and Pieper Eisenbrown

9. [171721](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of house accent lighting in the front yard at 2928 W. State Street in the Concordia Historic District for Allison Nemec.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Marion Clendenen-Acosta, seconded by Patricia Keating Kahn, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Keating Kahn

No: 0

Excused: 5 - VACANCY, VACANCY, VACANCY, VACANCY, and Pieper Eisenbrown

10. [171762](#) Resolution relating to a Certificate of Appropriateness for replacing garage doors at 3238 N. Sherman Boulevard in the Sherman Boulevard Historic District for Georgia Hill.

Sponsors: THE CHAIR

A motion was made by Marion Clendenen-Acosta, seconded by Patricia Keating Kahn, that this Resolution be ADOPTED. This motion PREVAILED by the following vote:

Aye: 4 - Bauman, Clendenen-Acosta, Jarosz, and Keating Kahn

No: 0

Excused: 5 - VACANCY, VACANCY, VACANCY, VACANCY, and Pieper Eisenbrown

11. **Review and approval of the minutes from the last meeting.**

Ms. Clendenen-Acosta moved, seconded by Ms. Keating Kahn, for approval of the minutes. There were no objections.

12. **Discussion relating to the 2018 Cream of the Cream City Awards.**

There will not be an awards ceremony this year.

13. Updates and announcements.

Ms. Carlen Hatala said the city is waiting for state legislation that might affect how the HPC functions in the future.

Mr. Jarosz said the preservation lecture is March 29th at UWM and he will be sending invitations to members.

Meeting adjourned: 5:44 P.M.

Linda M. Elmer

Staff Assistant

This meeting can be viewed in its entirety through the City's Legislative Research Center at <http://milwaukee.legistar.com/calendar>.