



## Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

**HPC meeting date: 11/06/2023**

**District: 6, Ald. Coggs**

**Staff reviewer: Andrew Stern**

**CC File # 230901**

<b>Property</b>	1923 N. 1 <sup>st</sup> St.	Brewers Hill Historic District
<b>Owner/Applicant</b>	Jaime Hurtado Patrina Hurtado 1923 N. 1 <sup>st</sup> Street. Milwaukee, WI 53212	
<b>Proposal</b>	Replacement of failed vinyl windows with Quaker Residential VuPoint Series vinyl casement windows. Replacement of eleven basement windows with glass block windows and addition of corrugated steel window wells around basement windows. Addition of plastic lattice in front of basement window wells with landscaping planted in front of plastic lattice. Replacement of primary door with a fiberglass door.	
<b>Staff comments</b>	<p>The subject house was constructed in 1895 in the Colonial Revival style. In 1992, the current owners purchased the property and undertook exterior renovations. At that time, HPC allowed for the replacement of windows with new vinyl windows, presumably due to cost considerations relating to the condition of the house at that time. A number of those windows have now failed and the applicant is seeking to replace the double-hung windows with vinyl casement replacements. Regardless of HPC's reasoning in 1992, a formal policy was established against vinyl windows in 1997 with the publication of <i>Living With History</i>.</p> <p>The window guidelines for the Brewers Hill Historic District state: "Respect the stylistic period or periods a building represents. If replacement of window sash or doors is necessary, the replacement should duplicate the appearance and design of the original window sash or door... Avoid the filling in or covering of openings with materials like glass-block or the installation of plastic or metal strip awnings or fake shutters that are not in proportion to the openings or that are historically out of the character with the building." The casement vinyl window design and glass-block basement windows are inconsistent with preservation guidelines for the Brewers Hill Historic District.</p> <p>Likewise, the proposed fiberglass replacement door is of inconsistent design and material for the district. The Commission has consistently required a wood exterior on primary entrance doors. Staff recommends a solid wood replacement door with a design appropriate to this style house.</p> <p>Staff recommends one-over-one wood frame double-hung sash window replacements to match windows present prior to 1992. Staff also recommends either two-light or single-light wood sash replacement windows in the basement. The Commission can consider allowing glass block basement windows on the north and rear, but it is not recommended by staff.</p>	

**Recommendation** Denial.

**Conditions**

**Previous HPC  
action**

**Previous Council  
action**