



Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission

Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date: 7/9/2018
Ald. Robert Bauman District: 4
Staff reviewer: Tim Askin
PTS #114553 CCF #180404

Property 3005 W. KILBOURN AV. Concordia HD

Owner/Applicant CITY OF MILW Amanda Christensen
809 N BROADWAY 3008 S 14th St
MILWAUKEE WI 53202 Milwaukee, WI 53215
(Yves LaPierre) Phone: (414) 731-7303

Proposal

There are two separate scopes of work. There is one for potential purchasers and one for the city to do exterior and structural repairs prior to any purchase. They are highly similar.

Purchaser Summary Scope

The intent is to stabilize the exterior of the building and restore each façade to historic quality. The scope of work consists of the following:

- A. Repointing and repair of exterior brick masonry, chimneys
- B. Rebuilding of damaged corner parapets with salvaged materials
- C. Repair and rebuilding of crown and dentil mould detailing
- D. Repair of deteriorated existing historic windows
- E. Replacement of all non-original windows with historically appropriate wood windows
- F. Repair of wood window bay on west façade
- G. Repair of porch canopy
- H. Repair of historic entry door

City Summary Scope

1. Structure has incurred severe water damage and framing must be rebuilt at all deteriorated areas. This includes wall framing, floor joists, sill plates to attic eaves. Framing to be rebuilt from inside of house in order to preserve exterior masonry walls. All new framing must be secured to existing framing and exterior masonry walls.
2. Roof to be repaired and any leaks must be sealed. Remove the two dormers, one at front, and one at east side of house roof. Rebuild roof structure at these locations, install sheathing at these locations and install roofing to match existing roofing. Repaired roof area must be integrated into existing roof and not be noticeable. Repair roof and gutters on east bay. Repair brick and wood at eaves.
3. Remove all trees and shrubs in front, side and backyard, at property lines and at perimeter of house and east of driveway along neighboring building. Grind down any large tree stumps.
4. West chimney: dismantle to below the roofline. Repair roof and eaves at this location.
5. East Chimney - Brick pattern and details must be carefully documented, chimney dismantled, bricks saved and cleaned. Any replacement bricks must match materials and dimensions of original brick. Clean chimney after complete; this is especially necessary if brick used is discolored cream city brick. Cleaning product to be Diedrich's applied per manufacturer's directions. Brick cleaning to be done before roofing to avoid staining roof. All wood and roofing to be protected from masonry cleaning chemicals.
6. At rear of house, remove fire escape. Repair any damaged brick areas. Board any open windows or doors exposed by demo and removal of fire escape.
7. Rebuild eaves; replace any rotted or missing fascia boards, soffit boards, crown molding, trim, brackets etc.... All new trim must replicate historic trim of house.

Staff comments

Staff recommends approval of the Purchaser/Christensen scope of work with conditions. The city scope has some controversial points, but it is generally approvable with conditions.

There are two points that are not necessarily in compliance with the guidelines and deliberation by the Commission is requested for the following:

1. Remove east chimney (joint request)
 - a. The east chimney is in a notable state of decay and no longer in use, but is repairable. It does not serve any fireplaces and appears to have only ever been a service chimney. It is relatively plain, but is clearly original with matching brick. It adds character and balance to the west elevation.
 - b. Staff would not typically support such a request, but if the chimney were hand-deconstructed, it would provide an excellent supply of salvage brick for use in more prominent locations.
 - c. If the Commission chooses to allow its removal, 100% hand demolition and salvage of the brick should be a condition of approval.
2. Remove shingled front dormer
 - a. The shingled dormer at front is a point of dispute amongst city staff. Ms. Hatala believes it is original or a pre-1920 alteration, Mr. Askin is inclined to believe it is a pre-1920 alteration, and Mr. LaPierre is convinced it is not original and not worth keeping.
 - b. Potential purchasers appear willing to keep it, but this is unclear.
 - c. It is not aligned with other features on the primary façade, however, this is not necessarily unusual, and it still provides balance to the attic level. It may be an early addition.
 - d. If it is removed, no new dormer is likely to be approved in this location. Front dormer additions are not allowed by HPC or NPS standards.
 - e. HPC staff does not recommend removal.

Recommendation

Recommend HPC Approval with conditions for purchaser (Christensen) scope of work. Allow replacement of casement window in front dormer with new wood hung or casement window. Approve city scope with conditions subject to specific Commission decisions on the two following points.

East chimney: staff is neutral

Dormer removal: staff recommends denial

Conditions

1. Paint gutters and downspouts to match brick, black, or verdigris
2. Prepare complete window schedule of repair v. replacement in coordination with staff
3. Replacement windows will be all wood both inside and out. No vinyl, vinyl-clad, aluminum, aluminum-clad or fiberglass windows are permitted. New glass size must match the original glass size. Coordinate with staff on details.
4. Standard masonry conditions (see appendix) or standard masonry specs from city scope
5. If removal of west chimney is approved, it must be deconstructed by hand without power tools and all brick must be salvaged for reuse. Flue and lining materials may be destroyed power tools and discarded after all exterior brick is carefully removed.
6. The rebuilt chimney(s) must be rebuilt to match the historic including bonding pattern exactly, corbeling, and other details. Accurate measurements shall be taken prior to disassembling so the new chimney exactly matches the historic without alteration.-When installing new flashing at a masonry feature, the flashing must be stepped or cut into the mortar joints. The bricks may not be cut to install flashing at an angle. Documentation required in city scope of work for west chimney repairs must be submitted to and approved by staff before deconstruction may begin. Dimensioned drawings of two sides are necessary along with a description of the brick bonding pattern or a full drawing if the bond is nonstandard.
7. Work completed by Christensen's after purchase shall conform to the standard specifications in the city scope of work included with this file.
8. Reconstruction of porch is to be completed per reconstruction drawings by HPC interns.

9. Clean masonry and with the gentlest method possible. Test samples on the secondary elevations shall be prepared for staff approval before cleaning the entire building.

Previous HPC action

Previous Council action

Appendix: Standard Masonry Conditions

New mortar must match the original mortar in terms of color, texture, grain size, joint width, and joint finish/profile. The compressive strength of the repointing mortar shall be equal or less than the compressive strength of the original mortar and surrounding brick or stone. The replacement mortar shall contain approximately the same ingredient proportions of the original mortar. Mortar that is too hard is subject to premature failure and could damage the masonry. See the city's books *As Good As New* or *Good for Business*, Masonry Chapters, for more information. In most cases, this means a lime mortar with natural hydraulic cement rather than Portland cement. No joint of a width less than 3/8" may be cleaned of damaged/decomposed mortar with power disc grinders. No over-cutting of the joints is permitted. Remove decomposed mortar back into the wall 2.5 times the height of the joint before tuckpointing.

New brick must match as closely as possible the color texture, size, and finish of the original brick.

A sample panel of brick and mortar must be reviewed and approved by HPC staff prior to general installation of the material.