



Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

Living with History

HPC meeting date: 10/19/2015
Ald. Robert Bauman District: 4
Staff reviewer: Dean Doerrfeld
PTS

Property	2908 West McKinley Blvd. Cold Spring Park Historic District
Owner/Applicant	BRAD THURMAN 2908 W. MCKINLEY BLVD. MILWAUKEE, WI 53208 PHONE: (414) 803-3900
Proposal	This project involves the repair and reconstruction of the front porch of this residential property.
Staff Comments	<p>The building was constructed ca. 1901 in a vernacular Colonial Revival style. The building is known as the Edwin F. Rohn house and is attributed to architect/builder H. Messmer & Son. Constructed as a single-family residential unit, the building is a common form in the city and along W. McKinley Blvd. Most buildings present a distinctive front porch to the streetscape although architectural detailing varies greatly amongst the extant buildings.</p> <p>The Cold Spring Park Historic District was listed in the National Register of Historic Places in 1985, and locally designated in 1987.</p> <p>The applicant proposes to repair and reconstruct the front porch of this building. Remaining historic fabric includes modillions, egg-and-dart moldings, pilasters at the building plane, and a simple balconette. Photos from previous surveys show that the porch posts matched the pilasters: rectangular, battered columns with inset panels. The applicant proposes to replace the now-missing posts with pre-fabricated, fiberglass, Tuscan columns. Deteriorated or missing cornice and fascia details will be replicated. The balustrade will be repaired and retained.</p> <p>The proposed replacement columns are not an acceptable replacement for the missing historic elements. Sufficient evidence exists for construction of replacements that approximate what was originally on the house. Additionally, the proposed replacement columns have a mottled, almost concrete-like appearance with some reflection from the glass fibers. The fit at the base of the column is irregular and may lead to additional structural issues in the future. Retaining/replacing the cornice detailing is appropriate for this building.</p> <p>For the applicant to proceed, replacement porch supports should approximate the materials, form, and appearance as represented in photographs of the building.</p>
Recommendation	Repair and reconstruction of front porch as presented by applicant: Disapprove
Conditions	
Previous HPC action	
Previous Council action	