



Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date: 1/8/2024
Staff reviewer: Andrew Stern

Ald. Pratt
CCF # 231339

Property 2610 W. Port Sunlight Way Garden Homes Historic District

Owner/Applicant Wesley S. Bentil
1830 W. Glendale Ave.
Milwaukee, WI 53209

Proposal

The applicant has removed a number of historic windows and replaced them with one-over-one vinyl windows. Applicant is seeking after-the-fact approval for the replacement windows and for future vinyl replacement windows. He is also seeking approval to replace and finish the stucco exterior on the building.

Staff comments

The applicant purchased the subject property from the City of Milwaukee in January 2018. On January 19, 2018, a signed and executed Historic Preservation Easement was recorded between the applicant and the City of Milwaukee. Under the Historic Preservation Easement, the owner agreed to protect, preserve, and maintain all historic features of the property, including the structural integrity of the property. The owner agreed to neither construct, demolish, alter, nor remodel any portion of the property and that any alterations that may affect the historical or structural integrity of the property must have the prior written approval of the Historic Preservation Officer. The owner agreed to “assume the cost of continued maintenance and repair of the property in accordance with the recommended approaches in the Secretary of the United States Department of the Interior’s standards for rehabilitation and associated guidelines, or substantially similar standards of the City, so as to preserve the architectural, structural and historic integrity of the features, materials, appearance, workmanship, and environment” to protect the qualities of the property that make it eligible for listing in the local designation. The easement is binding on the owner and their successors and is running with the land. No approval was received from our office and the changes made to the building do not adhere to City standards of the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.

Even in absence of the Historic Preservation Easement, the guidelines for the Garden Homes Historic District state:

“Retain the original window and door openings, as they are essential to the architectural character of the house. Retain the existing configuration of panes, sash, surrounds and sills, except as necessary to restore to the original condition. Do not change the size or configuration of the original windowpanes or sash.

Respect the building’s stylistic period. If the replacement of doors or window sash is necessary, the replacement should duplicate the appearance and design and material of the original window sash or door. New glass must match the size of the historic glass.

Vinyl, vinyl clad, metal and metal-clad or fiberglass prime window units are not permitted. If new windows are required, replacements will be out of wood and match the six-over-six style of the originals. Insulating glass is allowed in new windows.”

New one-over-one vinyl windows are not appropriate to this property. Given the guidelines for the Garden Homes Historic District and the stipulations agreed to by the applicant when purchasing this property from the City, staff recommends denial of this request. Staff recommends repair and reinstallation of the original windows, if not discarded, or replacement with appropriate six-over-six wood sash windows. Staff recommends approval with conditions for the stucco repair.

Recommendation Recommend HPC denial of replacement windows and HPC approval with conditions for the stucco repair

Conditions

All stucco repairs must be done with genuine Portland cement stucco. No exterior insulation and finish system materials (EIFS) are allowed. New stucco should match the original in terms of texture, hardness and thickness. A liquid bonding agent approved for exterior stucco work should be used on the edges of all old stucco where it will join new stucco patches. This will usually prevent hairline cracks between the new and old work. For large patches, metal lath can be screwed over the old wood lath for a better bond of the base coat. Because there are differing stucco textures on the house, each patch must be finished to blend with the stucco texture around it. Please take note of the historic aggregate used in the stucco and make every effort to duplicate it as closely as possible in terms of size, type and texture as it will have a significant impact on the finished texture. Caulk must not be used to patch cracks. Cracks should be dug out to the base lath.

Previous HPC action**Previous Council action**