



CITY OF MILWAUKEE
DEPARTMENT OF EMPLOYEE RELATIONS

Maria Monteagudo
 Department of Employee Relations
 City of Milwaukee
 200 E Wells St, Room 706

April 5, 2019

The Honorable
 Finance and Personnel Committee
 Common Council
 City of Milwaukee

Common Council File No. 181867 – Communication from the Department of Employee Relations relating to classification studies scheduled for City Service Commission action

Dear Committee Members:

The following classifications and pay recommendations will be submitted to the City Service Commission meeting on April 5, 2019.

DEPARTMENT OF CITY DEVELOPMENT–PUBLIC HOUSING PROGRAMS

Current	Recommendation
Building Maintenance Mechanic II PR 7CN (\$40,160 - \$45,391) Four Positions FN: Recruitment is at \$40,639	Facilities Maintenance Mechanic PR 7HN (\$41,774 - \$52,049) Four Positions FN: Range of \$44,099 - \$57,007
Building Maintenance Mechanic I PR 7BN (\$35,376 - \$42,842) Underfill Title FN: Recruitment is at \$38,350	FN: Recruitment anywhere in the range based on experience and credentials with DER approval
Heating and Ventilating Mechanic II PR 7DN (\$37,314 - \$46,567) Two Positions FN: Recruitment is at \$41,700	HVAC Maintenance Technician PR 7NN (\$46,130 - \$65,098) Two Positions FN: Recruitment anywhere in the range based on experience and credentials with DER approval
Heating and Ventilating Mechanic I PR 7CN (\$40,160 - \$45,391) Underfill Title FN: Recruitment is at \$40,639	

DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC WORKS–INFRASTRUCTURE SERVICES–BRIDGES AND BUILDINGS

Bridge Maintenance Manager PR 1HX (\$70,827 - \$99,154) One Position	Bridge Maintenance Manager PR 1IX (\$75,478 - \$105,669) One Position
Maintenance Technician III PR 3HN (\$43,733 - \$50,649) Two Positions FN: Recruitment is at \$44,459	HVAC Maintenance Technician – Senior PR 7ON (\$65,755 - \$65,839) Two Positions FN: Range of \$48,670 - \$67,616 FN: Recruitment anywhere in the range based on experience and credentials with DER approval

Maintenance Technician II PR 3GN (\$40,516 - \$48,248) Four Positions FN: Recruitment is at \$42,535	HVAC Maintenance Technician PR 7NN (\$46,130 - \$65,098) Four Positions FN: Recruitment anywhere in the range based on experience and credentials with DER approval
Maintenance Technician I PR 3FN (\$38,508 - \$47,171) Underfill Title FN: Recruitment is at \$41,700	
Facilities Control Specialist PR 3SN (\$62,060 - \$79,874) One Position FN: Recruitment up to \$72,898 with DER approval	Facilities Maintenance Supervisor PR 1EX (\$58,462 - \$81,844) One Position FN: Recruitment is at \$69,955

DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC WORKS–WATER WORKS

Administration and Project Manager PR 1KX (\$85,757 - \$120,064) One Position	Water Works Administration Manager PR 1MX (\$97,420 - \$136,395) One Position
Water Plants Manager PR 1JX (\$80,442 - \$112,627) One Position	Water Plants Manager PR 1KX (\$85,757 - \$120,064) One Position FN: Recruitment anywhere in the range with approval of DER and Chair of Finance and Personnel
Water Plant Operations Manager PR 1HX (\$70,827 - \$99,154) One Position	Water Plants Operations Manager PR 1IX (\$75,478 - \$105,669) One Position FN: Recruitment is at \$85,000
Water Plant Maintenance Manager PR 1DX (\$54,865 - \$76,806) Two Positions	Water Plant Maintenance Manager PR 1GX (\$66,435 - \$93,010) Two Positions FN: Recruitment is at \$74,225
Water Plant Maintenance Supervisor PR 1CX (\$51,469 - \$72,063) One Position	Water Plants Maintenance Supervisor PR 1FX (\$62,338 - \$87,270) One Position FN: Recruitment is at \$72,020
Water Plant Steamfitter/HVAC Specialist PR 7JN (\$47,588 - \$57,877) Two Positions FN: Recruitment up to \$53,162 with DER approval	Water Plant HVAC Maintenance Technician PR 7QN (\$70,041 - \$70,503) Two Positions FN: Range of \$57,703 - \$72,738 FN: Recruitment anywhere in the range based on experience and credentials with DER approval
Water Works Steamfitter PR 7RN (\$66,327 - \$83,054) Three Positions FN: Recruitment anywhere in the range based on experience and credentials with DER approval	Water Plant Steamfitter PR 7RN (\$66,327 - \$83,054) Three Positions FN: Recruitment anywhere in the range based on experience and credentials with DER approval
Machine Repairperson PR 7JN (\$47,588 - \$57,877) 17 Positions	Water Plant Machine Repairperson PR 7QN (\$70,041 - \$70,503) 18 Positions FN: Range of \$57,703 - \$72,738 FN: Recruitment anywhere in the range based on experience and credentials with DER approval
Metal Fabricator PR 7HN (\$41,774 - \$52,049) One Position FN: Recruitment is at \$45,327	

Machinery Technician PR 7GN (\$41,096 - \$50,649) Underfill Title FN: Recruitment is at \$44,459	Water Plant Machinery Mechanic PR 7LN (\$49,921 - \$60,663) Underfill Title FN: Range of \$47,602 - \$61,046 FN: Recruitment anywhere in the range based on experience and credentials with DER approval
Facility Mechanic PR 7DN (\$37,314 - \$46,567) Underfill Title FN: Recruitment is at \$40,723	Water Plant Facility Mechanic PR 7HN (\$41,774 - \$52,049) Underfill Title FN: Range of \$44,099 - \$57,007 FN: Recruitment anywhere in the range based on experience and credentials with DER approval

HEALTH DEPARTMENT

Heating and Ventilating Mechanic III PR 7FN (\$39,138 - \$48,402) One Position FN: Recruitment is at \$43,401	HVAC Maintenance Technician PR 7NN (\$46,130 - \$65,098) Three Positions FN: Recruitment anywhere in the range based on experience and credentials with DER approval
Custodial Worker II – City Laborer PR 8DN (\$33,857 - \$40,450) Two Positions FN: Recruitment is at \$36,480	

LIBRARY

Library Facilities Manager PR 1EX (\$58,462 - \$81,844) One Position	Facilities Manager PR 1HX (\$70,827 - \$99,154) One Position
Building Maintenance Supervisor II PR 1BX (\$48,670 - \$67,616) One Position	Facilities Maintenance Supervisor PR 1EX (\$58,462 - \$81,844) One Position FN: Recruitment is at \$69,955
Heating and Ventilating Mechanic III PR 7FN (\$39,138 - \$48,402) One Position FN: Recruitment is at \$43,401	HVAC Maintenance Technician – Senior PR 7ON (\$65,755 - \$65,839) One Position FN: Range of \$48,670 - \$67,616 FN: Recruitment anywhere in the range based on experience and credentials with DER approval
Heating and Ventilating Mechanic II PR 7DN (\$37,314 - \$46,567) Two Positions FN: Recruitment is at \$41,700	HVAC Maintenance Technician PR 7NN (\$46,130 - \$65,098) Two Positions FN: Recruitment anywhere in the range based on experience and credentials with DER approval

HEALTH DEPARTMENT

Current	Recommendation
One New Position Position authority per CCFN 181270	Doula Program Manager PR 1EX (\$58,462 - \$81,844) One Position FN: Recruitment is at \$63,807
Four New Positions Position authority per CCFN 181270	Doula PR 2EN (\$45,306 - \$63,426) Four Positions

Respectfully submitted,



Maria Monteagudo
Employee Relations Director

Attachments: Job Evaluation Reports
Fiscal Impact Statement

C: Rocky Marcoux, Martha Brown, Vanessa Armstrong, Todd Slusar, Jeffrey Polenske, Laura Daniels, Dan Thomas, Dawn Crowbridge, Craig Liberto, Matthew Mortwedt, Lindsey O'Connor, Karen Dettmer, Patrick Pauly, Amy Hefter, Daniel Welk, Paula Kiely, Jennifer Meyer-Stearns, Victoria Robertson, Jeanette Kowalik, Jennifer Freiheit, Rebecca Rowland, Kerry Mitchell, Lori Hoffman, Dennis Yaccarino, Bill Christianson, Molly King, Mason Lavey, Nick Sinram, Nicole Fleck, Ken Wischer

JOB EVALUATION REPORT

City Service Commission Meeting: April 9, 2019

Department of City Development-Public Housing Programs

Current	Recommendation
Building Maintenance Mechanic II PR 7CN (\$40,160 - \$45,391) Four Positions FN: Recruitment is at \$40,639	Facilities Maintenance Mechanic PR 7HN (\$41,774 - \$52,049) Four Positions FN: Range of \$44,099 - \$57,007
Building Maintenance Mechanic I PR 7BN (\$35,376 - \$42,842) Underfill Title FN: Recruitment is at \$38,350	FN: Recruitment anywhere in the range based on experience and credentials with DER approval
Heating and Ventilating Mechanic II PR 7DN (\$37,314 - \$46,567) Two Positions FN: Recruitment is at \$41,700	HVAC Maintenance Technician PR 7NN (\$46,130 - \$65,098) Two Positions FN: Recruitment anywhere in the range based on experience and credentials with DER approval
Heating and Ventilating Mechanic I PR 7CN (\$40,160 - \$45,391) Underfill Title FN: Recruitment is at \$40,639	

Department of Public Works-Infrastructure Services-Bridges and Buildings

Bridge Maintenance Manager PR 1HX (\$70,827 - \$99,154) One Position	Bridge Maintenance Manager PR 1IX (\$75,478 - \$105,669) One Position
Maintenance Technician III PR 3HN (\$43,733 - \$50,649) Two Positions FN: Recruitment is at \$44,459	HVAC Maintenance Technician – Senior PR 7ON (\$65,755 - \$65,839) Two Positions FN: Range of \$48,670 - \$67,616 FN: Recruitment anywhere in the range based on experience and credentials with DER approval
Maintenance Technician II PR 3GN (\$40,516 - \$48,248) Four Positions FN: Recruitment is at \$42,535	HVAC Maintenance Technician PR 7NN (\$46,130 - \$65,098) Four Positions FN: Recruitment anywhere in the range based on experience and credentials with DER approval
Maintenance Technician I PR 3FN (\$38,508 - \$47,171) Underfill Title FN: Recruitment is at \$41,700	
Facilities Control Specialist PR 3SN (\$62,060 - \$79,874) One Position FN: Recruitment up to \$72,898 with DER approval	Facilities Maintenance Supervisor PR 1EX (\$58,462 - \$81,844) One Position FN: Recruitment is at \$69,955

Department of Public Works-Water Works

Administration and Project Manager PR 1KX (\$85,757 - \$120,064) One Position	Water Works Administration Manager PR 1MX (\$97,420 - \$136,395) One Position
---	---

<p>Water Plants Manager PR 1JX (\$80,442 - \$112,627) One Position</p>	<p>Water Plants Manager PR 1KX (\$85,757 - \$120,064) One Position FN: Recruitment anywhere in the range with approval of DER and Chair of Finance and Personnel</p>
<p>Water Plant Operations Manager PR 1HX (\$70,827 - \$99,154) One Position</p>	<p>Water Plants Operations Manager PR 1IX (\$75,478 - \$105,669) One Position FN: Recruitment is at \$85,000</p>
<p>Water Plant Maintenance Manager PR 1DX (\$54,865 - \$76,806) Two Positions</p>	<p>Water Plant Maintenance Manager PR 1GX (\$66,435 - \$93,010) Two Positions FN: Recruitment is at \$74,225</p>
<p>Water Plant Maintenance Supervisor PR 1CX (\$51,469 - \$72,063) One Position</p>	<p>Water Plants Maintenance Supervisor PR 1FX (\$62,338 - \$87,270) One Position FN: Recruitment is at \$72,020</p>
<p>Water Plant Steamfitter/HVAC Specialist PR 7JN (\$47,588 - \$57,877) Two Positions FN: Recruitment up to \$53,162 with DER approval</p>	<p>Water Plant HVAC Maintenance Technician PR 7QN (\$70,041 - \$70,503) Two Positions FN: Range of \$57,703 - \$72,738 FN: Recruitment anywhere in the range based on experience and credentials with DER approval</p>
<p>Water Works Steamfitter PR 7RN (\$66,327 - \$83,054) Three Positions FN: Recruitment anywhere in the range based on experience and credentials with DER approval</p>	<p>Water Plant Steamfitter PR 7RN (\$66,327 - \$83,054) Three Positions FN: Recruitment anywhere in the range based on experience and credentials with DER approval</p>
<p>Machine Repairperson PR 7JN (\$47,588 - \$57,877) 17 Positions</p>	<p>Water Plant Machine Repairperson PR 7QN (\$70,041 - \$70,503) 18 Positions FN: Range of \$57,703 - \$72,738 FN: Recruitment anywhere in the range based on experience and credentials with DER approval</p>
<p>Metal Fabricator PR 7HN (\$41,774 - \$52,049) One Position FN: Recruitment is at \$45,327</p>	
<p>Machinery Technician PR 7GN (\$41,096 - \$50,649) Underfill Title FN: Recruitment is at \$44,459</p>	<p>Water Plant Machinery Mechanic PR 7LN (\$49,921 - \$60,663) Underfill Title FN: Range of \$47,602 - \$61,046 FN: Recruitment anywhere in the range based on experience and credentials with DER approval</p>
<p>Facility Mechanic PR 7DN (\$37,314 - \$46,567) Underfill Title FN: Recruitment is at \$40,723</p>	<p>Water Plant Facility Mechanic PR 7HN (\$41,774 - \$52,049) Underfill Title FN: Range of \$44,099 - \$57,007 FN: Recruitment anywhere in the range based on experience and credentials with DER approval</p>

Health Department

Heating and Ventilating Mechanic III PR 7FN (\$39,138 - \$48,402) One Position FN: Recruitment is at \$43,401	HVAC Maintenance Technician PR 7NN (\$46,130 - \$65,098) Three Positions FN: Recruitment anywhere in the range based on experience and credentials with DER approval
Custodial Worker II – City Laborer PR 8DN (\$33,857 - \$40,450) Two Positions FN: Recruitment is at \$36,480	

Library

Library Facilities Manager PR 1EX (\$58,462 - \$81,844) One Position	Facilities Manager PR 1HX (\$70,827 - \$99,154) One Position
Building Maintenance Supervisor II PR 1BX (\$48,670 - \$67,616) One Position	Facilities Maintenance Supervisor PR 1EX (\$58,462 - \$81,844) One Position FN: Recruitment is at \$69,955
Heating and Ventilating Mechanic III PR 7FN (\$39,138 - \$48,402) One Position FN: Recruitment is at \$43,401	HVAC Maintenance Technician – Senior PR 7ON (\$65,755 - \$65,839) One Position FN: Range of \$48,670 - \$67,616 FN: Recruitment anywhere in the range based on experience and credentials with DER approval
Heating and Ventilating Mechanic II PR 7DN (\$37,314 - \$46,567) Two Positions FN: Recruitment is at \$41,700	HVAC Maintenance Technician PR 7NN (\$46,130 - \$65,098) Two Positions FN: Recruitment anywhere in the range based on experience and credentials with DER approval

Background

The Department of Employee Relations has received requests to study HVAC (Heating, Ventilating, and Air Conditioning) and maintenance positions in various City departments due to difficulties in recruiting and retaining employees. This report covers several HVAC and maintenance positions located in five different departments or divisions including the Department of City Development-Public Housing Programs, Department of Public Works-Infrastructure Services-Bridges and Buildings, Department of Public Works-Water Works, Health Department, and the Library. This report also includes some supervisory and management positions as Employee Relations staff also considered pay compression issues.

Current job descriptions were provided and discussions were held with department representatives. The recommended new rates of pay for these positions are based in part on an assessment of the cost of labor within southeastern Wisconsin as well as comparisons to comparable positions within city government. To assist the department in recruiting for these positions, this report also recommends structured recruitment flexibility with approval from the Department of Employee Relations. The majority of changes in classifications and pay rates in this report are as a result of a market pay studies. Employees in these titles will receive an increase only if their current rate of pay (City resident) is lower than the newly recommended minimum rate of pay. For two positions, Bridge Maintenance Manager and Library Facilities Manager, there are significant changes in duties and responsibilities and the recommended changes in pay ranges would be considered a promotion.

The following tables provide turnover data and recruitment efforts held between 2015 and the present for the titles listed below:

Title	Department	Positions	Entries	Exits	Currently Vacant
Water Plant Steamfitter	Water Works	3	2	1	0
Facilities Control Specialist	Library	1	1	1	0
HVAC Specialist	Water Works	2	2	4	1
Machine Repairperson (incl. underfill)	Water Works	17	5	11	11
Maintenance Technician III	DPW-Infrastructure	2	6	5	1
Heating & Ventilating Mechanic III	Health	1	0	1	1
	Library	1	0	0	0
Maintenance Technician II	DPW-Infrastructure	4	6	5	0
Heating & Ventilating Mechanic II	City Development	1	0	0	0
	Library	2	0	1	1
Building Maintenance Mechanic II	City Development	3	0	0	0
Building Maintenance Mechanic I	City Development	1	0	0	0
Metal Fabricator	Water Works	1	0	1	1
General City Totals		39	22	30	16

This data shows that, for the HVAC or maintenance technician titles in general City departments, there is currently a 41% vacancy rate. During this same time period, the DER Staffing Division has conducted the following examinations sessions for the following titles:

Title	Sessions	Applicants	Rejects	No Shows	Fails	Eligible	Withdrawn	Struck	Hired
Maintenance Technician II	13	187	114	20	9	21	5	2	4
Machinery Technician	1	21	10	4	0	6	1	0	0
Building Maintenance Mechanic II	3	29	10	5	1	12	0	0	1
Total	17	237	134	29	10	39	6	2	5

This data shows that, as a result of 17 test administration sessions, the City has been able to successfully hire five candidates. In order to meet ongoing work demands, it has been necessary for City departments to engage contractors. In the case of DPW-Infrastructure, the cost of outsourcing has been between \$110 and \$160 per hour. Last year DPW-Infrastructure did retain a dedicated contract employee with a final annual cost of \$65,063 and expects the need for three such contract employees in 2019.

Department of City Development-Public Housing Programs

Current	Building Maintenance Mechanic II	Pay Range 7CN (\$40,160 - \$45,391) • Recruitment is at \$40,639	4 Positions
Current	Building Maintenance Mechanic I	Pay Range 7BN (\$35,376 - \$42,842) • Recruitment is at \$38,350	Underfill Title
Recommended	Facilities Maintenance Mechanic	Pay Range 7HN (\$41,774 - \$52,049) • Range of \$44,099 - \$57,007 • Recruitment anywhere in the range based on experience and credentials with DER approval	4 Positions

These are skilled technical maintenance positions that perform special and preventive maintenance and repairs on plumbing, electrical, and HVAC systems. They may also be assigned to a cluster of housing developments to troubleshoot and solve complex maintenance problems. Duties include repairing and replacing air compressors; inspecting and repairing boiler piping and controls; repairing, replacing, and adjusting HVAC controls; balancing heating and cooling systems; testing and replacing fuses and breakers; and repairing and replacing motors, pumps, valves, piping joints, and sump pumps.

Minimum requirements include two years of building maintenance, repair, and mechanical experience working in the capacity of building engineer (or comparable). Experience must include maintaining and repairing HVAC equipment as well as mechanical, electrical, electronic, and other building components.

In determining the recommendations for these positions, comparisons were made to external market rates of pay for positions with similar duties and responsibilities. The rates from ERI shown below reflect the minimum and maximum rates of pay at the 10th, 25th, mean, 75th and 90th percentiles of the labor market:

Maintenance Repairer Industrial

Years' Experience	10 th Percentile	25 th Percentile	Survey Mean	75 th Percentile	90 th Percentile
7	\$49,334	\$52,514	\$57,007	\$60,970	\$65,233
5	\$46,124	\$49,058	\$53,213	\$56,868	\$60,828
3	\$42,328	\$45,051	\$48,831	\$52,104	\$55,696
1	\$37,984	\$40,575	\$44,099	\$46,988	\$50,164

Source: ERI. Published Q2 of 2019. (30-Mile Radius of Milwaukee)

ERI defines a Maintenance Repairer Industrial as a position that repairs, installs, and maintains machinery, equipment, physical structures, and pipe and electrical systems in commercial or industrial establishments, following specifications, blueprints, manuals, and schematic drawings, using hand tools, power tools, hoist, crane, and measuring and testing instruments.

Based on a review of the market data, we recommend that these four positions be changed to Pay Range 7HN (\$41,774 - \$52,049) with a footnote that provides the range of \$44,099 - \$57,007 which is equal to the mean average for an individual with one to seven years of experience. We further recommend that the underfill classification be eliminated and the title be changed to Facilities Maintenance Mechanic. This title will be more consistent with other current titles such as Facility Mechanic, Facilities Maintenance Coordinator, and Facilities Project Coordinator.

To assist with recruitment and retention, this report further recommends recruitment at any point in the range based on experience and credentials with the approval of DER.

Current	Heating and Ventilating Mechanic II	Pay Range 7DN (\$37,314 - \$46,567) • Recruitment is at \$41,700	2 Positions
Current	Heating and Ventilating Mechanic I	Pay Range 7CN (\$40,160 - \$45,391) • Recruitment is at \$40,639	Underfill Title
Recommended	HVAC Maintenance Technician	Pay Range 7NN (\$46,130 - \$65,098) • Recruitment anywhere in the range based on experience and credentials with DER approval	2 Positions

These positions are responsible for performing advanced maintenance, repair, inspection, and replacement of a wide range of equipment and systems. Duties include operating, maintaining, repairing, and replacing HVAC equipment including air handling units, cooling towers, chillers, boilers, and roof-top units; operating and maintaining related

electronic motors, starters, wiring fuses, protective devices, and controls; and providing general repair and maintenance of mechanical, electrical, and electronic controls.

Minimum requirements include an associate's degree in the HVAC field and three years of experience in the maintenance and repair of HVAC/refrigeration equipment and other mechanical, electrical, and electronic automated building systems or five years of related experience; and a Chlorofluorocarbon (CFC) certification from the State of Wisconsin within six months of appointment and throughout employment. Equivalent combinations of education and experience may be considered.

In determining the recommendations for these positions, comparisons were made to external market rates of pay for positions with similar duties and responsibilities. The rates from ERI shown below reflect the minimum and maximum rates of pay at the 10th, 25th, mean, 75th and 90th percentiles of the labor market:

Heating and Air Conditioning Mechanic (HVAC)

Years' Experience	10 th Percentile	25 th Percentile	Survey Mean	75 th Percentile	90 th Percentile
7	\$54,111	\$58,350	\$64,121	\$69,536	\$75,148
5	\$50,915	\$54,865	\$60,282	\$65,346	\$70,620
3	\$47,418	\$51,035	\$56,041	\$60,708	\$65,598
1	\$43,730	\$47,055	\$51,606	\$55,838	\$60,312

Source: ERI. Published Q2 of 2019. (30-Mile Radius of Milwaukee)

ERI defines a Heating, Ventilating and Air Conditioning (HVAC) Mechanic as a position that installs, services, and repairs heating, ventilating, air conditioning systems, and related environmental-control systems utilizing knowledge of heating and refrigeration theory, pipefitting, and structural layout ; mounts compressor and condenser units on platform or floor, using hand tools, following blueprints or engineering specifications; and fabricates, assembles and installs ductwork and chassis parts, using portable metalworking tools and welding equipment.

Based on a review of the rates above and the desire to eliminate the underfill title, we recommend these two positions be changed to Pay Range 7NN (\$46,130 - \$65,098). Due to the technical nature of the work, we recommend that the title be changed to HVAC Maintenance Technician. We therefore recommend that these two positions be reclassified from Heating and Ventilating Mechanic II in Pay Range 7DN (\$37,314 - \$46,567) with a recruitment rate of \$41,700 to HVAC Maintenance Technician in Pay Range 7NN (\$46,130 - \$65,098).

To assist with recruitment and retention, this report further recommends recruitment at any point in the range based on experience and credentials with approval of DER.

Department of Public Works-Infrastructure Services-Bridges and Buildings

Current	Bridge Maintenance Manager	Pay Range 1HX (\$70,827 - \$99,154)	1 Position
Recommended	Bridge Maintenance Manager	Pay Range 1IX (\$75,478 - \$105,669)	1 Position

This position manages and is responsible for all personnel activities in the Bridge Operations and Maintenance Unit, and for planning, programming, coordinating, scheduling, and supervising all activities pertaining to bridge maintenance and repair programs for bridges, viaducts, and pedestrian bridges under the jurisdiction of DPW-Infrastructure Services. This position also manages, supervises, and coordinates all activities pertaining to the operation of the movable bridges under the jurisdiction of DPW-Infrastructure Services; manages and assists in the preparation of the operational budget; is responsible for the day to day activities of the bridge maintenance crew and reviews each crew leader's time sheet for accuracy and to verify the proper disbursement of labor, equipment, and material for each work order; determines and directs safe work procedures and the training of field crews; makes

recommendations for bridge reconstruction projects; direct operations and maintenance (O&M) projects such as bridge deck, abutment, and stairway repairs; coordinates the snow removal from City-owned bridges; answers inquiries and requests for municipal services from citizens, advocacy groups, other DPW divisions, contractors, and elected officials; and recommends and enforces disciplinary actions.

Minimum requirements include a bachelor's degree in civil engineering, registration as a Professional Engineer in Wisconsin at time of appointment and throughout employment, and five years of municipal civil engineering experience, including two years in a supervisory/lead worker role.

The department has indicated that there have been a number of changes in this position that would support a reclassification. Due to a restructuring within DPW-Infrastructure Services in 2014, this position is now the head of a decision unit and has taken on bridge-related managerial duties that were previously performed by the Street and Bridge Services Manager position in Pay Range 1JX (\$80,442 - \$112,627). These duties include being responsible for all personnel matters involving division policies, discipline, promotions, vacations, sick leave, labor relations, rules and regulations; safety equipment and training for Bridge Operations and Bridge Maintenance crews; managing and assisting in preparations for the Decision Unit's operations and budget; approving all decision unit reports, investigations, correspondence, and purchase requests and requisitions; and preparing, administering, and reviewing vendor contracts, service orders, and bids for supplemental skilled trade work and bridge maintenance activities.

With these changes, we recommend the higher pay range of 1IX (\$75,478 - \$105,669). This pay range will make the position more consistent with other DPW positions that require a professional engineer license. We therefore recommend one position of Bridge Maintenance Manager in Pay Range 1IX (\$70,827 - \$99,154) be reallocated to Pay Range 1IX (\$75,478 - \$105,669).

Current	Maintenance Technician III	Pay Range 3HN (\$43,733 - \$50,649) • Recruitment is at \$44,459	2 Positions
Recommended	HVAC Maintenance Technician – Senior	Pay Range 7ON (\$65,755 - \$65,839) • Range of \$48,670 - \$67,616 • Recruitment anywhere in the range based on experience and credentials with DER approval	2 Positions

These positions perform a variety of repair, cleaning, and maintenance of all equipment related to buildings under the control of DPW-Infrastructure Services and functions in the role of a lead worker in coordinating maintenance activity. Duties include leading crews in performing maintenance projects; repairing, servicing, cleaning, and maintaining existing heating, ventilating, and air conditioning systems; and general repair and maintenance of equipment including technical and electronic controls and lighting elements.

Minimum requirements include an associate's degree in the HVAC field and three years of experience in the maintenance and repair of HVAC/refrigeration equipment and other mechanical, electrical, and electronic automated building systems or five years of related experience; and a Chlorofluorocarbon (CFC) certification from the State of Wisconsin within six months of appointment and throughout employment. Equivalent combinations of education and experience may be considered.

In determining the recommendations for these positions, comparisons were made to external market rates of pay for positions with similar duties and responsibilities. The rates from ERI shown below reflect the minimum and maximum rates of pay at the 10th, 25th, mean, 75th and 90th percentiles of the labor market:

Heating and Air Conditioning Mechanic (HVAC)

Years' Experience	10 th Percentile	25 th Percentile	Survey Mean	75 th Percentile	90 th Percentile
7	\$54,111	\$58,350	\$64,121	\$69,536	\$75,148
5	\$50,915	\$54,865	\$60,282	\$65,346	\$70,620
3	\$47,418	\$51,035	\$56,041	\$60,708	\$65,598
1	\$43,730	\$47,055	\$51,606	\$55,838	\$60,312

Source: ERI. Published Q2 of 2019. (30-Mile Radius of Milwaukee)

The rates listed above for Heating and Air Conditioning Mechanic (HVAC) were utilized for the recommended classification of HVAC Maintenance Technician in Pay Range 7NN (\$46,130 - \$65,098). As these positions serve as a lead worker, we recommend these positions be placed in the next higher Pay Range 7ON (\$65,755 - \$65,839) with a footnoted range of (\$48,670 - \$67,616) to provide a sufficient differential. To correlate the title with the recommended title of the positions they lead, HVAC Maintenance Technician, we recommend the title be changed to HVAC Maintenance Technician – Senior.

We therefore recommend these two positions of Maintenance Technician III in Pay Range 3HN (\$43,733 - \$50,649) with a recruitment rate of \$44,459 be reclassified to HVAC Maintenance Technician – Senior in Pay Range 7ON (\$65,755 - \$65,839) with a footnoted range of (\$48,670 - \$67,616).

To assist with recruitment and retention, this report further recommends recruitment at any point in the range based on experience and credentials with approval of DER.

Current	Maintenance Technician II	Pay Range 3GN (\$40,516 - \$48,248) • Recruitment is at \$42,535	4 Positions
Current	Maintenance Technician I	Pay Range 3FN (\$38,508 - \$47,171) • Recruitment is at \$41,700	Underfill Title
Recommended	HVAC Maintenance Technician	Pay Range 7NN (\$46,130 - \$65,098) • Recruitment anywhere in the range based on experience and credentials with DER approval	4 Positions

These positions repair, adjust, maintain and clean all equipment related to facilities under the control of DPW–Infrastructure Services. This includes repairs, programming, and operation of HVAC refrigeration systems, digital controls, fire-life safety systems for high rise Class A commercial buildings, and other facilities.

Minimum requirements include an associate’s degree in the HVAC field and three years of experience in the maintenance and repair of HVAC/refrigeration equipment and other mechanical, electrical, and electronic automated building systems or five years of related experience; and a Chlorofluorocarbon (CFC) certification from the State of Wisconsin within six months of appointment and throughout employment. Equivalent combinations of education and experience may be considered.

These positions are comparable to the Heating and Ventilating Mechanics I and II in the Department of City Development listed above and based on market comparisons we recommend that these positions also be reclassified to HVAC Maintenance Technician in Pay Range 7NN (\$46,130 - \$65,098).

To assist with recruitment and retention this report further recommends recruitment at any point in the range based on experience and credentials with approval of DER.

Current	Facilities Control Specialist	Pay Range 3SN (\$62,060 - \$79,874)	1 Position
Recommended	Facilities Maintenance Supervisor	Pay Range 1EX (\$58,462 - \$81,844) • Recruitment at \$69,955	1 Position

This position manages the building maintenance functions in all facilities managed by DPW-Infrastructure Services, including a combination of in-house trades and contracted work. This includes supervising the building maintenance staff and managing their day-to-day activities including daily shift briefings, job assignments, follow-up on progress, and employee performance evaluations; managing contracted maintenance work; and managing the maintenance of building automation, fire alarm, and fire sprinkler systems.

Minimum requirements include an associate's degree in HVAC-R (Heating, Ventilating, Air Conditioning and Refrigeration) or electrical technology/building automation with two years of supervisory experience in building services and facilities. Equivalent combinations of education and experience may be considered. These requirements have not yet been assessed by the Staffing Division.

The department wishes to repurpose this technical position to a management supervisory position that will oversee the building maintenance functions in all facilities managed by DPW-Infrastructure Services. In determining the recommendation for this position, comparisons were made to external market rates of pay for positions with similar duties and responsibilities. The rates from ERI shown below reflect the minimum and maximum rates of pay at the 10th, 25th, mean, 75th and 90th percentiles of the labor market:

Maintenance Manager

Years' Experience	10 th Percentile	25 th Percentile	Survey Mean	75 th Percentile	90 th Percentile
7	\$70,638	\$76,646	\$84,570	\$92,254	\$99,978
5	\$65,953	\$71,589	\$79,010	\$86,202	\$93,461
3	\$60,485	\$65,629	\$72,487	\$79,091	\$85,790
1	\$54,601	\$59,218	\$65,422	\$71,368	\$77,443

Source: ERI. Published Q2 of 2019. (30-Mile Radius of Milwaukee)

ERI defines a Maintenance Manager as a position that supervises, directs, and coordinates the activities of workers engaged in repair, maintenance, and installation of machines, tools, and equipment; reviews job orders to determine work priorities for staff; and schedules repair, maintenance, and installation of machines, tools, and equipment to ensure continuous production operations.

In reviewing the market data listed above, a pay range that is close to the average mean rates for one to seven years of experience would be Pay Range 1EX (\$58,462 - \$81,844). We further recommend a recruitment rate of \$69,955 to provide a differential in pay from the positions that it supervises. Other management positions in this pay range with similar duties include Fire Equipment Repairs Manager and Port Facilities Supervisor.

To reflect the management and supervisory duties and responsibilities, we recommend the title of Facilities Maintenance Supervisor. We therefore recommend this position of Facilities Control Specialist in Pay Range 3SN (\$62,060 - \$79,874) be reclassified to Facilities Maintenance Supervisor in Pay Range 1EX (\$58,462 - \$81,844) and that a footnote be created with a recruitment rate of \$69,955.

Department of Public Works-Water Works

Current	Administration and Project Manager	Pay Range 1KX (\$85,757 - \$120,064)	1 Position
Recommended	Water Works Administration Manager	Pay Range 1MX (\$97,420 - \$136,395)	1 Position

This position is the second highest position in Milwaukee Water Works and provides leadership and direction to ensure the Water Works' utility continuously meets and exceeds all United States Environmental Protection Agency,

Wisconsin Department of Natural Resources, and City of Milwaukee regulatory requirements to provide customers with safe and sufficient water at all times; directs and administers the work life culture for all Water Works employee; directs major multidisciplinary construction projects and other initiatives for the utility by providing leadership in a team-based setting to facilitate, plan, and implement effective monitoring through successful completion; and acts as Water Works Superintendent in his or her absence.

Minimum requirements include a bachelor's degree in engineering, business administration, economics, science, or related field and five years of supervisory and managerial experience over a significant organizational unit. Equivalent combinations of education and experience may be considered.

In determining the recommendation for this position, comparisons were made to external market rates of pay for positions with similar duties and responsibilities. The 2017 American Water Works Association (AWWA) Compensation Survey (Population Size of 500,000 – 1,000,000-All Participants) has the following rates for some leadership positions:

Title	Rates
Top Executive	\$115,999 - \$194,745
Top Operations and Maintenance Executive	\$106,420 - \$168,210
Top Administrative Executive	\$88,847 - \$137,066

AWWA provides the following definitions for the titles listed above:

Top Executive

Under general direction of the city, managing board of directors, mayor, or board of water commissioners is responsible for managing, planning, coordinating, and administering all activities of the water department and/or water company; and is responsible for the short- and long-range strategy of the organization subject to review by the board.

Top Operations and Maintenance Executive

Directs and administers the Operations/Maintenance Division functions of source and supply, water treatment, water quality, water control, transmission and distribution, maintenance, and process control.

Top Administrative Executive

Under general direction of the Top Executive, is responsible for all administrative functions, including Human Resources, the Affirmative Action Program, Customer Services, General Services, Administrative Services and Property Administration.

Although none of these titles are a direct match to the position under study, they do share some of the functions performed and support an increase in salary for this position. The position under study is stronger than the Top Administrative Executive (\$88,847 - \$137,066) as it has a broader range of duties and responsibilities but is not as strong as the Top Executive (\$115,999 - \$194,745) as it serves as the second highest position within Milwaukee Water Works. We recommend that this position be moved to Pay Range 1MX (\$97,420 - \$136,395). To clarify the role of this position and to make it more consistent with other DPW leadership positions, we recommend the title be changed to Water Works Administrative Manager. This title and pay range will make it comparable to the Infrastructure Administrative Manager in Pay Range 1MX (\$97,420 - \$136,395).

Current	Water Plants Manager	Pay Range 1JX (\$80,442 - \$112,627)	1 Position
Recommended	Water Plants Manager	Pay Range 1KX (\$85,757 - \$120,064) • Recruitment anywhere in the range with approval of DER & Chair of Finance and Personnel	1 Position

This position plans, manages, coordinates, and monitors the overall operations, budget, and projects for the two water treatment plants, three major pumping stations, seven booster pumping stations, two elevated storage tanks, and four above-ground water storage tanks that provide safe and sufficient potable water to customers; manages the staff, facilities, and treatment processes to ensure that mandated state and federal rules and regulations and City and department policies and procedures are in place, followed, and monitored.

Minimum requirements include a bachelor’s degree in chemistry, engineering, environmental sciences, or related area and five years of experience in management and water treatment, water quality, or water engineering. Equivalent combinations of education and experience may be considered. The requirements have not been assessed by the Staffing Division.

In determining the recommendation for this position, and the next three management positions, comparisons were made to external market rates of pay for positions with similar duties and responsibilities. The 2017 American Water Works Association (AWWA) Compensation Survey (Population Size of 500,000 – 1,000,000-All Participants) has the following rates for some management positions:

Title	Rates
Top Operations and Maintenance Executive	\$106,420 - \$168,210
Water Operations Manager	\$72,147 - \$111,664
Water Treatment Plant Manager	\$65,604 - \$104,579
Water Maintenance Manager	\$65,734 - \$100,866

AWWA provides the following definitions for the titles listed above:

Top Operations and Maintenance Executive

Directs and administers the Operations/Maintenance Division functions of source and supply, water treatment, water quality, water control, transmission and distribution, maintenance, and process control.

Water Operations Manager

Responsible for the operation of the water distribution system and control of the flow of filtered water into and throughout the system; plans and supervises the operation of all pumping stations and distribution reservoirs; and supervises leak detection activities and 24-hour service department.

Water Treatment Plant Manager

Responsible for all operations of a single water treatment plant including staffing, training, directing operations, maintenance and budgeting.

Water Maintenance Manager

Responsible for the construction and maintenance of the finished water distribution system and related facilities.

Although none of these titles are a direct match to the position under study, they do share some of the functions performed and support an increase in salary for this position. The position under study is stronger than the AWWA Water Treatment Plant Manager (\$65,604 - \$104,579) as it has a broader range of duties and responsibilities including two water treatment plants, three major pumping stations, seven booster pumping stations, two elevated

storage tanks, and four above-ground water storage tanks, but is not as strong as the higher level AWWA Top Operations and Maintenance Executive (\$106,420 - \$168,210) as it has responsibility for other areas including water quality, water control, transmission and distribution and process control.

We recommend that this position be moved up one pay range to Pay Range 1KX (\$85,757 - \$120,064). This will make it comparable to the Engineer in Charge positions in DPW-Infrastructure Services that serve as division heads. We therefore recommend one position of Water Plants Manager in Pay Range 1JX (\$80,442 - \$112,627) be reallocated to Pay Range 1KX (\$85,757 - \$120,064). We further recommend creating a footnote that allows recruitment anywhere in the range with approval of DER and the Chair of the Finance and Personnel Committee.

Current	Water Plant Operations Manager	Pay Range 1HX (\$70,827 - \$99,154)	1 Position
Recommended	Water Plants Operations Manager	Pay Range 1IX (\$75,478 - \$105,669) • Recruitment is at \$85,000	1 Position

This position oversees and manages the operations of two water treatment plants including major pumping stations, booster stations, and elevated and ground storage facilities; is responsible for ensuring the plant is continuously compliant with all applicable federal, state, and local water quality regulations, standards and guidelines; and manages staff, plant processes, equipment, and chemicals to maintain effective high quality water treatment. Minimum requirements include a bachelor's degree in chemistry, biology, engineering, or related field and five years of related experience and a Wisconsin Department of Natural Resources Water Treatment Plant Operator Surface Water certification within one year of appointment and throughout employment. Equivalent combinations of education and experience may be considered.

Although none of the AWWA titles listed above are a direct match to this position under study, they do share some of the functions performed and support an increase in salary. This position is stronger than the AWWA Water Treatment Plant Manager (\$65,604 - \$104,579) as it has a broader range of responsibility for two plants plus pumping and storage facilities. It is not as strong as the AWWA Water Operations Manager (\$72,147 - \$111,664) as it also has responsibility for the water distribution system and supervises leak detection activities.

We recommend this position be moved up one level to Pay Range 1IX (\$75,478 - \$105,669) and that the footnote designation (5) be added to provide a recruitment rate of \$85,000. We further recommend changing the title to Water Plants Operations Manager to reflect that this position is responsible for more than one plant. We therefore recommend one position of Water Plant Operations Manager in Pay Range 1HX (\$70,827 - \$99,154) be reclassified to Water Plants Operations Manager in Pay Range 1IX (\$75,478 - \$105,669) with a recruitment rate of \$85,000.

Current	Water Plant Maintenance Manager	Pay Range 1DX (\$54,865 - \$76,806)	2 Positions
Recommended	Water Plant Maintenance Manager	Pay Range 1GX (\$66,435 - \$93,010) • Recruitment at \$74,225	2 Positions

These positions manage the preventive maintenance and repairs of the two water treatment plants, three major pumping stations, and 12 booster stations; ensure timely preventive repair of pumps, piping, heating and air conditioning systems, boilers, basin cleaning, general building maintenance, and custodial services; coordinate maintenance and repair activities with plant operations and treatment processes; provide supervision of skilled trade staff including setting work priorities, coordinating daily assignments, and monitoring long-term projects; and coordinate maintenance projects with engineering staff, contractors, inspectors, and other staff.

Minimum requirements include four years of recent experience in the maintenance and repair of large industrial facilities, preferably in water or wastewater treatment, performing duties related to these positions with at least one year of experience at the lead worker or supervisor level with responsibility for maintenance scheduling; and

possession of a Fourth Class Stationary Engineers Permit issued by the City of Milwaukee within six months of appointment and throughout employment. Equivalent combinations of education and experience may be considered.

Although none of the AWWA titles listed above are a direct match to these two positions under study, they do share some of the functions performed and support an increase in salary. These positions are not as strong as the AWWA Water Maintenance Manager (\$65,734 - \$100,866) as it has broader scope of responsibilities for construction and maintenance of a finished water distribution system and related facilities. Comparisons were also made to the classification of Building and Facilities from ERI. The rates from ERI shown below reflect the minimum and maximum rates of pay at the 10th, 25th, mean, 75th and 90th percentiles of the labor market:

Years' Experience	10 th Percentile	25 th Percentile	Survey Mean	75 th Percentile	90 th Percentile
7	\$75,948	\$82,404	\$90,901	\$99,229	\$107,580
5	\$71,316	\$77,380	\$85,385	\$93,213	\$101,090
3	\$66,497	\$72,149	\$79,635	\$86,932	\$94,304
1	\$61,601	\$66,828	\$73,779	\$80,528	\$87,373

Source: ERI. Published Q2 of 2019. (30-Mile Radius of Milwaukee)

ERI defines a Building and Facilities Manager as a position that manages, plans, and coordinates, through staff of skilled, semiskilled, and unskilled trade personnel, activities concerned with the operations, repair, maintenance and construction of facilities, equipment, buildings, and grounds to minimize interruption and improve efficiency; plan and oversee such matters as design and development of plant facilities, formulation of operating rules, regulations and procedures; develop procedures for use in event of accidents, fires, or other emergencies; inspect plant facilities or review inspection reports, to determine repairs, replacement, or improvements required; hire, train and supervise building service personnel; and assign workers to duties such as maintenance, repair or renovation and may obtain bids for additional work from outside contractors.

In reviewing the market data, a pay range that is close to the average mean rates in the chart above for one to seven years of experience would be Pay Range 1GX (\$66,435 - \$93,010). We further recommend a recruitment rate of \$74,225 to provide a differential in pay from the positions that it supervises. Other management positions in this pay range with similar duties include Electrical Services Manager and Water Distribution Operations Manager.

We therefore recommend two positions of Water Plant Maintenance Manager in Pay Range 1DX (\$54,865 - \$76,806) be reallocated to Pay Range 1GX (\$66,435 - \$93,010) with a recruitment rate of \$74,225.

Current	Water Plant Maintenance Supervisor	Pay Range 1CX (\$51,469 - \$72,063)	1 Position
Recommended	Water Plants Maintenance Supervisor	Pay Range 1FX (\$62,338 - \$87,270) • Recruitment at \$72,020	1 Position

This position provides technical assistance and supervision for the maintenance staff at two water treatment plants; leads special projects related to preventive maintenance and repair activities; coordinates the use of a computerized maintenance program; researches products, vendors, and contracts to assist with maintenance and plant operation projects; assists the Water Engineering Division with plant specification details for capital improvement projects; and coordinates the Waste Management Disposal Program to ensure compliance with regulatory agencies.

Minimum requirements include four years of experience in the maintenance and repair of large industrial facilities, preferably in water or wastewater treatment, with at least one year of experience at the lead worker or supervisor level with responsibility for maintenance scheduling; and possession of a Fourth Class Stationary Engineers Permit issued by the City of Milwaukee within one year of appointment and throughout employment. Equivalent combinations of education and experience may be considered.

Although none of the AWWA titles listed above are a direct match to this position under study, they do share some of the functions performed and support an increase in salary. Comparisons were also made to the classification of Water Supervisor from ERI. The rates from ERI shown below reflect the minimum and maximum rates of pay at the 10th, 25th, mean, 75th and 90th percentiles of the labor market:

Water Supervisor

Years' Experience	10 th Percentile	25 th Percentile	Survey Mean	75 th Percentile	90 th Percentile
7	\$70,933	\$76,972	\$84,929	\$92,656	\$100,421
5	\$66,702	\$72,390	\$79,912	\$87,195	\$94,538
3	\$62,205	\$67,509	\$74,558	\$81,360	\$88,245
1	\$57,573	\$62,472	\$69,017	\$75,314	\$81,715

Source: ERI. Published Q2 of 2019. (30-Mile Radius of Milwaukee)

ERI defines a Water Supervisor as a position that supervises, plans, and coordinates activities of workers in operation and maintenance of waterworks systems and ensures adequate water supply for human consumption, industrial or agricultural use; and assigns personnel to shifts to operate filtering and chemical treatment, coagulating and settling basins, and other plant facilities.

In reviewing the market data, a pay range that would be close to the average mean rates in the chart above for one to seven years of experience would be Pay Range 1FX (\$62,338 - \$87,270). We further recommend a recruitment rate of \$72,020 to provide a differential in pay from the positions that it supervises. Another management position in this pay range with similar duties is Water Plant Operations Supervisor. We also recommend the title be changed to Water Plants Maintenance Supervisor (plural) to reflect the fact that this position works at both plants.

We therefore recommend one position of Water Plant Maintenance Supervisor in Pay Range 1CX (\$51,469 - \$72,063) be reclassified to Water Plants Maintenance Supervisor in Pay Range 1FX (\$62,338 - \$87,270) and a footnote be created to provide a recruitment rate of \$72,020.

Current	Water Plant Steamfitter/HVAC Specialist	Pay Range 7JN (\$47,588 - \$57,877) • Recruitment up to \$53,162 with approval of DER	2 Positions
Recommended	Water Plant HVAC Maintenance Technician	Pay Range 7QN (\$70,041 - \$70,503) • Range of \$57,703 - \$72,738 • Recruitment anywhere in the range based on experience and credentials with approval by DER	2 Positions

These positions provide journey-level expertise for HVAC systems preventive maintenance, repair, installation, removal, and replacement in all areas of heating, ventilating, air conditioning, and low pressure boilers in the water treatment plants, pumping stations, and booster stations. Duties include layout of work, ordering materials, and ensuring necessary tools are available; recharging air conditioning systems; testing boiler water samples; and conducting boiler chemical adjustments.

Minimum requirements include an associate's degree in the HVAC field and three years of experience in the maintenance and repair of HVAC/refrigeration equipment and other mechanical, electrical, and electronic automated building systems or five years of related experience; and a Chlorofluorocarbon (CFC) certification from the State of Wisconsin within six months of appointment and throughout employment. Equivalent combinations of education and experience may be considered. These requirements have not yet been assessed by the Staffing Division.

In determining the recommendation for this position, comparisons were made to external market rates of pay for positions with similar duties and responsibilities. The rates from ERI shown below reflect the minimum and maximum rates of pay Heating and Air Conditioning Mechanic (HVAC) at the 10th, 25th, mean, 75th and 90th percentiles of the labor market:

Heating and Air Conditioning Mechanic (HVAC)

Years' Experience	10 th Percentile	25 th Percentile	Survey Mean	75 th Percentile	90 th Percentile
7	\$54,111	\$58,350	\$64,121	\$69,536	\$75,148
5	\$50,915	\$54,865	\$60,282	\$65,346	\$70,620
3	\$47,418	\$51,035	\$56,041	\$60,708	\$65,598
1	\$43,730	\$47,055	\$51,606	\$55,838	\$60,312

Source: ERI. Published Q2 of 2019. (30-Mile Radius of Milwaukee)

This chart was used earlier in the report for the recommended classifications of HVAC Maintenance Technician in Pay Range 7NN (\$46,130 - \$65,098) and HVAC Maintenance Technician – Senior in Pay Range 7ON (\$65,755 - \$65,839) with a footnoted range of \$48,670 - \$67,616. As this position performs some of the highest level HVAC work in the City at the DPW-Water Works plants, we recommend placing this position in Pay Range 7QN (\$70,041 - \$70,503) and create a footnote that provides a range of \$57,703 - \$72,738. As this position no longer is performing steamfitting duties, we recommend the title be changed to Water Plant HVAC Maintenance Technician.

We therefore recommend two positions of Water Plant Steamfitter/HVAC Specialist in Pay Range 7JN (\$47,588 - \$57,877) be reclassified to Water Plant HVAC Maintenance Technician in Pay Range 7QN (\$70,041 - \$70,503) and create a footnote providing the range of \$57,703 - \$72,738.

To assist with recruitment and retention this report further recommends recruitment at any point in the range based on experience and credentials with the approval of DER.

Current	Water Works Steamfitter	PR 7RN (\$66,327 - \$83,054) • Recruitment anywhere in the range based on experience and credentials with DER approval	3 Positions
Recommended	Water Plant Steamfitter	PR 7RN (\$66,327 - \$83,054) • Recruitment anywhere in the range based on experience and credentials with DER approval	3 Positions

These positions provide journey-level expertise for pipe systems preventive maintenance, repair, installation, removal, and replacements in areas of steam plumbing and process water piping in the water treatment plants, pumping stations, and booster stations. Duties include conducting welding, soldering, pipe sweating, and compression assembly of piping systems including air, gas, water, steam, chemical, refrigeration, cryogenic, and other fluids and gases; conducting piping system evaluations for system function needs and desired improvements; and performing cross-connection control inspection and testing backflow prevention systems.

Minimum requirements include four years of experience performing duties related to steamfitting and plumbing; a journey level certification in steamfitting or plumbing; and an ability to obtain and maintain forklift operator certification and Wisconsin Department of Safety and Professional Services (DSPS) Cross Connection Control Tester Certification within six months of appointment and throughout employment.

To provide more consistency among titles of positions that work with the Water Works plant we recommend a title change from Water Works Steamfitter to Water Plant Steamfitter. We therefore recommend a title change for three positions of Water Works Steamfitter in Pay Range 7RN (\$66,327 - \$83,054) to Water Plant Steamfitter in Pay Range (\$66,327 - \$83,054).

Current	Machine Repairperson	Pay Range 7JN (\$47,588 - \$57,877)	17 Positions
Current	Metal Fabricator	Pay Range 7HN (\$41,774 - \$52,049) • Recruitment is at \$45,327	1 Position
Recommended	Water Plant Machine Repairperson	Pay Range 7QN (\$70,041 - \$70,503) • Range of \$57,703 - \$72,738 • Recruitment anywhere in the range based on experience and credentials with DER approval	18 Positions
Current	Machinery Technician	Pay Range 7GN (\$41,096 - \$50,649) • Recruitment is at \$44,459	Underfill Title
Recommended	Water Plant Machinery Mechanic	Pay Range 7LN (\$49,921 - \$60,663) • Range of \$47,602 - \$61,046)	Underfill Title
Current	Facility Mechanic	Pay Range 7DN (\$37,314 - \$46,567) • Recruitment is at \$40,723	Underfill Title
Recommended	Water Plant Facility Mechanic	Pay Range 7HN (\$41,774 - \$52,049) • Range of \$44,099 - \$57,007	Underfill Title

The positions of Machine Repairperson provide journey-level expertise for the preventive maintenance, repair, removal, and installation of all mechanical equipment in the DPW-Water Works facilities. This is a senior-level position and serves as a leadworker for complex maintenance assignments. Duties include performing complex preventive maintenance, troubleshooting, and repair activities for all mechanical equipment such as compressors, pumps, valves, gear drives, chemical feed equipment, distribution system storage facilities, water filtration equipment, pumps, building, appurtenances, and other water system equipment; diagnosing operating problems and defects to determine repairs needed; and using computerized Maintenance Management System (MMS) to maintain records of preventive and demand maintenance requests.

Minimum requirements include four years of experience as a journey level machinist or machine repair specialist or four years of shop experience performing related duties. Equivalent combinations of education and experience may be considered. The requirements have not yet been reviewed by the Staffing Division.

In determining the recommendation for these positions, comparisons were made to external market rates of pay for positions with similar duties and responsibilities. The rates from ERI shown below reflect the minimum and maximum rates of pay at the 10th, 25th, mean, 75th and 90th percentiles of the labor market:

Foreman Mechanic

Years' Experience	10 th Percentile	25 th Percentile	Survey Mean	75 th Percentile	90 th Percentile
7	\$60,684	\$65,854	\$72,738	\$79,373	\$86,101
5	\$56,692	\$61,508	\$67,954	\$74,148	\$80,456
3	\$52,496	\$56,927	\$62,897	\$68,612	\$74,465
1	\$48,230	\$52,241	\$57,703	\$62,912	\$68,281

Source: ERI. Published Q2 of 2019. (30 Mile Radius of Milwaukee)

ERI defines a Foreman Mechanic as a position that assist supervisors in coordinating activities of mechanics engaged in the repair of savable mechanical parts of machines and construction equipment; designates duties to workers; and leads department activities.

Based on a review of the market data we recommend that these 17 positions be changed to Pay Range 7QN (\$70,041 - \$70,503) with a footnote that provides the range of \$57,703 - \$72,738 which is equal to the mean average

for an individual with one to seven years of experience. We also recommend creating a footnote that provides recruitment anywhere in the range based on experience and credentials with approval of DER. We further recommend a change in title to Water Plant Machine Repairperson to be more consistent with other positions working in the water plants.

We therefore recommend 17 positions of Machine Repairperson in Pay Range 7JN (\$47,588 - \$57,877) be reclassified to Water Plant Machine Repairperson in Pay Range 7QN (\$70,041 - \$70,503) with a footnote that provides the range of \$57,703 - \$72,738 and a footnote that provides recruitment anywhere in the range based on experience and credentials with the approval of DER.

The Metal Fabricator provides journey-level expertise for metal forming, shaping, heat treating, welding, torch cutting, and creativity to resolve a large variety of unique problems involving the fabrication of specialized parts and equipment for water plants maintenance and emergency operations.

Minimum requirements include three years of experience performing fabrication and/or welding repairs and an associate's degree or one-year technical diploma in welding technology or successful completion of a comparable training program or apprenticeship may be substituted for up to one year of required experience. Equivalent combinations of education and experience may be considered. These requirements have not yet been assessed by the Staffing Division.

Based on changing needs, the department wishes to repurpose this vacant Metal Fabricator position in Pay Range 7HN (\$41,774 - \$52,049) with recruitment at \$45,327 to the recommended new classification of Water Plant Machine Repairperson in Pay Range 7QN (\$70,041 - \$70,503) with a footnoted range of \$57,703 - \$72,738. As this position will be performing the same duties as the other 17 positions we recommend one position of Metal Fabricator in Pay Range 7HN (\$41,774 - \$52,049) with recruitment at \$45,327 be reclassified to Water Plant Machine Repairperson in Pay Range 7QN (\$70,041 - \$70,503) with a footnoted range of \$57,703 - \$72,738.

The underfill title of Machinery Technician in Pay Range 7GN (\$41,096 - \$50,649) with a recruitment rate of \$44,459 is the second step in a three-step promotional series for machine repair personnel at water plants. The basic function is to independently perform system-wide installation, preventive maintenance, and repair duties on medium-duty water system equipment; and assist crafts and maintenance personnel in complex and/or heavy-duty assignments.

Minimum requirements include two years of experience performing mechanical repair and maintenance duties related to this position and certification for use of SCBA (Self-Contained Breathing Apparatus) equipment within six months of appointment and throughout employment. Equivalent combinations of education and experience may be considered.

In determining the recommendation for this underfill title, comparisons were made to external market rates of pay for positions with similar duties and responsibilities. The rates from ERI shown below reflect the minimum and maximum rates of pay at the 10th, 25th, mean, 75th and 90th percentiles of the labor market:

Machinery Maintenance Mechanic

Years' Experience	10 th Percentile	25 th Percentile	Survey Mean	75 th Percentile	90 th Percentile
7	\$50,942	\$55,229	\$61,046	\$66,610	\$72,335
5	\$47,704	\$51,657	\$57,070	\$62,234	\$67,577
3	\$43,942	\$47,561	\$52,478	\$57,159	\$62,046
1	\$39,741	\$43,145	\$47,602	\$51,736	\$56,109

Source: ERI. Published Q2 of 2019. (30-Mile Radius of Milwaukee)

ERI defines a Machinery Maintenance Mechanic as a position that repairs savable mechanical parts of machines and construction equipment; dismantles machinery, equipment, and parts, using hand tools, such as hacksaws, files, reamers, wrenches, and screwdrivers; and inspects parts to determine salvageability or method of repairing or reworking parts.

Based on a review of the market data, we recommend that this underfill title of Machinery Technician in Pay Range 7GN (\$41,096 - \$50,649) with a recruitment rate of \$44,459 be changed to Pay Range 7LN (\$49,921 - \$60,663) with a footnote that provides the range of \$47,602 - \$61,046 which is equal to the mean average for an individual with one to seven years of experience. We also recommend creating a footnote that provides recruitment anywhere in the range based on experience and credentials with the approval of DER. We further recommend a change in title to Water Plant Machinery Mechanic to be more consistent with other positions working in the water plants.

The underfill title of Facility Mechanic in Pay Range 7DN (\$37,314 - \$46,567) with a recruitment rate of \$40,723 is the first step in a three-step promotional series for machine repair personnel at water plants. The basic function is to perform minor maintenance repairs to all Water system equipment and assist skilled craft personnel as needed.

Minimum requirements include a high degree of mechanical aptitude and machinery repair skills and a general understanding of system processes for the water purification plants and pumping stations.

In determining the recommendation for this underfill title, comparisons were made to external market rates of pay for positions with similar duties and responsibilities. The rates from ERI shown below reflect the minimum and maximum rates of pay at the 10th, 25th, mean, 75th and 90th percentiles of the labor market:

Maintenance Repairer Industrial

Years' Experience	10 th Percentile	25 th Percentile	Survey Mean	75 th Percentile	90 th Percentile
7	\$49,334	\$52,514	\$57,007	\$60,970	\$65,233
5	\$46,124	\$49,058	\$53,213	\$56,868	\$60,828
3	\$42,328	\$45,051	\$48,831	\$52,104	\$55,696
1	\$37,984	\$40,575	\$44,099	\$46,988	\$50,164

Source: ERI. Published Q2 of 2019. (30 Mile Radius of Milwaukee)

ERI defines a Maintenance Repairer Industrial as a position that repairs, installs, and maintains machinery, equipment, physical structures, and pipe and electrical systems in commercial or industrial establishments, following specifications, blueprints, manuals, and schematic drawings, using hand tools, power tools, hoist, crane, and measuring and testing instruments.

Based on a review of the market data we recommend that this underfill title of Facility Mechanic in Pay Range 7DN (\$37,314 - \$46,567) with a recruitment rate of \$40,723 be changed to Pay Range 7HN (\$41,774 - \$52,049) with a footnote that provides the range of \$44,099 - \$57,007 which is equal to the mean average for an individual with one to seven years of experience. We also recommend creating a footnote that provides recruitment anywhere in the range based on experience and credentials with the approval of DER. We further recommend a change in title to Water Plant Facility Mechanic to be more consistent with other positions working in the water plants.

Health Department

Current	Heating and Ventilating Mechanic III	Pay Range 7FN (\$39,138 - \$48,402) • Recruitment is at \$43,401	1 Position
Current	Custodial Worker II – City Laborer	Pay Range 8DN (\$33,857 - \$40,450) • Recruitment is at \$36,480	2 Positions

Recommended	HVAC Maintenance Technician	Pay Range 7NN (\$46,130 - \$65,098) • Recruitment anywhere in the range based on experience and credentials with DER approval	3 Positions
-------------	-----------------------------	--	-------------

The Heating and Ventilating Mechanic III works under the direction of the Mechanical Maintenance Supervisor and has the responsibility for inspecting, maintaining, and repairing, at a sub-journey level, all heating, cooling, and ventilating equipment; rebuilding small engines, air, and refrigeration compressors; and diagnosing building and equipment issues related to HVAC, plumbing, electrical work. Serves as a backup to the Mechanical Maintenance Supervisor and may also work as a leadworker.

Minimum requirements include an associate's degree in heating and ventilating or equivalent work experience and three years of work experience in the repair and maintenance of HVAC systems. Experience as a leadworker or supervisor is preferred. Equivalent combinations of education and experience may be considered. These requirements have not yet been assessed by the Staffing Division.

The Custodial Worker II – City Laborer positions perform a variety of custodial duties and maintenance tasks; and assist other custodial workers and City staff in performing assignments. This is an entry-level position and desirable qualifications include experience performing related duties in the capacity of a building engineer, custodian, or janitor.

These three positions are vacant and the Health Department wishes to have them all be repurposed to a Heating and Ventilating position. These three positions would perform work that is similar to the work performed by the positions in the Department of City Development described earlier in this report. We recommend that these three positions also be reclassified to HVAC Maintenance Technician in Pay Range 7NN (\$46,130 - \$65,098).

Library

Current	Library Facilities Manager	Pay Range 1EX (\$58,462 - \$81,844)	1 Position
Recommended	Facilities Manager	Pay Range 1HX (\$70,827 - \$99,154)	1 Position

This position administers and controls all activities pertaining to the maintenance, repair, and operations of all buildings, grounds, and related equipment under the jurisdiction of the Milwaukee Public Library's Board of Trustees; and supports a historical resource institution that serves millions of visitors annually and provides programs and services to Milwaukee's diverse residents, within a network of thirteen libraries spanning over 650,000 feet. Duties include overseeing security system maintenance, new construction, remodeling, repairs, regular and preventative maintenance, and snow removal.

Minimum requirements include a bachelor's degree in facility management, mechanical engineering, architecture, or related field with an emphasis on mechanical disciplines and building operations; and three years of experience in management or supervision in building trades, construction, or facilities maintenance in a comparable facility. Equivalent combinations of education and experience may be considered.

In determining the recommendation for this position, comparisons were made to external market rates of pay for positions with similar duties and responsibilities. The rates from ERI shown below reflect the minimum and maximum rates of pay for the classifications of Facilities Director and Building and Facilities Manager at the 10th, 25th, mean, 75th and 90th percentiles of the labor market:

Facilities Director					
Years' Experience	10 th Percentile	25 th Percentile	Survey Mean	75 th Percentile	90 th Percentile
7	\$93,860	\$103,721	\$116,234	\$129,068	\$141,449
5	\$88,154	\$97,462	\$109,308	\$121,446	\$133,206

3	\$82,267	\$90,999	\$102,141	\$113,548	\$124,636
1	\$76,288	\$84,429	\$94,847	\$105,492	\$115,879

Source: ERI. Published Q2 of 2019. (30-Mile Radius of Milwaukee)

ERI defines a Facilities Director as a position that plans, organizes, and directs the maintenance, repair, and alteration of a company’s buildings and grounds; plans and develops facilities and new construction; assures projects and jobs are completed proficiently and within regulatory guidelines and projected deadlines; and develops long and short-range maintenance plans and programs such as emergency response plans and energy management plans.

Building and Facilities Manager

Years' Experience	10 th Percentile	25 th Percentile	Survey Mean	75 th Percentile	90 th Percentile
7	\$75,948	\$82,404	\$90,901	\$99,229	\$107,580
5	\$71,316	\$77,380	\$85,385	\$93,213	\$101,090
3	\$66,497	\$72,149	\$79,635	\$86,932	\$94,304
1	\$61,601	\$66,828	\$73,779	\$80,528	\$87,373

Source: ERI. Published Q2 of 2019. (30-Mile Radius of Milwaukee)

ERI defines a Building and Facilities Manager as a position that manages, plans, and coordinates, through staff of skilled, semiskilled, and unskilled trade personnel, activities concerned with the operations, repair, maintenance and construction of facilities, equipment, buildings, and grounds to minimize interruption and improve efficiency; plan and oversee such matters as design and development of plant facilities, formulation of operating rules, regulations and procedures; develop procedures for use in event of accidents, fires, or other emergencies; inspect plant facilities or review inspection reports, to determine repairs, replacement, or improvements required; hire, train and supervise building service personnel; and assign workers to duties such as maintenance, repair or renovation and may obtain bids for additional work from outside contractors.

The department also indicated that there have been a number of changes in this position that would support a reclassification. The role of this position has expanded as it has overseen multiple large-scale capital improvement projects, improvements to aging infrastructure and related systems, and new library construction in mixed-use buildings. This position was last studied in 2010 when it was reclassified to its current title of Library Facilities Manager in Salary Grade 08 (\$57,028 - \$79,836). At that time, it was noted that the work of facilities managers had become more complex due to an increased emphasis on safety and security—especially in facilities used by the public—and a need for green building technology and materials, and energy conservation. Currently, the role of this position continues to expand in the areas of making improvements in facility management, building operations, energy efficiency, and equipment. This includes expanded solar installations, enhanced green infrastructure components, and a reduction in energy usage.

In reviewing the market data and considering these changes, in the position we recommend the higher pay range of 1HX (\$70,827 - \$99,154). This pay range is consistent with the pay range for Facilities Manager in DPW-Infrastructure Services. For more consistency between the two positions, we also recommend changing the title to Facilities Manager.

We therefore recommend one position of Library Facilities Manager in Pay Range 1EX (\$58,462 - \$81,844) be reclassified to Facilities Manager in Pay Range 1HX (\$70,827 - \$99,154).

Current	Building Maintenance Supervisor II	Pay Range 1BX (\$48,670 - \$67,616)	1 Position
Recommended	Facilities Maintenance Supervisor	Pay Range 1EX (\$58,462 - \$81,844) • Recruitment is at \$69,955	1 Position

This position reports to the Library Facilities Manager and is responsible for the supervision of custodial and maintenance personnel, and the mechanical operations in the Milwaukee Public Library system. Duties include obtaining estimates for emergency and routine maintenance by contractors and monitoring projects through completion; conducting or scheduling periodic inspections of the physical condition and operating efficiency of mechanical equipment; preparing reports and budget requests; and maintaining records.

Minimum requirements include five years of experience in facility maintenance and repair, including maintenance of heating, ventilation, and air conditioning equipment, electrical and plumbing systems, automated building controls, and custodial operations; and at least one of the years of experience in a leadworker or supervisory capacity. Equivalent combinations of education and experience may be considered.

In determining the recommendation for this position, comparisons were made external market rates of pay for positions with similar duties and responsibilities. The rates from ERI shown below reflect the minimum and maximum rates of pay for the title of Maintenance Manager at the 10th, 25th, mean, 75th and 90th percentiles of the labor market:

Maintenance Manager					
Years' Experience	10 th Percentile	25 th Percentile	Survey Mean	75 th Percentile	90 th Percentile
7	\$70,638	\$76,646	\$84,570	\$92,254	\$99,978
5	\$65,953	\$71,589	\$79,010	\$86,202	\$93,461
3	\$60,485	\$65,629	\$72,487	\$79,091	\$85,790
1	\$54,601	\$59,218	\$65,422	\$71,368	\$77,443

Source: ERI. Published Q2 of 2019. (30-Mile Radius of Milwaukee)

The rates listed above for Maintenance Manager were utilized earlier in the report for the recommended classification of Facilities Maintenance Supervisor in Pay Range 1EX (\$58,462 - \$81,844) with a recruitment rate of \$69,955. This position is comparable and we recommend the same classification. To provide a differential in pay from the positions it supervises, we also recommend the recruitment rate of \$69,955.

We therefore recommend one position Building Maintenance Supervisor II in Pay Range 1BX (\$48,670 - \$67,616) be reclassified to Facilities Maintenance Supervisor in Pay Range 1EX (\$58,462 - \$81,844) with a footnote to provide a recruitment rate of \$69,955.

Current	Heating and Ventilating Mechanic III	Pay Range 7FN (\$39,138 - \$48,402) • Recruitment is at \$43,401	1 Position
Recommended	HVAC Maintenance Technician – Senior	Pay Range 7ON (\$65,755 - \$65,839) • Range of \$48,670 - \$67,616 • Recruitment anywhere in the range based on experience and credentials with DER approval	1 Position

The Heating and Ventilating Mechanic III in the Library serves as a leadworker and has responsibility for inspecting, diagnosing, and maintaining all heating, cooling, ventilating, and other building systems and components for the successful operations of the Library buildings; monitors the Building Maintenance Management Systems; installs, repairs, replaces, adjusts, and maintains all equipment and part related to building systems and facilities; and works with preventative maintenance, repairs, programming and operations of HVAC, plumbing, mechanical, pneumatic, and digital systems for the Library's high rise, commercial class A buildings, and other mixed-use condominium or standalone libraries.

Minimum requirements include an associate's degree in heating and ventilating or equivalent work experience and three years of work experience in the repair and maintenance of HVAC systems. Equivalent combinations of

education and experience may be considered. These requirements have not yet been assessed by the Staffing Division.

In determining the recommendations for these positions, comparisons were made to external market rates of pay for positions with similar duties and responsibilities. The rates from ERI shown below reflect the minimum and maximum rates of pay for the Heating and Air Conditioning Mechanic (HVAC) title at the 10th, 25th, mean, 75th and 90th percentiles of the labor market:

Heating and Air Conditioning Mechanic (HVAC)

Years' Experience	10 th Percentile	25 th Percentile	Survey Mean	75 th Percentile	90 th Percentile
7	\$54,111	\$58,350	\$64,121	\$69,536	\$75,148
5	\$50,915	\$54,865	\$60,282	\$65,346	\$70,620
3	\$47,418	\$51,035	\$56,041	\$60,708	\$65,598
1	\$43,730	\$47,055	\$51,606	\$55,838	\$60,312

Source: ERI. Published Q2 of 2019. (30-Mile Radius of Milwaukee)

ERI defines a Heating, Ventilating and Air Conditioning (HVAC) Mechanic as a position that installs, services, and repairs heating, ventilating, air conditioning systems and related environmental-control systems utilizing knowledge of heating and refrigeration theory, pipefitting, and structural layout ; mounts compressor and condenser units on platform or floor, using hand tools, following blueprints or engineering specifications; and fabricates, assembles and installs ductwork and chassis parts, using portable metalworking tools and welding equipment.

The rates listed above for Heating and Air Conditioning Mechanic (HVAC) were utilized earlier in the report for the recommended classification of HVAC Maintenance Technician – Senior in Pay Range 7ON (\$65,755 - \$65,839) with a footnoted range of (\$48,670 - \$67,616) to provide a sufficient differential for leadworker responsibilities. This position is comparable to the other recommended HVAC Maintenance Technician – Senior positions in DPW-Infrastructure Services and we recommend the same classification.

We therefore recommend one position of Heating and Ventilating Mechanic III in Pay Range 7FN (\$39,138 - \$48,402) with recruitment at \$43,401 be reclassified to HVAC Maintenance Technician – Senior in Pay Range 7ON (\$65,755 - \$65,839) with a footnoted range of \$48,670 - \$67,616. To assist with recruitment and retention this report further recommends recruitment at any point in the range based on experience and credentials with approval of DER.

Current	Heating and Ventilating Mechanic II	Pay Range 7DN (\$37,314 - \$46,567) • Recruitment is at \$41,700	2 Positions
Recommended	HVAC Maintenance Technician	Pay Range 7NN (\$46,130 - \$65,098) • Range of \$48,670 - \$67,616 • Recruitment anywhere in the range based on experience and credentials with DER approval	2 Positions

These positions repair, replace, adjust, and maintain all equipment related to building systems and facilities for the Library. Work includes preventative maintenance, repairs, programming, and operation of HVAC, plumbing, mechanical, pneumatic, and digital systems for the Library’s high rise, commercial class A buildings, and other mixed-use condominium or standalone libraries.

Minimum requirements include an associate’s degree in heating and ventilating or equivalent work experience and three years of work experience in the repair and maintenance of HVAC systems. Equivalent combinations of education and experience may be considered. These requirements have not yet been assessed by the Staffing Division.

In determining the recommendations for these positions, comparisons were made to external market rates of pay for positions with similar duties and responsibilities. The rates from ERI shown below reflect the minimum and maximum rates of pay for the Heating and Air Conditioning Mechanic (HVAC) title at the 10th, 25th, mean, 75th and 90th percentiles of the labor market:

Heating and Air Conditioning Mechanic (HVAC)

Years' Experience	10 th Percentile	25 th Percentile	Survey Mean	75 th Percentile	90 th Percentile
7	\$54,111	\$58,350	\$64,121	\$69,536	\$75,148
5	\$50,915	\$54,865	\$60,282	\$65,346	\$70,620
3	\$47,418	\$51,035	\$56,041	\$60,708	\$65,598
1	\$43,730	\$47,055	\$51,606	\$55,838	\$60,312

Source: ERI. Published Q2 of 2019. (30-Mile Radius of Milwaukee)

ERI defines a Heating, Ventilating and Air Conditioning (HVAC) Mechanic as a position that installs, services, and repairs heating, ventilating, air conditioning systems and related environmental-control systems utilizing knowledge of heating and refrigeration theory, pipefitting, and structural layout; mounts compressor and condenser units on platform or floor, using hand tools, following blueprints or engineering specifications; and fabricates, assembles and installs ductwork and chassis parts, using portable metalworking tools and welding equipment.

The rates listed above for Heating and Air Conditioning Mechanic (HVAC) were utilized earlier in the report for the recommended classification of HVAC Maintenance Technician in Pay Range 7NN (\$46,130 - \$65,098). These positions are comparable to the other recommended HVAC Maintenance Technician positions in DPW-Infrastructure Services, Department of City Development, and the Health Department and we recommend the same classification.

We therefore recommend two positions of Heating and Ventilating Mechanic II in Pay Range 7DN (\$37,314 - \$46,567) with recruitment at \$41,700 be reclassified to HVAC Maintenance Technician in Pay Range 7NN (\$46,130 - \$65,098). To assist with recruitment and retention, this report further recommends recruitment at any point in the range based on experience and credentials with the approval of DER.

Action Required – Effective Pay Period 1, 2019 (December 30, 2018)

In the Salary Ordinance

Under Pay Range 1CX:

Delete the title "Water Plant Maintenance Supervisor".

Under Pay Range 1DX:

Delete the title "Water Plant Maintenance Manager".

Under Pay Range 1EX:

Add the title "Facilities Maintenance Supervisor (11)".

Delete the title "Library Facilities Manager".

Under Pay Range 1FX:

Add the title "Water Plants Maintenance Supervisor (8)".

Create the following footnote (8):

(8) Recruitment is at \$2,770.00 biweekly (\$72,020.00).

Under Pay Range 1GX:

Add the title "Water Plant Maintenance Manager (10)".

Create the following footnote (10):

(10) Recruitment is at \$2,854.80 biweekly (\$74,224.80).

Under Pay Range 1HX:

- Delete the title "Bridge Maintenance Manager".
- Delete the title "Water Plant Operations Manager".

Under Pay Range 1IX:

- Add the title "Bridge Maintenance Manager".
- Add the title "Water Plants Operation Manager (5)".

Under Pay Range 1JX:

- Delete the title "Water Plants Manager".

Under Pay Range 1KX:

- Add the title "Water Plants Manager (1)".
- Delete the title "Administration and Project Manager".

Under Pay Range 1MX:

- Add the title "Water Works Administration Manager".

Under Pay Range 7CN:

- Delete footnote (1) in its entirety.

Under Pay Range 7DN:

- Delete the title "Facility Mechanic".
- Delete footnotes (1), (2), and (6) in their entirety.

Under Pay Range 7GN:

- Delete the title "Machinery Technician".
- Delete footnote (3) in its entirety.

Under Pay Range 7HN:

- Add the title "Facilities Maintenance Mechanic (5)".
- Add the title "Water Plant Facility Mechanic (5)".
- Delete the title "Metal Fabricator (5)".
- Delete footnote (5) in its entirety.
- Create the following footnote (5):
- (5) Employees to be paid in the following range: \$1,696.12 to \$2,192.58 biweekly (\$44,099.12 to \$57,007.08) and may be recruited at any rate in the pay range based on experience and credentials with the approval of DER.

Under Pay Range 7JN:

- Delete the title "Machine Repairperson".
- Delete the title "Water Plant Steamfitter/HVAC Specialist".
- Delete footnote (1) in its entirety.

Under Pay Range 7LN:

- Add the title "Water Plant Machinery Mechanic (4)".
- Create the following footnote (4):
- (4) Employees to be paid in the following range: \$1,830.85 to \$2,347.93 biweekly (\$47,602.10 to \$61,046.18) and may be recruited at any rate in the pay range based on experience and credentials with the approval of DER.

Under Pay Range 7NN:

Modify the current rates of pay so that they read:

Hourly	22.18	31.30
Biweekly	1,774.23	2,503.77
Annual	46,129.98	65,098.02

- Add the title "HVAC Maintenance Technician (1)".

Create the following footnote (1):

(1) Recruitment may be at any rate in the pay range based on experience and credentials with the approval of DER.

Under Pay Range 7ON:

Add the title "HVAC Maintenance Technician – Senior (3)".

Create the following footnote (3):

(3) Employees to be paid in the following range: \$1,871.92 - \$2,600.62 biweekly (\$48,669.92 - \$67,616.12) and recruitment may be at any rate in the pay range based on experience and credentials with the approval of DER.

Under Pay Range 7QN:

Add the title "Water Plant Machine Repairperson (6)".

Add the title "Water Plant HVAC Maintenance Technician (6)".

Create the following footnote (6):

(6) Employees to be paid in the following range \$2,219.35 to \$2,797.62 biweekly (\$57,703.10 to \$72,738.12) and recruitment may be at any rate in the pay range based on experience and credentials with the approval of DER.

Under Pay Range 7RN:

Delete the title "Water Works Steamfitter (1)".

Add the title "Water Plant Steamfitter (1)".

In the Positions Ordinance

Under Department of City Development, Public Housing Programs Decision Unit, Family Housing Unit:

Delete three positions of "Building Maintenance Mechanic II (X)".

Add three positions of "Facilities Maintenance Mechanic (X)".

Under Elderly and Disabled Housing:

Delete one position of "Building Maintenance Mechanic II (X)".

Add one position of "Facilities Maintenance Mechanic (X)".

Under Field Support Services:

Delete two positions of "Heating & Ventilating Mechanic II".

Add two positions of "HVAC Maintenance Technician".

Under Department of Public Works - Infrastructure Services Division, Bridges & Buildings Decision Unit, Mechanical Services:

Delete one position of "Building Services Manager".

Add one position of "Facilities Maintenance Supervisor".

Delete two positions of "Maintenance Technician III".

Add two positions of "HVAC Maintenance Technician-Senior".

Delete four positions of "Maintenance Technician II".

Add four positions of "HVAC Maintenance Technician".

Under Department of Public Works - Water Works, Business Organization, Administration:

Delete one position of "Administrative and Projects Manager (X)(Y)".

Add one position of "Water Works Administration Manager (X)(Y)".

Under Plants-North Organization, Linwood and North Water Production:

Delete one position of "Water Plant Operations Manager (X)".

Add one position of "Water Plants Operations Manager (X)".

Delete one position of "Water Plant Maintenance Supervisor (X)".

Add one position of "Water Plants Maintenance Supervisor (X)".

- Delete one position of "HVAC Specialist".
 - Add one position of "Water Plant HVAC Maintenance Technician".
 - Delete two positions of "Water Works Steamfitter".
 - Add two positions of "Water Plant Steamfitter".
 - Delete nine positions of "Machine Repairperson".
 - Add nine positions of "Water Plant Machine Repairperson".
- Under Plants-South Organization, Howard & South Water Production:
- Delete eight positions of "Machine Repairperson".
 - Add nine positions of "Water Plant Machine Repairperson".
 - Delete one position of "Water Works Steamfitter".
 - Add one position of "Water Plant Steamfitter".
 - Delete one position of "HVAC Specialist".
 - Add one position of "Water Plant HVAC Maintenance Technician".
 - Delete one position of "Metal Fabricator".
- Under the Health Department, Buildings and Grounds Division:
- Delete one position of "Health and Ventilating Mechanic III".
 - Delete two positions of "Custodial Worker II – City Laborer".
 - Add three positions of "HVAC Maintenance Technician".
- Under the Library, Administrative Services Decision Unit, Facilities and Fleet Section:
- Delete one position of "Library Facilities Manager (X)(Y)".
 - Add one position of "Facilities Manager (X)(Y)".
 - Delete one position of "Building Maintenance Supervisor II (X)(Y)".
 - Add one position of "Facilities Maintenance Supervisor (X)(Y)".
- Under Mechanical Unit:
- Delete one position of "Heating and Ventilating Mechanic III".
 - Add one position of "HVAC Maintenance Technician-Senior".
 - Delete two positions of "Heating and Ventilating Mechanic II".
 - Add two positions of "HVAC Maintenance Technician".

Prepared By: 
Sarah Trotter, Human Resources Representative

Prepared By: 
Andrea Knickerbocker, Human Resources Manager

Reviewed By: 
Maria Monteagudo, Employee Relations Director

JOB EVALUATION REPORT

City Service Commission Meeting: April 9, 2019

Health Department

Current	Recommendation
One New Position Position authority per CCFN 181270	Doula Program Manager PR 1EX (\$58,462 - \$81,844) One Position FN: Recruitment is at \$63,807
Four New Positions Position authority per CCFN 181270	Doula PR 2EN (\$45,306 - \$63,426) Four Positions

The Health Department has requested classification studies of five new positions. In studying these positions, job descriptions were analyzed and discussions were held with Jennifer Freiheit, Health Operations Administrator, and Rebecca Rowland, Family and Community Health Services Director.

These titles are part of the BOMB (Birth Outcomes Made Better) Doula Program, a pilot program that will focus on 100 expectant mothers in the City of Milwaukee—especially within high-need areas, such as the 53206 zip code. The goal of the program is to provide physical and emotional support and advocacy for women and their partners during and after the birthing process. The team will consist of four doulas and a fifth to provide program oversight. This program will work closely with the Maternal and Child Health. Maternal and Child Health engages in a variety of population-based and individual activities in homes, clinics, and community settings designed to ensure that health care is accessible and supportive to all City residents.

To help determine the rates of pay for these positions, the following survey data was gathered for the Economic Research Institute (ERI) for the title of Childbirth Educator. The rates from ERI shown below reflect the minimum and maximum rates of pay at the 10th, 25th, mean, 75th and 90th percentiles of the labor market:

Childbirth Educator (Southeastern Wisconsin)

Years' Experience	10 th Percentile	25 th Percentile	Survey Mean	75 th Percentile	90 th Percentile
1	\$50,709	\$54,442	\$59,637	\$64,387	\$69,402
3	\$55,476	\$59,617	\$65,315	\$70,547	\$76,026
5	\$60,091	\$64,597	\$70,754	\$76,428	\$82,329
7	\$64,338	\$69,167	\$75,727	\$81,789	\$88,063

Source: ERI. Published Q2 of 2019.

ERI defines a Childbirth Educator as a position that plans, coordinates, evaluates, and administers the childbirth education program; designs, develops, and implements health education programs designed to increase awareness and knowledge to patients planning to give birth; and determines the educational needs of the expectant family in collaboration with the childbirth coordinator and other instructors and assistants.

Current	New Position
Recommended	Doula Program Manager Pay Range 1EX (\$58,462 - \$81,844) 1 Position

This position is responsible for planning culturally competent outreach events, educational and support groups; providing ongoing supervision of staff members involved with the BOMB Doula Program; coordinating trainings and certifications; networking and building relationships with community partners; and overseeing the collection of quality data, performing analysis, and reporting on findings. Its duties and responsibilities are further detailed below as are

the percentages of time spent on corresponding functions.

40% Coordinate Staff and Programming

- Develop strong relationships through appropriate communication and interpersonal interaction.
- Ensure that program staff has adequate training and knowledge necessary to be successful in their role.
- Advise program leaders and oversee both case and outreach assignments for staff.
- Provide quality assurance and maintain well-documented, accurate, organized, and up-to-date case notes.
- Serve program participants in the most expedient, organized, and knowledgeable manner.
- Schedule/coordinate health education sessions and social support groups building capacity for individuals.

20% Public Health Education and Social Support

- Engage clients and community partners around concepts of “mothering the mother”.
- Emphasize the dyadic and transactional nature of early social interaction.
- Create learning environments where participants feel secure, valued, successful, and happy to nurture maternal sensitivity and responsiveness.
- Provide education and ongoing support around labor and delivery, creating birth plans, breastfeeding, preparing for baby to come home, and help with emotional and physical recovery after a client gives birth.
- Develop, identify, teach, evaluate, and/or provide technical assistance related to educational methods and materials appropriate for target audience.
- Provide appropriate referrals and comprehensive information to clients regarding general health, prevention, required processes for applying health and human service benefits, support services for low income families (including housing, employment, AODA, parenting support services, violence prevention, etc.).

20% Data Collection and Reporting

- Streamline data collection, program evaluation, and preparation of events tracking.
- Coordinate data collection and maintenance in accordance with program and departmental standards.
- Present data and provide feedback around areas in need of services.
- Prepare and input monthly documentation in the division dashboard.
- Complete annual reports to ensure data quality on a continual basis.

10% Establish and Maintain Collaborative Relationships and Training in the Community

- Establish and maintain collaborative relationships with MHD programs and outside service agencies involved in the provision of child and healthcare services to recruit and enroll clients.
- Design activities to recruit new community partners into MHD maternal and child health programming.
- Oversee systems that document efforts, client participation, referrals, and follow-up.
- Convene/facilitate the Milwaukee Lifecourse Initiative for Health Families Healthcare Access Committee.
- Introduce best practices, pilot new activities, and adopt innovative approaches to recruiting and maintaining community stakeholders.
- Implement innovative and evidence-based protocols within the community in a culturally competent way.
- Fulfill requests and conduct trainings focused on “mothering the mother” for entities seeking information, presentations, and participation at community health events.
- Collaborate with all MHD divisions to ensure MCH programmatic representation at applicable events.

10% Outreach and Program Promotion

- Using data for guidance, create an outreach strategy targeting diverse and non-traditional locations to strengthen and increase programmatic reach.
- Write, design (utilizing the MHD designer), and distribute marketing materials, flyers, program information, reports, and a programmatic newsletter to targeted audiences.

- Conduct site visitation, establish relationships, build rapport with site staff, and provide education, technical assistance, and capacity-building activities to partners in need.

Minimum requirements include a bachelor's degree from a four-year college or university in public health, social work, nursing, community health, or related field; four years of related experience and/or training in public health community outreach, program development, and/or other community organizing, including two years of progressively responsible and/or supervisory experience; and training as a community health outreach worker, doula, and/or certified lactation consultant. Equivalent combinations of education and experience may be considered. These requirements have not yet been assessed by the Staffing Division.

In addition to survey data, comparisons were made to other related City positions. In comparing and contrasting this position with comparable program managers within the Health Department, this new position has been found to be most comparable to the Empowering Families of Milwaukee (EFM) Program Manager, Well Women's Program Manager, and the Men's Health Manager in Pay Range 1EX (\$63,807 - \$81,844). These titles and their given duties and responsibilities are listed below.

Title: Pay Range: Department:	EFM Program Manager 1EX (\$63,807 - \$81,844) Health Department	Provide leadership of home-visiting program and supervision of staff; collect data and perform analysis; regularly report on project goals; ensure adequate resources/protocols are met.
Title: Pay Range: Department:	Well Women's Program Manager 1EX (\$63,807 - \$81,844) Health Department	Manage the Milwaukee Breast & Cervical Cancer Awareness and Wisconsin Well Woman Program; perform strategic planning, grant writing, contract evaluation, budget prep, etc.
Title: Pay Range: Department:	Men's Health Manager 1EX (\$63,807 - \$81,844) Health Department	Oversee program staff and two Men's Health Centers; ensures delivery and reporting of contract goals; develop and implements program objectives; and monitor performance.

To place this new position at the level of these above titles is also in line with what ERI has listed for the mean rates of pay for one to seven years' experience (\$59,637 - \$75,727). The title of "Doula Program Manager" is recommended to put an emphasis on the name of the project. We therefore recommend this new position be classified as Doula Program Manager in Pay Range 1EX (\$58,462 - \$81,844). We further recommend a footnote be designated to this title to allow minimum recruitment at \$63,807. This minimum recruitment rate will align the position with the minimum recruitment rate for its above listed comparables as well as set the position slightly above the maximum rate of pay for the Doulas below in which it oversees.

Current	New Position		
Recommended	Doula	Pay Range 2EN (\$45,306 - \$63,426)	4 Positions

These positions are responsible for developing caseloads with expectant mothers and providing home and possibly hospital visitation services. Its incumbents will teach and provide newborn care and lactation support during the postnatal period, aiming to "mother the mother" through her early post-partum experience. The duties and responsibilities are further detailed below as are the percentages of time spent on corresponding functions.

40% Home Visiting Services

- Develop and maintain supportive, trusting relationships with clients and their families.
- Promote maternal and child health and positive birth outcomes.
- Provide ongoing home visits and contact using phone/digital messaging.

- Utilize professional training and judgment to complete assessments and screening of clients' physical, social, psychological, and environmental health status, and make appropriate referrals and in-person connections to community resources.
- Act as an advocate regarding client needs from governmental, community, medical, and private entities.
- Provide individualized health education around promoting the adoption of safe and health behaviors – including health parent-child interaction and self-care practices.
- Collaborate with private care providers, allied professionals, and MHD personnel regarding needs of clients.
- Provide continuous support through a client's labor and delivery.
- Develop and implement care plans for resolution of assessed need.
- Document all client interactions following MHD policy and Medicaid requirements.
- Provide consultation and support to other team members as needed.

20% Public Health Education and Social Support

- Engage clients and community partners around concepts of “mothering the mother”.
- Emphasize the dyadic and transactional nature of early social interaction.
- Create learning environments where participants feel secure, valued, successful, and happy to nurture maternal sensitivity and responsiveness.
- Provide education and ongoing support around labor and delivery, creating birth plans, breastfeeding, preparing for baby to come home, and help with emotional and physical recovery after a client gives birth.
- Develop, identify, teach, evaluate, and/or provide technical assistance related to educational methods and materials appropriate for target audience.
- Provide appropriate referrals and comprehensive information to clients regarding general health, prevention, and required processes for applying health and human service benefits and support services.

20% Establish and Maintain Collaborative Relationships and Training in the Community

- Establish and maintain collaborative relationships and conduct trainings with MHD programs and outside service agencies involved in the provision of child and health care services to recruit and enroll clients.
- Design activities to recruit new community partners into MHD maternal and child health programming.
- Oversee systems that document efforts, client participation, referrals, and follow-up.
- Introduce best practices, pilot new activities, and adopt innovative approaches to recruiting and maintaining community stakeholders.
- Implement both innovative and pre-identified evidence-based protocols within the community.
- Fulfill requests seeking information, presentations, and participation at community health events.
- Collaborate with all MHD divisions to staff events.
- Coordinate and lead educational meetings.
- Attend and present at program-related events.

10% Outreach and Program Promotion

- Using data for guidance, create an outreach strategy targeting diverse and non-traditional locations to strengthen and increase programmatic reach.
- Write, design (utilizing the MHD designer), and distribute marketing materials, flyers, program information, reports, and a programmatic newsletter to targeted audiences.
- Conduct site visitation, establish relationships, build rapport with site staff, and provide education, technical assistance, and capacity-building activities to partners in need.

20% Data Collection and Reporting

- Participate in data collection, program evaluation, and preparation of events tracking for the departmental reporting pertinent to program (or contract) objectives, or assigned by the program supervisor.

- Coordinate data collection and maintenance in accordance with program and departmental standards.
- Present data and provide feedback around areas in need of services, and prepare monthly documentation and annual reports to monitor and pursue quality assurance and improvement on a continual basis.

Minimum requirements include an associate's degree in public health, social work, community health, or related field; and two years of related experience and/or training in public health community outreach, program development, and/or other community organizing experience. Equivalent combinations of education and experience may be considered. These requirements have not yet been assessed by the Staffing Division.

To place this new position at Pay Range 2EN (\$45,306 - \$63,426) is in line with the 10th percentile Childbirth Educator rates of pay for one to seven years' experience (\$50,709 - \$64,338) listed earlier in the report. We therefore recommend these four new positions be classified as Doula in Pay Range 2EN (\$45,306 - \$63,426).

Action Required – Effective Pay Period 10, 2019 (May 5, 2019)

In the Salary Ordinance

Under Pay Range 1EX:

Add the title “Doula Program Manager (9)”.

Under Pay Range 2EN:

Add the title “Doula”.

In the Positions Ordinance

Under Nurse Family Partnership Program:

Delete four positions of “Community Outreach Liaison”.

Delete one position of “Health Project Coordinator”.

Create the section “BOMB Doula Program”.

Under BOMB Doula Program:

Add one position of “Doula Program Manager”.

Add four positions of “Doula”.

Prepared by: 
 Derek Reilly, Human Resources Analyst – Senior

Reviewed by: 
 Andrea Knickerbocker, Human Resources Manager

Reviewed by: 
 Maria Monteagudo, Employee Relations Director