



Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date: 8/5/2019
Ald. Robert Bauman District: 4
Staff reviewer: Tim Askin
PTS #114699 CCF #181800

Property 600 – 610 N. BROADWAY East Side Commercial Historic District

Owner/Applicant 600 NORTH BROADWAY LLC John Vetter
225 E MICHIGAN ST #110 614 North Milwaukee
MILWAUKEE WI 53202 Milwaukee, WI 53202

Proposal Project consists of an overall rehabilitation of the property with conversion to a hotel. Alterations to the historic building are limited to a canopy over the Broadway storefronts, new paint, and new windows.

A partial one-story is proposed for the rooftop in a contemporary design. This has been downsized from the 5-story version originally submitted.

Staff comments Disregarding the addition for the moment, the changes proposed for the historic core of the building are sensitive and appropriate. The canopy is thoughtfully designed and the storefronts are brought back to a historically-inspired appearance without being an exact replica at the main entry. There appear to be no surviving original windows and none of the current windows would be approved by this body. Therefore new, operable windows, if they are to be wood, would be a welcome change. The decision to repaint the masonry is unfortunate, but allowable and understandable. The applicant has correctly noted that attempting to remove the present paint has the possibility of adding substantial costs to the project.

Staff finds that the alterations proposed for the historic portion of the building to be within the guidelines. The entry presents a minor complication. It is acceptable as designed, but as there is documentary evidence of the original entry, an exact replica should be allowed as an option, as this may be required as part of a historic preservation tax credit approval or be a possible preferred alternative.

Addition

There appears to be no precedents within this particular historic district. Only demolition and new construction has occurred in the past.

The standards for review are as follows:

A. 1. Roofs Retain the original roof shape. Dormers, skylights and solar collector panels may be added to roof surfaces if they are not visible from the street. Avoid making changes to the roof shape that would alter the building height, roofline or pitch. This includes parapets, pediments and cornices.

A. 5. Additions Make additions that harmonize with the existing building architecturally and are located so as not to be visible from the public right-of-way, if at all possible. Avoid making additions that are unsympathetic to the original structure and visually intrude upon the principal elevations.

Staff comments The addition would be change to the roofline that is visible from the public right of way and would change the height, as indicated in the applicant's renderings. The design is a high quality effort at being compatible and sympathetic addition. It is executed with attention to the form, massing, and lines of the building and the overall district. The even side of 600 block of N. Broadway has consistent heights creating a rhythm that is rarely found elsewhere. Viewed from Broadway, there will be very limited disruption of the rhythm as viewed from ground level. The shortest setback from a sidewalk edge is 15'; other setbacks go up to 20'.

Given the setbacks and single-story height, the addition appears to be acceptable. Staff would prefer more use of masonry in the addition than the proposed extensive use of metal panels, but the design and siting are otherwise acceptable.

Recommendation Recommend HPC Approval

Conditions

If approved:

1. Masonry that is currently unpainted, must remain unpainted, this includes, but is not limited to stone trim and keystones at the windows.
2. Replacement windows will be all wood both inside and out. No vinyl, vinyl-clad, aluminum, aluminum-clad or fiberglass windows are permitted. New glass size must match the original glass size. Muntin profiles and sash heights must match documented originals, not necessarily the present windows
3. Bricks on rooftop addition should have the same face dimensions as historic bricks.
4. Signage and lighting to be reviewed separately.
5. Any required railing at roof edge to be submitted separately to staff for approval.

Previous HPC action Held for revisions twice. Previous proposals included 3 or 5 story additions.

Previous Council action