



Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date: 9/11/2017

Ald. Ashanti Hamilton District: 1

Staff reviewer: Tim Askin

PTS #114356

CCF #170679

Property	4476 N. 25TH ST.	Garden Homes Historic District
Owner/Applicant	WILLIAM SMITH PO BOX 250384 MILWAUKEE WI 53225	William C Smith 9309 W Riverwoods Dr Milwaukee, WI 53224 Phone: (414) 378-9890
Proposal	Applicant proposes to replace all original 6/6 wood windows with 1/1 Anderson vinyl windows. Some windows have already been replaced.	
Staff comments	<p>This property is a duplex in the Garden Homes Historic District. It was recently acquired by a new owner.</p> <p>Vinyl windows are not permitted in local historic districts per the city's guideline book Living with History, which the Milwaukee Common Council has officially adopted as part of the formal guidelines for historic structures, and districts. In addition to the citywide guidelines, Garden Homes guidelines C.1. and C.2. state:</p> <p>C.1. Retain original window and door openings as they are essential to the architectural character of the house. Retain the existing configuration of panes, sash, surrounds and sills, except as necessary to restore to the original condition.</p> <p>C.2. Vinyl, vinyl clad, metal, and metal-clad or fiberglass prime window units are not permitted. If new windows are required, replacements will be of wood and match the six-over-six style of the originals.</p> <p>There is one case in Garden Homes where vinyl windows were installed by the Health Department as part of its lead abatement program. This was an error on the part of the Health as their approval was denied by HPC staff. No enforcement action has been taken on this property because it was the fault of the city and not of the property owner.</p> <p>As 1) vinyl windows do not meet the guidelines, 2) other property owners in the district and city have been required to comply with the all-wood standard consistently, and 3) this commission generally does not approve replacements that are not solid wood, the remaining original wood windows should be retained and rehabilitated and the application should be denied.</p>	
Recommendation	Recommend HPC Denial	
Conditions		
Previous HPC action	The Commission's most recent denial of a non-wood window proposal was February 2017 for 608 N. Broadway in the East Side Commercial Historic District.	
Previous Council action		