



# Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

**HPC meeting date: 8/5/2019**

**Ald. Nik Kovac District: 3**

**Staff reviewer: Tim Askin**

**PTS #114801 CCF #190577**

**Property** 1327 E. BRADY ST.

**Owner/Applicant** JC Capital Corp  
7324 N Crossway  
Fox Point, WI 53217  
Jeno Cataldo  
7324 N Crossway  
Fox Point, WI 53217

**Proposal** Two-story addition at the rear of the property with shed roof. It is 20' x 28' and 23' tall. Design is very simple with wood clapboard siding. There are two windows on the east elevation and no others. An accessible ramp wraps around the back to a new door.

**Staff comments** The existing building is 1-1/2 stories and roughly 20' x 45' with tight property lines. It is a typical Brady Street residential building that was converted to primarily retail use long ago.  
  
The addition is too large and too simple for the building. One story would be a much more feasible proposal. Additional design effort is needed to make the addition architecturally compatible. Staff would consider supporting a one-story addition with a shallow gable roof, more architectural detailing, and more windows.

**Guidelines** *5. Additions Make additions that harmonize with the existing building architecturally and are located so as not visible from the public right-of-way, if at all possible. Avoid making additions that are unsympathetic to the original structure and visually intrude upon the principal elevations.*  
An effort has been made to meet most of this criterion. It is barely visible from Brady Street, but the size and shed roof are not sympathetic to the the original structure.  
  
A. Guidelines for New Construction It is important that additional new construction be designed so as to harmonize with the character of the district.  
  
*1. Siting New construction must reflect the traditional siting of buildings in the Brady Street Historic District. This includes setback, spacing between buildings, the orientation of openings to the street and neighboring structures.*  
This guidelines appears to be met. Building depths are highly variable on Brady Street.  
  
*2. Scale Overall building height and bulk; the expression of major building divisions including foundation, body and roof; and, individual building components such as porches, overhangs and fenestration must be compatible with the surrounding structures.*  
The addition does not have the traditional separation of foundation, body, and roof, it reads as a singular mass. Overhangs exist, but the main roof of the building is gabled, so the overhangs do not align.

**Guidelines (continued)**

*3. **Form** The massing of new construction must be compatible with the surrounding buildings. The profiles of roofs and building elements that project and recede from the main block must express the same continuity established by the historic structures.*

The concerns are similar to those with scale. The addition reads as a singular mass without any definition to the divisions of building parts. There is no visual continuity of features with the historic structure to which it would be attached. Further, the addition causes the loss of four windows and only proposes two new ones on a different elevation.

*4. **Materials** The building materials that are visible from the public right-of-way should be consistent with the colors, textures, proportions, and combinations of cladding materials traditionally used in the Brady Street Historic District. The physical composition of the materials may be different from that of the historic materials, but the same appearance should be maintained.*

Materials are not strictly specified, but the applicant has verbally agreed to all wood siding and all wood windows.

**Recommendation**

Recommend HPC Denial

**Conditions**

**Previous HPC action**

**Previous Council action**