

Millennial Task Force research on policy, programs, etc.

* Note: this is a working document of resources, studies, and articles related to: brain drain in Milwaukee, Millennial trends and preferences, City of Milwaukee current programs and policies, and peer city/state models. Document last updated: 10/1/2020

Brain Drain in Milwaukee and Wisconsin

US Census Data: “Metro-by-Metro by Age 2011-2015”

- On average, more Millennials migrate to Milwaukee metro region than leave each year. Overall, Milwaukee:
 - Net gained 655 20-24-year-olds
 - Net gained 659 25-29-year-olds
 - Net gained 54 30-34-year-olds
 - Net gained 205 35-39-year-olds
- Milwaukee net gains people from Chicago, especially Millennials. Milwaukee:
 - Net gained 1,139 18-19 year-olds
 - Net gained 510 20-24-year-olds
 - Net gained 136 25-29-year-olds
 - Net gained 152 30-34-year-olds
 - Net gained 163 35-39-year-olds
- However, overall 18-19 year olds was largest group to leave Milwaukee metro area
 - Milwaukee net lost 2,412 18-19 year olds
 - More than half (1,352) migrated to Dane County (Madison), suggesting many Gen Z people go to college at UW-Madison - suggests there may be higher education issue facing Milwaukee
 - Net loss of 262 18-19-year-olds to Minnesota
- Of all age groups, Milwaukee metro area would see a net outflow of people if not for the immigration population; rising Hispanic birth rate helps keep overall population afloat

2020 Census Bureau population estimates

- Milwaukee metro area population grew by 19,000 or 1.2% between 2010 and 2019
 - In comparison, Minneapolis population grew by 306,000 or 9.2% over same time period
 - Kansas City and Indy grew by 7.4% and 9.9%, respectively
- Milwaukee’s Metro Statistical Area (MSA): Milwaukee, Waukesha, Ozaukee, Washington counties
- Since 2010:
 - Milwaukee has had 59,000 more births than deaths, which is comparably a good number
 - 25,000 more people immigrated to Milwaukee from another country than emigrated away
 - However, Milwaukee ranks 370th out of 384 metro areas in net domestic migration: **Milwaukee metro area has net lost 39,000 people this decade** – birth rate only reason for pop. Growth
 - Lots of net population loss from young adults: each year on avg. 6,500 arrive while 10,000 leave

National study

- In 2017, 20.4% more highly-educated people **left than stayed in Wisconsin**, ranking the 4th highest state in the nation
- In 2017, 10.7% more highly-educated people **left than entered Wisconsin**, ranking the 8th highest state in the nation

Wisconsin Policy Forum: [State Losing Highly Educated Workers](#)

- Wisconsin’s wages trail national median in many occupations, such as engineering

City of Milwaukee Department of Employee Relations (DER) 2020 Budget materials

- There were 161 general City employee resignations in 2018, up from 146 in 2017
- 28% of City employees reside outside of city
- City workforce demographics: Millennials 31% (2019); projected 50% (2024)

- By 2024, 30% of City government workforce will be eligible to retire
- DER launched social media campaign in 2019 – [Facebook page](#)
- DER predicts 35,000 job openings in Milwaukee metro area may go unfilled in next 3 years

Emily Keeley DER presentation:

- Millennials represent 53% of new City hires, 30% of the overall workforce, 48% of separations, and have on average less than 2 years of service
 - Retention seems to be the key issue, whereas attraction has been easier
 - DER has engaged in retention measures, such as stay interviews to find out what employees want
 - DER developing exit interviews on why they leave (could be compensation, values, culture)
 - Emily believes reasons for separation include: lesser compensation compared to suburbs, bad workplace culture, no sense of community, lack of a formal mentorship program, no core City value or mission
- Millennials have become more diverse over past 5 years; make-up is as follows:
 - 56% Caucasian, 30% African American, 11% Hispanic, 3% Asian, less than 1% American Indian, and 0% Pacific Islander
- Gen Z represents 12% to 14% of City workforce, but little other data exists for this age group

Millennial Trends and Preferences

[2019 Brookings Institute report: demographic trends](#)

[2018 Illinois Municipal Policy Journal study](#)

- Millennials have propensity to rent rather than buy homes, have strong preference for short commutes, walkable neighborhoods, and transportation access
- Prefer experiences over products when spending time and money; want amenity-rich environments
- Among homebuying Millennials, strongest influences on location choice were neighborhood quality, convenience to jobs, and affordability

[2016 Abodo survey](#)

For people born between 1982 and 1998, top 5 priorities in a city are: thriving job market, affordable rent, affordable home prices, parks or hiking trails, and local restaurants

[2014 Transportation for America Millennial survey](#)

- 66% of Millennials said quality transportation is in their top 3 criteria for choosing where to live
- 54% of Millennials surveyed said they would consider moving to another city if it had more and better transportation options

[2018 PEW Post-Millennials study](#)

- Post-Millennials most racially diverse generation: 52% of 6- to 21-year-olds are non-Hispanic whites
- Oldest post-Millennials are enrolling in college at a significantly higher rate than Millennials were at a comparable age

[2020 Observatory Report on youth movement](#)

- Since 2010, number of 25 to 34 year old’s with a 4 year degree are concentrating in dense neighborhoods of large metro areas has grown by 32% since 2010, to 1.3 million
- Increase in number of well-educated adults in all of US’s 52 most populated metros since 2010
- Well-educated young adults are 3.5 times more likely to live in dense urban neighborhoods
- COVID has not reduced these trends

Racial and Policing Issues Affecting Millennials

2020 Yubo Gen Z poll on racial issues

- Of people aged 13 to 25 (Gen Z), 88% believe Black Americans are treated differently than others
- Nearly 90% of those who responded to poll said they support Black Lives Matter
- 83% of respondents felt that police use too much force in the US

2020 US Chamber of Commerce America's Opportunity Gaps report

- In US, people of color face education gaps at all levels, resulting in skills and employment gaps
- Black unemployment rates have been consistently twice as high as white unemployment for 40 years
- Black people comprised 27% of all people arrested in 2016, twice their proportion of total population
- Average white family net worth (\$171,000) is nearly 10 times more than avg. Black family (\$17,150)

Common Council proposes to cut 10% of police budget

- 11 Council members co-sponsored resolution directing city budget director to model 2021 budget with 10% MPD budget cut, which would free up \$30 million
- 2021 Budget hearings will begin in fall and Budget will be adopted in November 2020

Common Council urges FPC to implement policy changes for MPD

- Common Council Files [200320](#), [200430](#), [200432](#) urge the Fire and Police Commission to adopt de-escalation and restraint polices along with implementing emotional intelligence and cultural competency requirements for MPD

Transportation and Infrastructure

City of Milwaukee's Complete Streets Policy

[File Number 180922](#) passed Common Council in October 2018

“The public way shall be designed, operated, and maintained to address accessibility and maximize the comfort, safety, and needs of all users, of all ages and abilities, whether traveling on foot, by using mobility aids/devices, by transit, by bicycle, or by motor vehicle, including freight/delivery. This Complete Streets Policy shall apply to all public and private entities doing work in the public way and on City-owned transportation facilities, including, but not limited to, streets, sidewalks, alleys, bridges, trails, and the Riverwalk. The City will encourage the owners and operators of other highways, private streets, sidewalks, alleys, trails, and parking lots to also adhere to the Policy through funding requirements and development review processes.”

2019 Milwaukee Complete Streets Health and Equity Report

Urban Milwaukee: How is the City Doing on Complete Streets?

“DPW notes that 22 projects were completed in 2019. Primarily due to the timing of the policy's October 2018 adoption and long lead time on many DPW projects, only two projects incorporated Complete Streets improvements.”

“The city added 1.2 miles of protected bike lanes in 2019, slightly more than doubling the existing segments. A total of 3.5 miles of traditional bike lanes were added to the city’s existing 160 miles of marked or protected lanes and shared-use trails.”

“The city recorded 12 fatalities and 71 serious injuries for pedestrians, one fatality and 11 serious injuries for bicyclists and 41 fatalities and 245 serious injuries for motor vehicle drivers.”

“A case study of what went right is centered on the conversion of N. Hawley Rd. between W. Wells St. and W. Vliet St. from two driving lanes in each direction to one, with the addition of protected bike lanes. ‘DPW crews implemented the traffic safety improvements in August 2019 and the desired changes were realized almost immediately,’ says the report. The case study says the number of people going over 40 miles per hour decreased by 45 percent, average and median speeds fell by two miles per hour and motor vehicle traffic volumes increased by two percent.”

National Studies

2014 Transportation for America Survey

“Four in five millennials say they want to live in places where they have a variety of options to get to jobs, school or daily needs, according to a new survey of Americans age 18-34 in 10 major U.S. cities.”

“More than half (54%) of millennials surveyed say they would consider moving to another city if it had more and better options for getting around, and 66 percent say that access to high quality transportation is one of the top three criteria in considering deciding where to live next.”

2015 Cities Safer by Design Report

“People from lower socioeconomic backgrounds are more likely to be involved in traffic crashes, and often live in areas with low-quality infrastructure.”

“Data confirms there are fewer fatalities in places with fewer vehicle miles traveled and those promoting mass transport, walking and cycling, thus reducing overall exposure.”

“For every 1 percent change toward a more compact and connected urban form, all-mode traffic fatality rates fell by 1.49 percent and pedestrian fatality rates fell by 1.47 to 3.56 percent.”

“When rebuilding a road to promote safer conditions, the introduction of Bus Rapid Transit has been shown to reduce traffic crashes on urban roads, in addition to providing a safer in-vehicle experience than motor vehicle drivers.”

2016 Pursuing Equity in Pedestrian and Bicycle Planning Report

“One recent study found that among pedestrians that had been involved in a collision with a car, Black pedestrians were 22 percent more likely and Latinos 33 percent more likely to die from their injuries than whites (23). These discrepancies may be due to differences in overall health of the individual, the severity of the crash, in the amount of speeding and cut-through traffic happening in the neighborhood where the pedestrians were traveling, and/or the quality of emergency medical care available.”

2017 American Strategies National Community and Transportation Preferences Survey

“Millennials especially, but also Gen Xers, are more likely to live in at least somewhat walkable neighborhoods, and are more likely to have sidewalks, public transit, and parks nearby.”

“The more walkable the community, the more satisfied residents are with their quality of life.”

“When given a choice between a detached, single-family house that requires driving to shops and a longer commute to work and a townhouse or apartment with an easy walk to shops and a shorter commute to work, residents now split evenly in their preference. Most notable is that once the commute length is brought into the equation, Millennials change their preference: six-in-ten Millennials prefer the walkable community and shorter commute even with the attached home. This remains true even for Millennials with kids at home and in school.”

Peer Cities

Cleveland, Ohio

“The number of jobs nearly doubled along Euclid Avenue following completion of the bus rapid transit HealthLine in 2008, according to a new study released by the Center for Population Dynamics at Cleveland State University.”

Indianapolis, Indiana

“At a time of nationwide disinvestment in public infrastructure, the city can boast of moving in the opposite direction. Before 2010, there was less than a mile of bike lanes in Indianapolis. Now, there’s over 90 miles.”

“And ever since 2008, when the city built the eight-mile Cultural Trail, the city’s reaped big benefits: Property values increased by \$1 billion, businesses have seen more sales, and residents feel safer.”

Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania

“The plan ultimately proposes an additional 156 miles of safe bicycle facilities, expanding the total network from 30 miles of on-street facilities and 44 miles of trail to 150 miles on street and 76 miles of trails for a total of over 226 miles of travel lanes for bicycles and other low-speed travel modes.”

“Implementation is based around five goals: A Vision Zero stance saying no one dies traveling on city streets; that all households can access fresh fruits and vegetables 20 minutes from home without a private car; making walking and bicycling are ‘the most joyful mode’ for short distance trips; ensuring no household spends more than 45 percent of household income for basic housing and mobility; and finally that ‘Pittsburgh streets and rights of way reflect the values of our community.’”

Portland, Oregon

“The East Portland in Motion Plan, produced by the Urban League of Portland, ‘identified equity as a leading principle of the project’ and used equity as one of the two key criteria for project selection in an effort to add bike lanes to connect a network through a traditionally underserved community.”

Tampa, Florida

“A redesign of Fletcher Avenue lays out a roadmap to a safer streetscape for motorists, pedestrians, and bicyclists in Hillsborough County and Tampa, according to a report from the Hillsborough County Metropolitan Planning Commission.”

“During three years after the upgrades, data found 46 non-incapacitating injuries, or a 37 percent reduction; 20 incapacitating injuries, or a 46 percent reduction; and two fatalities, or a 60 percent reduction.”

City of Milwaukee Programs and Policies

*Note: Many of the below items are not necessarily geared to Millennials in particular but are listed to provide an overview of programs that young people may benefit from.

Workforce and Economic Development

- **[Direct Connect MKE](#) – [recent presentation](#)
 - Smart platform targeting underserved Millennials on job placement and training opportunities
 - Provides information on supportive services and access to 130 career mentors who work in 40 workforce development organizations
 - City’s Office of Workforce Development has raised nearly \$2 million in private funding
 - Objectives of the platform are to combat young adult challenges (skills gap, career readiness, barriers, unemployment, outdated tech, overworked professionals, etc.), provide expertise, increase awareness of training and placement opportunities, increase engagement, help connect and improve access to employment services, share event information, learn about job seekers, build social capital or youths or young adults, break silos, share successes with local professionals, build a network of trust, and transform disconnection into success
 - The platform had a soft launch and is now at full capacity to do a full launch soon
 - From 2018 to 2019 there has been an increase of 48% in employment agency activities on DCMKE. This activity indicates acceptability of an innovative digital approach to promoting, enrolling and provide support to job seekers.
 - The platform currently has 38 networks (employment agencies), 207 supportive service agencies, 530 job seekers, 139 admins, and 119 promoters**
- **[Milwaukee Promise Zones](#)**
 - Created in [2017](#) to create jobs, increase economic activity, improve educational opportunities, leverage private investment and reduce violent crime in select areas
 - Initiative targets 4 designated zones and one satellite zone: Greater Old North, Near South Side, North/Division Harambee, Washington Park, and the Woodlands
 - [In 2018](#), led to nearly 450 people finding employment; childhood education initiative established
- **Equitable development**
 - [2019 Council legislation](#) and [Dept. of City Development recommendations](#) on equitably distributing benefits accruing downtown: seek state authorization for raising money in order to spur investments; establish mentor relationships for businesses; improve access of workers to downtown jobs; encourage downtown residents to invest in near-downtown neighborhoods
 - Council established in 2019 an [Anti-Displacement Advisory Committee](#) and [Anti-Displacement Preference Policy](#)
 - Council established [Disparity Study Independent Review Committee](#) in 2018 – [2019 update](#)
- **[Milwaukee’s Business Toolbox – Department of City Development](#)**
 - Milwaukee Economic Development Corporation offers businesses “gap” financing at below market interest rates
 - [Residents Preference Program \(RPP\)](#) - Contractors on City projects typically need at least 40% of workers to be City residents
 - CDBG funding (targeted to low income families): City allocated \$22.6 million for 2020 from federal government
- **[Office of African American Affairs](#)**
 - Providing direct services and resources for African American residents in areas including employment, job training, education, business ownership, financial literacy, and health care
 - OAAA housed at City-owned foreclosed property at 4830 N. Fond du Lac Avenue
 - OAAA recently received \$100,000 from federal CDBG
 - [2020 City Budget](#) included 1 staff member for OAAA
 - Council issued [statement](#) calling for Mayor to pledge “full funding” to OAAA in 2021 Budget

Apprenticeship-type programs

- **Fire Cadet Program**
 - Apprentice-style program for 17-19 year olds
 - 2020 City budget includes funding for 52 cadets
 - Paid program where they get trained; complete Associates degree simultaneously, which is subject to Tuition Reimbursement program
 - In 2017, an [MOU was established](#) between Milwaukee Fire Department and Milwaukee Public Schools to prepare high school students for entering the MFD Fire Cadet Program
- **Summer Youth Internship Program**
 - Placed [130 teens](#) in City government departments in 2018
 - Funded primarily by federal Community Development Block Grant (CDBG)
- According to [DER](#), the City hired 32 new interns and apprentices in 2019:
 - 9 construction laborer interns
 - 4 engineering inspection assistants
 - 1 engineering intern
 - 3 librarian associates
 - 4 management trainees
 - 3 traffic operations assistants
 - 8 urban forestry arborist apprentices
- State of Wisconsin requires 65% of apprenticeships to lead to post-apprenticeship opportunity
 - City's Employ Milwaukee program notes that there was a [69% average training completion rate](#) for all programs in 2018

Incentivizing Employees and Disincentivizing them from Leaving City Government

- In 2019 the Council approved a 3% salary increase for employees who reside within the city
- City offers generous benefits package: pension, retirement, healthy rewards program, tuition reimbursement, etc.
- Council passed resolution in 2018 directing DER to disincentivize employees from leaving City after receiving significant investment in training - [Common Council File 181296](#)
 - Council has also previously discussed possibility of requiring employees sign a contract keeping them with the City for a set amount of time if they receive significant training. However, this idea is more common in private sector and is unlikely to be legally feasible

Housing

10,000 Homes Initiative

- Initiative first announced by Mayor Barrett in 2018
- Three strategies:
 1. Develop new and preserve existing affordable housing, including rental and owner-occupied
 2. Retain and promote homeownership
 3. Maintain and improve Milwaukee's affordable housing stock
- **Actions:** aggressively uses TIF to support affordable housing, expands the [STRONG Home Loans Program](#) and coordinates city resources such as the sale of city-owned homes
- City allocated [\\$1 million](#) to program in 2020 budget
- In 2019, one year after program started, [some Council members](#) said program doesn't go far enough and they want to see:
 - Expanded leasing and sale of the 1,000 city-owned homes acquired through foreclosure
 - More staff and resources available for Housing Trust Fund
 - Develop affordable housing in higher income areas
 - Better marketing

- As of Feb. 2020, DCD had supported the creation, maintenance, or acquisition of 2,092 units of affordable housing since 2018
- Lafayette Crump was recently [confirmed](#) as new Dept. of City Development (DCD) Commissioner
 - He seeks to expand what DCD does and “look at new models”
- Recent Wisconsin Policy Forum [Report](#): For first time, 10,000 Homes Initiative will compile and track all information related to City’s housing program
 - WPF recommends City strengthen Initiative by creating comprehensive housing plan with key objectives, and/or expanding interagency team’s role in order to maximize resource usage

Other - Miscellaneous Information

- Health Department’s [Office of Violence Prevention](#) takes public health approach to preventing violence – [Blueprint for Peace](#)
 - [Resolution](#) passed in 2020 directing every City dept. to report activities and strategies used to implement the recommendations of the Blueprint for Peace
- [Project Clean and Green](#) – [DPW picks up items for free](#) for set time period
- [STRONG Homes Loan Program](#) – up to \$20,000 loans to owner occupants – assist with rehab
- [Birthing Moms Pilot](#) to distribute water filters and education kits for mothers in areas where lead lateral are common – City allocated [\\$240,000](#) to this in 2020
- Information related to Milwaukee’s educational systems
 - [2018-19 report card](#) notes that over 20.2% of Milwaukee Public Schools exceed or significantly exceed expectations, demonstrating strength of some schools; in Milwaukee County [88.7%](#) of people have high school diploma or higher
 - But [racial disparities](#) persist: 40.5% of white people in the county have bachelor’s degree or higher, compared to just [13.1%](#) of black people
 - Marquette U: ranks [84th](#) in nation by US News; MSOE ranks [8th](#) in regional universities Midwest

State of Wisconsin

State of Wisconsin Ad Campaign

- [State bought ads](#) in Jan 2018 on Chicago CTA transit lines with tagline: “Wisconsin: it’s more you”
- Created through Milwaukee ad agency Nelson Schmidt - cost \$6.8 million
- Focus on commute times and affordable cost of living, and targeted veterans with state benefits
- [Wisconsin Policy Forum](#) notes critics argued ad campaign was ineffective; Gov. Evers did not include funding for it in his budget

Debt Relief

- In 2018 Gov. Walker [proposed](#) annual tax breaks of \$1,000 for 5 years for graduates who earn at least associate’s degree and stay in Wisconsin
 - State’s average student loan debt is over \$30,000
- Andy Gronik, who ran for Governor, [proposed](#) applying the amount that recent graduates owed in state income taxes to their student debt until their debt was fully repaid

Peer City/State Models

Atlanta, Georgia [Curriculum Guide](#)

- Aids high schoolers and parents in planning career-themed pathways

[Chicago Fresh Start program](#)

- Starting fall 2020, debt forgiveness program led by Mayor that will allow students who left City Colleges in good academic standing over last decade to complete degrees/certifications
- Half of outstanding debt to be cleared if they stay enrolled and make satisfactory progress in 1st term
- Remainder of debt will be forgiven upon completion of degree
- Of 21,000 students who qualify for program, 51% are black and 34% are Latino

Cincinnati's Over the Rhine neighborhood transformation

- Cincinnati Central City Development (3CDC) – a privately funded, nonprofit community development corporation led by the business community invested in deteriorating neighborhood by buying over 1,000 parcels of property and partnering with developers
- Founding corporations invested in a \$50 million loan fund, then a \$41 million fund of repaid loans
- Formed creative public/private financing partnerships, with 17 different sources of financing

Learn to Earn Dayton

- Non-profit organization with [\\$900,000 annual budget](#) – receives a significant portion of funding from Dayton Foundation
- Gained important initial funding through 0.25% City of Dayton income tax increase in 2016
- Seeks to ensure 60 percent of workforce has a marketable post-secondary degree by 2025
- Many education-related goals for K-12 students

Pennsylvania Commonwealth Public Service Internship program

- 6-month paid internship program for college students interested in state government
- Students are guaranteed a full-time position upon graduating with a bachelor's degree and completing the internship program

Apprenticeships in K-12 and higher education

- Many apprenticeship programs funded and administered at state level
- Last few years have seen uptick in funding and new programs
- Wisconsin has [Youth Apprenticeship and pre-apprenticeship](#) programs for high school juniors and seniors

Maine intern-mentor program

- Partners with local universities and community colleges to identify potential hires and pair them with veteran workers
- Since the program started in 2013, 70% of the interns have become full-time employees

Growth of Pittsburgh tech industry

- Driven by AI and machine learning tech at Carnegie Mellon
- Mayor seeking inclusive approach, including \$10 million affordable housing fund
- 4 members appointed to [Economic Growth team](#)

Generation Iowa Commission

- Study found that most important factors in determining if person would stay or leave are wage-related
- Commission formed in 2008, disbanded in 2011; difficult to get legislature to adopt recommendations
- Biggest successes were spotlighting problem of brain drain and passage of state law calling for more young Iowans on state boards and commissions
- Report also recommended expanding "Iowa Internship Program" that links top college students with internships in small and medium sized businesses, and expanding the Education Award to Iowa's AmeriCorps volunteers to attract service-minded, educated young professionals

Inclusive growth led by Economic Development Organizations

- [Brookings Institute project](#) highlights role EDOs (defined as regional, public private economic entities such as chambers of commerce) can play in inclusive growth
- Indy, Nashville, San Diego pilot programs - developed strategies to frame inclusive growth as economic imperative

Governing article: America's Declining Cities Try to Attract Millennials

- Columbus, OH: [Experience Columbus campaign](#)
 - Launched by city's tourism division – works collaboratively with downtown organizations
- Detroit, MI: [Write a House campaign](#)
 - Selects writers to receive free house as incentive to move to city
 - Supported by philanthropic grants but initiative is [winding down due to lack of funding](#)
- Philadelphia, PA: [Campus Philly](#)
 - Began with City government encouraging students to explore the city; morphed into nonprofit
 - Now links students to internships and exposes them to arts and volunteering
 - [Discussion on diversity](#) within workforce

Notes

- If the Task Force is interested in making legislative request to the State then the Council could pass a Resolution requesting the State to take action. This would be communicated through the City's Intergovernmental Relations division, which does lobbying in Madison
- Any large funding ideas for programs would go through the 2021 City budget process in fall of 2020

Prepared by: Alex Highley, City of Milwaukee Legislative Reference Bureau