



Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date: 12/3/2018
Ald. Robert Bauman District: 4
Staff reviewer: Tim Askin
PTS #114657 CCF #181174

Property	1046 N. 9TH ST.	Trinity Lutheran Church
Owner/Applicant	TRINITY EV LUTHERAN CONG 1046 N 9TH ST MILWAUKEE WI 53233	Mr. Scott Ramlow Uihlein/Wilson/Ramlow/Stein Architects 322 E. Michigan St. Milwaukee, WI 53202

Proposal The applicant proposes to construct new roof structure and cover building. Install long-term temporary roof on south steeple pending its eventual reconstruction. Apart from the complex architectural and engineering drawings, the proposal can be described in very simple language. In short, the remaining roof trusses will be dismantled and removed and a new structural roof system will be built of steel to provide support for a new ceiling and new roof cladding. Laser scanning and historic photographs were used to design a complete reconstruction with two significant portions left out for the time being. The fleche and the south steeple are not being re-constructed at present. The design is calculated to support the addition of the fleche at a future date.

Within the interior attic space, new concrete supports will be added to the top of the brick walls, such that they are not visible from the exterior or the sanctuary. Similar construction will be used for the hipped apse. The portion that most directly concerns the Commission:

Roof assembly description from exterior to interior:

- A1. Slate as primary bid: machine cut, 10" x 20" x 1/4" to 3/8", Spanish unfading black slate
- A2. Synthetic shingle as alternate bid: 10" x 20" x 1/4" to 3/8", GAF slateline antique slate
- A. Approved shingles
- B. Underlayment membrane, sharkskin ultra or approved equal
- C. 5/8" APA-rated exterior grade plywood, 1/2 stagger joints with insulation layer below
- D. (2) layers of 2 1/2" polyisocyanurate roof insulation with 1/2 stagger joints
- E. Vapor barrier, firestone v-force or approved equal
- F. 1/2" gypsum board substrate
- G. 3" metal deck

New gutter systems are integrated into the design. Repointing and limited brick replacement will occur as needed.

Staff comments The building suffered a major roof fire in May 2018 and has been open to the weather ever since.

The design appears to be an exacting replica of original exterior conditions. Staff has no opinion on the structural system, as it outside the scope of the Commission's review and it is better handled by the plan examiners.

More detail is needed on the proposal for the temporary roof for the south steeple. Staff assumes a proposal is for a cross-gable with asphalt shingling, but that is not detailed in the proposal. This can be worked out with staff via a simple hand sketch or verbal description of the specific proposal. No structural information is expected or required beyond what would be required for the roofing permit.

Guidelines*Ordinance*

f. Deteriorated architectural features shall be repaired rather than replaced, wherever possible. If replacement is necessary, the new material shall match the material being replaced in composition, design, color, texture, and other visual qualities. Repair or replacement of missing architectural features shall be based on accurate duplications of features, substantiated by historic, physical or pictorial evidence rather than on conjectural designs or the availability of different elements from other buildings or structures

*Designation***A. Roofs**

Retain the original roof shape. Avoid making changes to the roof shape that would alter the building height, roofline or pitch. Retain the historic roofing materials on the church if at all possible.

The guidelines indicate that the slate should be required for all roofing that is intended to be permanent.

Recommendation Recommend HPC Approval with conditions

Conditions

1. Require natural slate for main roof because it was extant at the time of the fire.
2. Allow composition shingle for the temporary roof of the collapsed southern steeple. It will be replaced later.
3. Clarify shape and materials of temporary south steeple roof for staff approval.

Standard Masonry Conditions

New mortar must match the original mortar in terms of color, texture, grain size, joint width, and joint finish/profile. The compressive strength of the repointing mortar shall be equal or less than the compressive strength of the original mortar and surrounding brick or stone. The replacement mortar shall contain approximately the same ingredient proportions of the original mortar. Mortar that is too hard is subject to premature failure and could damage the masonry. In most cases, this means a lime mortar with natural hydraulic cement rather than Portland cement. No joint of a width less than 3/8" may be cleaned of damaged/decomposed mortar with power disc grinders. No over-cutting of the joints is permitted. Remove decomposed mortar back into the wall 2.5 times the height of the joint before repointing.

New brick must match as closely as possible the color texture, size, and finish of the original brick.

A sample panel of brick and mortar must be reviewed and approved by HPC staff prior to general installation of the material.

**Previous HPC
action**

**Previous Council
action**