



Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report—Revised 7/3/2020

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date: 7/6/2020

Ald. Marina Dimitrijevic District: 14

Staff reviewer: Tim Askin

PTS #114976 CCF #200260

Property	2590 S. SUPERIOR ST.	
Owner/Applicant	BAY VIEW HISTORICAL SOCIETY 2590 S SUPERIOR ST MILWAUKEE WI 53207	NOFFKE ROOFING COMPANY 10341 N GRANVILLE RD MEQUON, WI 53097
Proposal	Replace roof with Pabco Cascade, Signature Cut, Diamond Shaped A-R, a fiberglass composite shingle, four colors are available. As an alternate Rheinzink diamond-shaped zinc panels are proposed; only a bare metal finish is available. Replace gutters with new zinc half-round gutters.	
Staff comments	<p>The Bayview Historical Society has taken the position that the present diamond asbestos shingles have become a character-defining feature of the property. After some research, this appears to be a reasonable position. Fire insurance maps indicate that a noncombustible roof was installed sometime between 1910 and 1937. Given the known longevity of cement-asbestos roofs, this may be the present roof.</p> <p>As noted earlier, four colors are available in the Pabco Diamond shingle: Antique Black, Cambrian Slate, Oakwood, and Pewter Gray. Guidelines for the property specifically prohibit black. Cambrian slate is too imitative of slate for it to be appropriate for a house that originally had cedar shingles. This leaves the two options of Oakwood and Pewter Gray.</p> <p>The metal roof proposal, while a fine material, would have been outside the financial means of the Brinton family and improbable on any home in 19th century Bayview.</p>	
Recommendation	Recommend HPC Approval of fiberglass shingles in the Oakwood or Pewter colors. Recommend denial of metal roof.	
Conditions	<ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Remove skylight from rear as it is in poor condition. Repair skylight or replace with new flat skylight in the same dimensions.2. Deny metal roof3. Select between Oakwood and Pewter colors.4. Standard roof project conditions <p>No dormers, chimneys, moldings parapets, or other permanent features will be altered or removed. No box vents, if used, will be visible from the street. If they are installed, they must be on a rear slope not visible from the street and they must be painted to blend with the color of the roofing material. A continuous ridge vent can be installed in place of box vents, but the vent must extend across the entire ridge and not stop short. Built-in rain gutters will be retained and sealed where needed. Valleys must be metal W-shape with no interweaving of shingles. Valleys and flashing must be painted or factory-finished to match the roofing color, unless copper. When installing new flashing at a masonry feature, the flashing must be stepped or cut into the mortar joints. The bricks may not be cut to install flashing at an angle.</p>	

We strongly recommend that that the Wisconsin Historical Society's best practices for re-roofing be used to extend the life of your new roof. (Synthetic underlayment is an acceptable alternative to 30lb felt.)

<https://www.wisconsinhistory.org/Records/Article/CS4260>