



Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date: 7/9/2018
Ald. Nik Kovac District: 3
Staff reviewer: Tim Askin
PTS #114551 CCF #180407

Property 1688 N. FRANKLIN PL. Brady Street HD

Owner/Applicant SHEPARDS LLC Iliya Torbica
681 34TH AVE NE
SAINT PETERSBURG FL 33704 Phone: (414) 788-9638

Proposal Applicant's explicit request is replace only front windows to comply with the wood window requirement. The proposed windows address only these windows.

In the alternative, a mothball is requested for a period extending beyond five years.

Mothball Applicant's explicit request is replace only front windows to comply with the wood window requirement. Staff, in consultation with management, believes this request cannot be granted because the previous ruling in April was not appealed.

The Commission can grant mothball status to allow an extended time to address the violations on the windows without further fines. At least one 6-month session of mothball status is warranted to allow time for window manufacture and installation (6 week minimum).

Applicant notes costs of \$38,400 to replace all 48 non-wood windows, which is roughly \$800 per window installed. Staff finds this to be a credible figure.

Finances

Between Jovan, Iliya, and two LLCs operated by Iliya, there is ownership of at least 12 properties cumulatively assessed at over \$2,000,000 in the City of Milwaukee. Additionally Iliya's Florida home is worth approximately \$300,000.

An additional Florida home that is still used as a mailing address for several of the LLCs (according to assessor records) was recently listed for sale for over \$2,000,000 alone.

Given the apparent finances and the many other violations at this and other properties, staff is still willing to support mothball status for only a limited period. As stated above, one 6-month cycle should be granted. Nonetheless, the applicant's request for an open-ended timeline is not acceptable. The mothball status should not be granted beyond 5 years (the maximum length of a preservation tax credit project). Staff feels a longer period is unnecessary, unfair to other property owners in the district, and unrealistic to manage.

Window Replacement Proposal

Applicant also proposes multiple window replacement options. All are 1/1 wood designs with insulated glass. Currently proposed are only replacements for the front windows. There are some arch-top windows on other elevations for which these may not be suitable. Further information is required.

Applicant presents two Jeld-Wen options, one Marvin option, and one Kolbe & Kolbe option. Unfortunately all come with an integrated aluminum storm screen. This is the state of the window replacement industry currently.

Wood storms require a separate order, often from a separate manufacturer. To staff's knowledge, the only national window manufacturer offering a wood storm product is Marvin. Otherwise, it is the option is to use various millwork companies. It is clear that aluminum storms do not have a similar appearance to wood ones, as the thickness of stiles and rails is highly different.

JeldWen offers an interior roller screen that is acceptable. The Marvin order can be adjusted to include wood storm windows. Kolbe does not offer any obvious solutions other than a separate order from a different manufacturer. Given the extraordinarily tight property line on the north elevation, the Commission may find that the aluminum storms are acceptable along that elevation only.

Both JeldWen options have a fixed upper sash. It is up to the Commission whether this is acceptable. The only difference is the jamb thickness that is mostly immaterial to the appearance from the exterior. If the Commission is comfortable with the fixed upper sash, both options are acceptable on the condition that the 3-1/2" bottom rail is used rather than the standard 2-5/16" height.

Kolbe is acceptable as proposed, with conditions below.

Marvin is acceptable as proposed, with conditions below.

Conclusion

All four window options are viable. Marvin and Kolbe need no alterations except for their screens. JeldWen is acceptable with a revision to include the 3-1/2" bottom rail. Staff recommends approval of any of the products for all of the rectangular window openings with the conditions below. A separate proposal is required for the arch top windows.

Recommendation Recommend HPC Approval

Conditions

1. Allow 5 years maximum
2. Low-E coating must comply with WHS/NPS standards: VLT of 72% or greater
3. Perimeter bars must dark and not mill finish (black, brass, bronze, etc. are acceptable)
4. JeldWen, if used, must be revised to use the 3-1/2" bottom rail option.
5. Need separate proposal for arch top windows
6. Require selection of one of the window proposals for consistent use throughout the property. All windows must match.
7. Wood storms
- 7A. Option to allow aluminum storms on north elevation.

Previous HPC action

171785. Retroactive replacement of windows was denied at April HPC. Notice of appeal rights was sent to the Florida address and no response was received.

Previous Council action