Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission
Staff Report

Living with History

HPC meeting date: 7/10/2017
Ald. Nik Kovac District: 3
Staff reviewer: Tim Askin
PTS #114305   CCF #170377

Property	3252 N. LAKE DR. North Lake Drive Estates Historic District

Owner/Applicant

RICHARD J BARRETT
3252 N LAKE DR
MILWAUKEE WI 53211

Mr. Timothy Benkowski
timothy j kitchen & bath, inc.
225 S 2nd St
Milwaukee, WI 53204
Phone: (414) 224-8552

Proposal

Construct new 3-car garage nearer to house than existing. Alter driveway to accommodate new garage, elminating most of the circle drive. Original garage will remain.

Staff comments

The property is the home of the Robert Uihlein Mansion designed by William Kozick in 1915. It is an extraordinarily elaborate and detailed example of Georgian Revival architecture.

For context, the lot is 120' wide x 755' deep. The house is 75'x65' and the existing garage is roughly 30' x 60'. The new garage will be 42'x29'. While staff would prefer to see the garage placed behind the carport, the proposed location is reasonable and meets the guidelines by not obstructing any views of the property and maintaining a reasonable distance that will not majorly affect the landscaping. The siting of the garage may be approved as-is.

The reconfiguration of the driveway would be a major alteration to the manicured landscape of the property. The proposal appears to suggest paving more than 50% of the island of grass and it would require the removal of a major tree. The proposal does not appear entirely necessary to allow parking in the garage. This should be denied as proposed with the option to resubmit for staff approval

The garage design is carefully thought through, but does need some modifications. The general concept and size of 42'x29' are acceptable.

The garage mimics the historic style too a little too closely. At minimum, a dated cornerstone should be incorporated to address this.

WINDOWS: All second floor windows seem out of proportion. The dormers are too small and the windows are more elaborate than those on the main house; they are therefore too elaborate for a secondary structure. The side windows are also much too large and should not enter the line created by the eave returns. Staff would recommend simply eliminating the dormers and second floor windows, as it does not appear to be intended as usable space in preference to redesigning the upper level windows. Lowering the roofline and eliminating the cupola should be considered, as again the height takes away the visual primacy that the house should have.

ROOFLINE: The roof pitch should be lowered slightly and the cupola and weathervane considered for complete elimination. While the weather vane appears to match the style and height of the existing garage, it should be shortened or considered for elimination. The cupola and weather vane add vertical emphasis. These combine to make the garage compete with the house for visual primacy.

Staff comments (cont.)   The single rear window is too large for the wall height leaves too much blank wall space. One or two more windows in a matching reduced size should be added or some indentation into the brickwork to give character.

Recommendation   Recommend HPC Approval with Conditions

Conditions   1. Eliminate or redesign dormers with simpler windows in a larger size. The upper side elevation windows should be reduced in size or eliminated.

2. Consider lowering the roofline and eliminating the cupola and weather vane.

3. A second or third window should be added to the rear for balance or indented panels added to the brickwork. These windows should be reduced in size from the size of the one proposed window. If the one proposed window is kept, it should be reduced in size.

4 Submit photos of material samples, doors, and shop drawings for windows to staff for approval.

5. Deny driveway reconfiguration and recommend resubmission of a different configuration that does not remove as much of the grass island for staff approval.

Previous HPC action

Previous Council action