



Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

Living with History

HPC meeting date: 7/15/2014
Ald. Robert Bauman District: 4
Staff reviewer: Paul Jakubovich
PTS #96047

Property 608 N. BROADWAY

Owner/Applicant DONALD S ARENSON
N78W14597 APPLETON AVE
MENOMONEE FALLS WI 53051
Mr. Donald Arenson
608 N Broadway
Milwaukee, WI 53202
Phone: (414) 704-3080

Proposal Install eight rectangular, hopper-style windows made of a substitute material in place of the original double-hung, round-top wood windows on the second and third stories of the front elevation facing N. Broadway.

Staff comments

The applicant previously proposed to replace four, third-story, double-hung original wood windows with rectangular, 3-part vinyl windows featuring a transom at the top and a double-hung window below. In that proposal the band of four wood windows on the second story would be replaced with all-wood replacement windows made to match the existing round-top windows. The proposal for the top story was rejected by HPC although the wood windows for the lower story were approved.

Now the applicant is requesting to instead replace both the second and third story windows--a total of eight--with vinyl, 3-part hopper windows. These are very similar looking from the exterior to the previously-proposed vinyl windows for the fourth floor, with the exception that the bottom sash is very short and opens into the building on pivots. The applicant has said that comments made by Commissioner Williams at the June HPC meeting led him to believe that this type of window would be acceptable. However a check with Commissioner Williams reveals that the three-part hopper is not what he was referring to. He felt a double hung window made to look like the original window could have a bottom sash that opened in on pivots like a hopper but would still look like a traditional double hung window with a rounded top from the exterior.

It should be noted that vinyl windows are not permitted in local historic districts per the city's guideline book Living With History which the Milwaukee Common Council has officially adopted as part of the formal guidelines for historic structures and districts. All of the recent window work in this historic district and locally-designed nearby structures has resulted in either the original wood windows being restored or new windows made of wood to match exactly the sizes and profiles of the original windows. Examples of this work are the Milwaukee Federal Building; the Iron Block building at Water and Wisconsin; the storefronts for Johnson Bank and the Marriott Hotel at the corner of Milwaukee and Wisconsin; and the Hilton Garden Hotel located at Broadway and Michigan directly across the street from the subject building. These projects involve a total of more than 800 wood windows.

Because the new proposal of the hopper window does not match the form of the original wood window and it is made of a material that is prohibited by guidelines, the proposal should not be accepted and instead the windows should be replaced with wood windows made to match the originals and the bottom sashes of the windows could be installed on pivots so they could open inward.

Recommendation

Recommend HPC Denial

Conditions**Previous HPC action****Previous Council action**