CITY OF MILWAUKEE

GRANT F. LANGLEY
City Attorney

RUDOLPH M. KONRAD PATRICK B. McDONNELL LINDA ULISS BURKE Deputy City Attorneys



OFFICE OF CITY ATTORNEY

800 CITY HALL 200 EAST WELLS STREET MILWAUKEE, WISCONSIN 53202-3551 TELEPHONE (414) 286-2601 TDD (414) 286-2025 FAX (414) 286-8550

October 1, 2003

BEVERLY A. TEMPLE THOMAS O. GARTNER BRUCE D. SCHRIMPF ROXANE L. CRAWFORD SUSAN D. BICKERT HAZEL MOSLEY HARRY A. STEIN THOMAS I REAMISH MAURITA F. HOUREN JOHN J. HEINEN MICHAEL G. TOBIN DAVID J. STANOSZ JAN A. SMOKOWICZ PATRICIA A. FRICKER HEIDI WICK SPOERL KURT A. BEHLING ELLEN H. TANGEN MELANIE R. SWANK JAY A. UNORA DONALD L. SCHRIEFER EDWARD M. EHRLICH LEONARD A. TOKUS MIRIAM R. HORWITZ MARYNELL REGAN SULLIVAN-CROWLEY DAWN M. BOLAND

Assistant City Attorneys

To the Honorable Common Council of the City of Milwaukee Room 205, City Hall 200 East Wells Street Milwaukee, WI 53202

Re:

CCFN 030760 (Resolution authorizing settlement and cancellation of the City of Milwaukee's subrogation claim against Debra Bett for payments made pursuant to the City's Basic Health Plan.)

Dear Council Members:

Enclosed please find a resolution authorizing the cancellation of a subrogation claim against Debra Bett.

Ms. Bett filed a personal injury lawsuit against Judith A. Sdoukos and her insurer, Allstate Insurance Company, for injuries suffered in an automobile collision. The City has a subrogation claim in this litigation with respect to medical payments on Ms. Bett's behalf under the City's Basic Health Plan, administered by Wisconsin Physicians Service Insurance Corporation (WPS).

The City has paid a total of \$4,839.82 in medical expenses under the Basic Health Plan in connection with Ms. Bett's medical treatment as a result of the accident. The extent of her injuries and their permanent nature are described in the enclosed correspondence from her counsel.

Under the doctrine set forth in *Rimes v. State Farm Mutual Automobile Insurance Company*, 106 Wis.2d 263, 316 N.W.2d 348 (1982), a health insurer can recover for payments made on behalf on an injured insured only if the insured has first been made whole (that is, completely compensated) for all damages involved in his or her claim. Given the scope of the damages asserted, the nature of the injuries involved, and the fact that Allstate Insurance has already tendered its full policy limits, it is questionable whether a court would find that Ms. Bett had been made whole by the settlement and that the City was entitled to any recovery. Under these circumstances, we recommend adoption of this resolution.

Very truly yours,

CRANT FAMILEY

City Attorney

ELLEN H. TANGEN Assistant City Attorney

Enclosures

cc: Michael Tobin (w/encl)

Mark Colbert, WPS (w/encl)

EHT: eht

1088-2002-359: 73009